



Eating Trumah

Towards the end of the ninth *perek*, we learn about how a woman's ability to eat *trumah* can change. The first case (9:5) deals with a *bat yisrael* who marries a *kohen*. By virtue of that marriage she is allowed to eat *trumah*. Even if her husband dies, provided she has a child from that marriage, she can continue to eat *trumah*. If she subsequently marries a *levi* she can no longer eat *trumah* but can eat *maaser*; this is even after her husband passes away provided she has had a child from him. The *Mishnah* continues that if she then marries and *yisrael* she is treated as she was originally – a *bat yisrael*. The *Mishnah* continues that after her third husband passes away, she is still treated like a *bat yisrael* if she had a son from that marriage. If the sons then progressively pass away in reverse order, then after each one she returns to the status of the most recent son that is alive, until finally she returns to being a *bat yisrael*.

The second *Mishnah* (9:6) follows a similar pattern however involves a *bat kohen* that married a *yisrael*, then *levi* and then finally a *kohen* bearing a child from each marriage. Once again, her status with respect to whether she can eat *trumah* appear to follow the pattern that it is equivalent to either her husband or the most recent child that is still alive. If all husbands and children pass away then she returns to being a *bat kohen* and can eat *trumah*.

The *Aruch La'Ner* poses the following questions. In both cases at one point she is left widowed from a *kohen*, *levi* and *yisrael* with sons from each marriage. Why is it that in the first case she is not allowed to have *trumah* while in the second case she can?

The *Aruch La'Ner* initially answers that in the first case she was a *bat yisrael*. Once widowed, her capacity to eat *trumah* rested with her sons. However why should one son take preference over another? Consequently she returns to her original status. In the second case, she was a *bat kohen* and could originally eat *trumah*. The only thing that prevents here from doing so would be her son from the

yisrael; yet why should one son take priority over the other?

The second answer that the *Aruch La'Ner* suggests is as follows. In the first cases, since the final husband caused her to cease from eating *trumah*, the son from that marriage maintains that status. In the second case, since the final husband enabled her to eat *trumah*, the son from that marriage enables her to continue doing so. In other words, according to this understanding, her final status is important as opposed to her original status.

The *Aruch La'Ner* provides two practical differences between these two understandings. The first is if in the second case she was originally a *bat kohen*. According to the first understand she would be able to eat *trumah* as she returns to original status. According to the second, since the youngest of her three (live) children was from an *yisrael* she may not. The second example would be if in the first case involved a *bat yisrael*. According to the first understand she would not be able to eat *trumah* as she returns to original status. According to the second, since the youngest of her three (live) children was from a *kohen* she would.

The *Aruch La'Ner* understands that the *Rambam* (*Trumot* 6:19) maintains the second understanding. The case brought is of a *bat yisrael* that marries a *yisrael*, has a son, is widowed, then marries a *kohen*, has a son and is widowed once again. The *Rambam* rules that she is allowed to eat *trumah* since the last son enables her to eat just like his father did.¹

The *Aruch La'Ner* is unsure of where the *Rambam* learns with certainty that the second understanding is correct. He suggests that perhaps it is because the *pasuk* teaches that "if she has no [offspring] she may return to her father's house." According to the first explanation, even if a *bat kohen* has a child from an *yisrael* as long as she also has a child from a *kohen* she may return to her father's house.

Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier

¹ It is noted in the *Yalkut Bi'urim* (*Metivta*) that *Radvaz* understands the *Rambam* differently than the *Aruch La'Ner*. We had explained that in presence of the three sons, her final status was important. If her last son was a *kohen* she can continue eating

trumah while if it was a *yisrael* she cannot start. The *Radvaz* however understand the last son is important as the son takes the place of his father and it is as if the father is still alive. Just as the later marriage overrides those previous, so too does that later son.

Revision Questions

במות ט': ד' י"א: ב'

- Which of the following can eat *trumah* and which can eat *ma'aser*: (ט': ט')
 - *Bat Yisrael* engaged to a *Kohen*?
 - *Bat Yisrael* engaged to a *Levi*?
 - *Bat Levi* engaged to a *Kohen*?
- If a *bat Yisrael* marries a *Kohen*, has a child and then her husband dies, can she eat *trumah*? (ט': ט')
- If she then marries a *Levi*, has a child and then her husband dies, can she eat *trumah*? Can she eat *ma'aser*? (ט': ט')
- If she then marries an *Yisrael*, can she eat *trumah*? Can she eat *ma'aser*? (ט': ט')
- Regarding the previous question, when would she once again be able to eat *trumah*? (ט': ט')
- Describe two scenarios through which a *bat Kohen* who marries a *Yisrael*, would once again be able to eat *trumah*. (ט': ט')
- What is the law regarding a woman that remarries after receiving news that her husband died overseas, but then discovers her original husband is still alive? (י"א: י')
- Regarding the previous question, which brothers perform *chalitzah* if both "husbands" then die? (י"א: י')
- What is the difference if the women mistakenly remarried with or without the "instruction" of the *beit din*? (י"ב: י')
- What is the law if a woman remarries after hearing that her husband died, and then hears that her husband was alive but recently did indeed die? (י"ג: י')
- What is the law regarding a case where a man's wife was overseas and witnesses came and told him that she had died. Then, based on that testimony, he goes and marries his "late"-wife's sister. Then it is discovered that his original wife is still alive? (י"ד: י')
- What is the case described in the *Mishnah* where the conclusion is: (י"ה: י')
 "מותר בראשונה, שלישית, ובחמישי... ואסור בשניה וברביעית..."
- What does the *Mishnah* mean when it says: (י"ו: י')
 "בן תשע ויום אחד, הוא פסל ע"י אחין והאחים פוסלין ע"י"
- Regarding the previous question, is there a difference between the *ben tesha* and the brother in regards to when that principle applies? (י"ז: י')
- What is the law if a *ben tesha*:
 - Performed *yibum* then one of the brothers also did? (י"ז: י')
 - Performed *yibum* and then performed *yibum* on the *tzarah*? (י"ח: י')
 - Performed *yibum* and then died? (י"ח: י')
 - Got married and then died? (י"ח: י')
 - Performed *yibum*, and then when he grew up, married another, then died (without any children)? (י"ט: י')
- Is one allowed to marry the relative of his *anusa*? (י"א: א')
- Can one marry *anusat aviv*? (י"א: א')
- Do two brothers, one of whom was in its mother's stomach when she converted and the other was conceived and born after the mother converted, perform *yibum* or *chalitzah*? (י"א: ב')

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday
 10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
 Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat
 10 minutes before *Mincha*
Beit Ha'Roeh
 Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel
Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday
 Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
 9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
 Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rav Meir Pogrow
613.org/mishnah.html

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendar/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR
ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
 In US dial: 718 906 6400
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

| Sunday | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday | Friday | שבת קודש |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| 10 th June כ' סיון | 11 th June כ"א סיון | 12 th June כ"ב סיון | 13 th June כ"ג סיון | 14 th June כ"ד סיון | 15 th June כ"ה סיון | 16 th June כ"ו סיון |
| Yevamot 11:3-4 | Yevamot 11:5-6 | Yevamot 11:7-12:1 | Yevamot 12:2-3 | Yevamot 12:4-5 | Yevamot 12:6-13:1 | Yevamot 13:2-3 |

