



Volume 8. Issue 5

Carrying Tiny Amounts

The *Mishnah* learnt two weeks ago started a topic that dominated most of our learning this week. The *Mishnah* there (7:3) taught:

Whatever is proper to store away (i.e. can be stored) and is of such a quantity that one would keep stored and a person takes it out on *Shabbat* he is obligated to bring a *chatat* offering. But whatever it is not proper to keep stored away and not of a quantity that anyone would store, and a person takes it out on *Shabbat*, only the person who stores any of it is culpable.

We learnt from the *Mishnah* that one is only obligated to bring a *korban chatat* if they (inadvertently) carried a *shiur* (measure) of the item that people in general would store away. The exception is that if person would store even a smaller measure of that product, he alone would be *chayav*. The *Mishnah* then continues to list various items and their minimum *shiur* that one would keep.

It is surprising therefore that the *Mishnah*, towards the end of the week (10:1) teaches the following:

If someone would store away as a seed or a sample (for sales) or for medicinal purposes, and he took it out on *Shabbat*, he would be obligated [to bring a *chatat*] even for the smallest amount (*kol shehu*); but any other person is *chayav* [only] for the general *shiur*.

The question, as pointed out by the *Tosfot* (*Shabbat* 90b) is that this *Mishnah* seems to be superfluous. It appears to only be restating, by means of example, the principle in the above quoted, earlier *Mishnah*. What more do we learn from this *Mishnah*?

The *Tosfot Yom Tov* explains that this is not really a question; it is the way of the *Mishnah* to right in brief in one place what it writes in detail in another. He cites the *Tosfot* elsewhere who solve a similar difficulty in this way.

The *Sefat Emet* however provides a number of reasons why our *Mishnah* is needed. Firstly he answers that the

Rambam learns that when the *Mishnah* states that “of such a quantity that one would keep store up” it means that if people would not store a particular item because it is readily available or because of its low value in that location then they would not be *chayav* even if it is of a *shiur* greater than those listed in the *Mishnayot*. Consequently, even though the *Mishnah* states “only a person who stores any of it is culpable” we do not yet know that this applies to a *shiur* less than those stated explicitly. Our *Mishnah* is therefore needed to teach that if someone would store even a *kol shehu* and carried it out on *Shabbat* they would be *chayav*.

The *Sefat Emet* offers another answer. He explains that we must remember that our *Mishnah* also teaches that if one set aside an item for medicinal purposes (for which it is not normally used) then they would be *chayav*, yet another person, as already stated, would not. Were it not for this *Mishnah* we might have thought that anyone else would also be *chayav* for this small amount as well. The only reason why the other person is not keeping this small amount is because he is healthy and does not require any medication. Consequently, the fact that the first person sets that particular item aside for medicine should be significant for another person if he took it out. The *Mishnah* therefore teaches that any variation for a normal use is only significant for the person who keeps it for that purpose.

The *Pnei Yehoshua* explains in a similar manner that from the earlier *Mishnah*, one might have thought that one’s variation from the norm does not affect another only for items that are never stored at less than the *shiur* stated in the *Mishnayot*. For thing that might, e.g. for medicine or samples, then one’s setting aside the item can obligate another person who carries it on *Shabbat*. The *Mishnah* therefore teaches that an individual’s storing an item of less than the minimum *shiur* never affects another.

Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier

Revision Questions

שבת ח' – ב' – י' א'

- What is the minimum measurement for:
 - Rope?
 - Paper? (ח': ב')
 - *Klaf*?
 - Ink? (ח': ג')
 - Glue?
 - Wax? (ח': ד')
 - Reed? (ח': ה')
 - Bone?
 - Glass? (ח': ו')
- Which opinion is the most strict regarding the minimum measurement for pottery? (ח': ז')
- *Tumat niddah* is transferred through carrying (*masah*) – which other form of *tum'ah* can be transferred in such a manner? (ט': א')
- What *pasuk* is the law in the previous question learnt from? (ט': א')
- Can a boat become *tameh*? (ט': ב')
- From where do we learn that one may wash a child on the third day after the *brit millah*, even if it is *Shabbat*? (ט': ג')
- From where do we learn that a red thread is tied to the *se'ir ha'mishtaleach* on *Yom Kippur*? (ט': ג')
- To what is the act of anointing on *Yom Kippur* compared? (ט': ד')
- What is the minimum measure that one is liable for carrying, when carrying:
 - Wood?
 - Spices? (ט': ה')
 - Pepper?
 - Worn-out books? (ט': ו')
- Explain the debate regarding how many *chata'ot* one must bring if they carried a sampler box containing many different spices. (ט': ו')
- What is the minimum measure that one is liable for carrying when carrying pumpkin seeds? (ט': ז')
- Explain the debate regarding the minimum measure of a dead non-kosher grass-hopper. (ט': ז')
- Read the first *Mishnah* in the tenth *perek* – in which previous *Mishnah* was this principle learnt? (י' א')

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

After *Ma'ariv*

Mizrachi Shul

Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*

Beit Ha'Roeh

Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf

9:00am

Kollel Magen Avraham

Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown

www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rav Meir Pogrow

613.org/mishnah.html

Rabbi E. Kornfeld

Rabbi C. Brown

<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR

ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss

In US dial: 718 906 6400

Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

| Sunday | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday | Friday | שבת קודש |
|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| 26 th June כ"ד סיון | 27 th June כ"ה סיון | 28 th June כ"ו סיון | 29 th June כ"ז סיון | 30 th June כ"ח סיון | 1 st July כ"ט סיון | 2 nd July ל' סיון |
| Shabbat 10:2-3 | Shabbat 10:4-5 | Shabbat 10:6-11:1 | Shabbat 11:2-3 | Shabbat 11:4-5 | Shabbat 11:6-12:1 | Shabbat 12:2-3 |

