



Tashlumin for Chagigah

On the three *regalim* – *Pesach*, *Shavuot* and *Sukkot* – one is obligated to bring an *olat re'iya* and a *shalmei chagiga*. The *Mishnah* (1:6) teaches that if one does not offer the *korbanot* on the first day, he has the remaining days of the festival to offer these *korbanot*. We shall investigate this law, which is referred to as *tashlumin*.

When the *Gemara* questions the meaning of *tashlumin* it cites two opinions. *R' Yochanan* maintains that the remaining days act to replace the first day while *R' Oshaya* explains that each day compensate for another. In other words, according to *R' Yochanan* the root obligation is to offer these *korbanot* on the first day. The remaining days are however available to fulfil that original obligation if it was not satisfied. *R' Oshaya* however maintains that each day carries its own independent obligation provided that the obligation was not fulfilled on the previous days.

Demanding a practical difference between these views, the *Gemara* continues explaining that the case where one was lame on the first day of the festival but was then cured on the second, would be the subject of debate. To explain, a person who is lame is exempt from bringing these sacrifices since he is exempt from *re'iya* (1:1). According to *R' Yochanan*, since the person was not obligated on the first day, so would be the case on second. The obligation is only for the first day and the person was exempt on that day. *R' Oshaya* however would argue, not being fit on the first day does not affect the fact that the person is fit on the second as each day carries its only obligation.

The *Tosfot* however have a doubt regarding one that was healthy on the first day, did not offer his *korbanot* and then was lame on the second. Since he was obligated on the first day, does that obligation continue? Or since

according to *R' Oshaya* each day has its own obligation, do we say that he is now exempt? One should note that the *Tosfot* raises the case regarding the opinion of *R' Oshaya* when it could have equally been raised regarding the opinion of *R' Yochanan*.

The *Bach* modifies the text of the *Tosfot* so that the question is raised in connection with the opinion of *R' Yochanan*. Since he maintains that the remaining days are a *tashlumin* for the first since and he was indeed obligated on the first day, can he bring the *korbanot* on the second day even though he is lame (and would be exempt had he been so on the first)? With respect to the opinion of *R' Oshaya*, it is clear that since each day is dealt with independently, if he is lame on the second, he is exempt on the second.

The *Sefat Emet* however explains that the *Tosfot's* question is indeed according to *R' Oshaya*. According to *R' Yochanan* it is obvious that since at the time of obligation he was indeed obligated, he must bring the *korbanot* now regardless of his current physical state. According to the *R' Oshaya*, despite each day carrying an obligation, the question is whether he would agree that they are also a *tashlumin* for the first day, and since he was obligated then he must bring it now.

The *Sefat Emet* adds that the *Maharsha* understands that the doubt of the *Tosfot* was regarding both opinions. Even according to *R' Yochanan* since he is not fit were it the first day, does the obligation from the first day still apply? The advantage this explanation is that this case does not present a practical difference between the opinions. It would then explain why the *Gemara* does not list this case as another practical difference.¹

Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier

¹ It would also explain why the *Tosfot* had a doubt at all. If one opinion was obvious and the other a question then the *Gemara's* omitting this case as a practical difference should have clarified the doubt.

Revision Questions

חגיגה א': ד' ג': בי'

- Can an *Yisrael* fulfil his obligation of bringing *shalmei Simcha* by bringing *ma'aser behema*? (א': ד')
 - Can a *Kohen* fulfil his obligation of bringing *shalmei Simcha* by consuming the meat from an offered *chataf*? (א': ד')
 - What are the four different groupings that determine the required value of the *korban Re'iyah* and the *shalmei Chagigah*? (א': ה')
 - If someone did not bring the *korban Re'iyah* during the festival can he bring it at a later date? (א': ו')
 - What are the additional two opinions about who the following *pasuk* refers to: (א': ז')
- "מעט לא יוכל לתקן, וחסרון לא יוכל להמנות"
- Which *halachot* are described as: "הררים התלויין בשערה"? (א': ח')
 - What topic should only be taught one-to-one? (א': ט')
 - A person who inquires into which four things is described as: "ראוי לו כאלו לא בא"? (א': י')
 - Who else is described in such a manner? (א': יא')
 - With regards to which process in the offering of a *korban* on *Yom Tov* did five groups of *Tana'im* debate? (א': יב')
 - Which personal *korban* did *Beit Shammai* argue cannot be brought on *Yom Tov*? (א': יג')
 - What was different about the way *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* allowed a *korban Shlamim* do be brought on *Yom Tov*? (א': יד')
 - In what situation do *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* agree that the *korban Re'iyah* is not offered on *Yom Tov*? (א': יה')
 - Regarding the previous question, what does the *kohen gadol* do on this day to demonstrate that the *korban* is not offered? (א': יו')
 - For what five things must one wash their hands prior to eating? (א': יז')
 - What requires more than hand washing prior to eating? (א': יח')
 - What are the five levels of "kedushah" described in the *Mishnah* and why are they important? (א': יט')
 - In what manner are the clothes of *ochlei trumah tameh* for *ochlei kodesh*? (א': כ')
 - What are the three sections of a utensil that applies for *trumah* but not for *kodesh*? (א': כא')
 - What is different about they way one purifies a utensil for use in *trumah* as apposed to use for *kodesh*? (א': כב')
 - If a utensil was made and its purity preserved, in what situation does it nevertheless require immersing in a *mikvah*? (א': כג')
 - What is the furthest degree of *tum'ah* that can affect *trumah* and *kodesh*? (eg, *sheni, shlishi*, etc.) (א': כד')
 - In what case can only one hand become *tameh*? (א': כה')

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
 Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Beit Ha'Roeh
 Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
 9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
 Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rav Meir Pogrow
613.org/mishnah.html

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
 Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
 In US dial: 718 906 6400
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
29 th April ז' אייר	30 th April ח' אייר	1 st May ט' אייר	2 nd May י' אייר	3 rd May יא' אייר	4 th May יב' אייר	5 th May יג' אייר
Chagigah 3:3-4	Chagigah 3:5-6	Chagigah 3:7-8	Yevamot 1:1-2	Yevamot 1:3-4	Yevamot 2:1-2	Yevamot 2:3-4

