



Volume 8. Issue 44

When do you celebrate Purim?

The *Mishnah* (1:1) teaches that the day that people read *megillah* depended on where they lived. Those that lived in cities that were walled in the time of *Yehoshua* (*bnei krachim*) read the *megillah* on the fifteenth; other large city dwellers read the *megillah* on the fourteenth (*bnei ayarot*), while those that lived in the small villages¹ (*bnei kefarim*) were allowed to read the *megillah* earlier on the Monday or Thursday prior to *Purim*. To explain, *Ezra*² instituted that the *Beit Din* was in session and that the *Torah* was read on these two weekdays. The *Rishonim* explain that those that lived in the villages were not versed in reading the *megillah*. The *Chachamim* were therefore lenient in allowing them to read on the days that they would come to the cities for *dinim* (*Rashi*) or to hear the *Torah* reading (*R' Chananel*) thereby relieving them from returning on *Purim*. The *Gemara* explains that the *bnei kefarim* were allowed to read earlier as they would otherwise be too busy to supply the large city with provisions for *Purim*.

The *Ritva* raises a number of questions on this leniency for the *kefarim*. Normally we say that our religion should not be practice *agudot agudot* – pockets of people each practicing the laws differently. How then can it be that the *bnei ayarot* and the *bnei kfarim* were allowed to read on different days? When it comes to the *bnei krachim* that read on the fifteenth it is not a problem, as that is a case of a separate city. However the *bnei kefarim* would read in the same city as the *bnei ayarot*?

The *Ritva* cites a number of answers. The *Raavad* understood that the *bnei kefarim* would read in their village when they would all return together from the city. Consequently the different practices were kept in different cities. The *Tosfot* however explains that the only issue of *agudot agudot* is where each group claims that there is only

one correct practice and they should all be doing the same thing. That is not the case here where the different days for reading depending on one's residence, was established from the outset.

The *Ritva* however is not happy with this answer. The *Gemara* in *Yevamot* (13b) asks this question with regards to the *bnei kerachim* and the *bnei ayarot* and the *Tosfot*'s answer was not raised in the lengthy discussion there. (The final answer is as mentioned above; there is no issue when dealing with separate cities.)

The *Ritva* therefore answers that the issue of *agudot agudot* is when that a law is permitted to one while prohibited to another. When it comes to the *bnei krachim* it is not that they must read earlier; they can read on the fourteenth if they like. Reading earlier is a leniency granted to them, which they choose to adopt. Since this leniency is known to all there is no issue of *agudot agudot*.

Another question raised is that if the *bnei kefarim* came to the city to hear *megilah*, how could the city folk read for them? They were not obligated to read the *megillah* on that day and only those that are obligated in a *mitzvah* could perform it for another! The *R' Akiva Eiger* suggests that a person from the city would read word by word with a *ben kfar* who would repeat it aloud after each word.

The *Ritva* offer two answers. The first is that since the *takana* was instituted such that a *ben ir* would read for a *ben kfar* it was considered as if they were obligated. The second answer is that even a *ben ir* could share the same law as a *ben kfar* if the city did not have ten *batlanim* (1:3). Consequently the former can read for the later. This would not be the case for a *ben krach* and a *ben ir*.

Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier

¹ The *Ritva* cites the *Tosfot* who ask that the later *Mishnah* teaches that even large cities would be considered like *kefarim* if they did not have ten *batlanim* – ten people paid to ensure there is a *minyan* (*Rashi*). What is guaranteed that every city that did not have ten *batlanim* did not have a *beit din*? The *Ritva* answers that the later *Mishnah* is different and simply adds that this leniency also applies to large cities, not that they travel, but that they can read *megillah* early.

² *Ezra* was later than the times of the *megillah* so how is it that the *Anshei Knesset ha'Gedolah* established that it would be read on days that *Ezra* would in the future institute? The *Ritva* answers that *Anshei Knesset Ha'Gedolah* instituted the leniency that it could be read one or two days earlier for the reason mentioned in the *Gemara* above. After the *takana* of *Ezra*, those two days were established.

Revision Questions

טענית ג':ח' ד':ח'

- What is the incident involving *Choni HaMe'agel*? (ג' ח:)
 - Does everyone continue fasting if rain fell during the fast day? (ג' ט:)
 - Which are the three times when the *kohanim* do *birkat kohanim* (up to) four times during the day? (ג' נ: ת')
 - Why do we have the *ma'amadot*? (ד' ב:)
 - What would the *Anshei ma'amad* do? (ד' ב: ת')
 - What days of the week would the *Anshei ma'amad* fast? (ד' ג:)
 - When would there be no *ma'amad*: (ד' ת:)
 - *Shacharit*?
 - *Ne'ilah*?
 - *Mincha*?
 - How many dates were fixed for the *korban eitzim*? (ד' ח:)
 - What were the five things that occurred on the seventeenth of *Tamuz*? (ו' ז: ד')
 - What were the five things that occurred on the ninth of *Av*? (ו' ז: ד')
 - What two things are prohibited the week of *Tisha B'Av*? (ז' ז: ד')
 - What is one prohibited from eating on the day before *Tisha B'Av*? (ז' ז: ד')
 - On which two dates had events occurred that were the greatest for *Am Yisrael*? (What occurred on these dates?) (ד' ח: ז: ד')
 - Explain what occurred on *Tu B'Av*. (ד' ח: ז:)

מגילה א': א' ד'

- On which dates during *Adar* is it possible for the *megillah* to be read? (ו'נ: ו'נ)
 - Explain how it is possible for the *megillah* to be read on different days. (א'ב: א'ב)
 - What is the definition of a “big city” and why is this important? (ג'ג: ג'ג)
 - Which four events are delayed if they coincide with *Shabbat*? (א'ג: א'ג)
 - What is different about a day on which the *megillah* is read early and *Purim*? (א'ג: א'ג)
 - What is the law if they read the *megillah* during *Adar* and then the year was turned into a leap year – do they read the *megillah* again in *Adar Sheni*? (ו'ת: ו'נ)
 - What is the difference between *Adar Rishon* and *Adar Sheni*? (ו'ת: א'ג)

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Beit Ha'Roeh
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rav Meir Pogrow
613.org/mishnah.html

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown*

**SHIUR
ON KOL HALOSHON**

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 - 2 - 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קידוש
25 th March ב' ניסן	26 th March ג' ניסן	27 th March ד' ניסן	28 th March ה' ניסן	29 th March ו' ניסן	30 th March ז' אדר	31 st March ח' ניסן
Megillah 1:5-6	Megillah 1:7-8	Megillah 1:9-10	Megillah 1:11-2:1	Megillah 2:2-3	Megillah 2:4-5	Megillah 2:6-3:1

