



## A Bent Shofar on Rosh Hashanah

The *Mishnah* discusses the ideal *shofar* for *Rosh Hashanah*. The first opinion is that it should be the straight horn from a *yael* (wild goat) (3:3). *R' Yehuda* however argues that it should be a bent ram's horn (3:5). Since the *Mishnah* earlier (3:2) stated that any *shofar* may be used (with the exclusion of a bull's horn) presumably the debate regarding the type of horn for *Rosh Hashanah* is referring only to ideal circumstances; given a choice.

The following *Rambam* is therefore surprising (*Shofar* 1:1): "The *Shofar* that is blown on *Rosh Hashanah* and *Yovel* is the ram's horn that is bent..." The *Magid Mishneh* explains that the *Rambam* is siding with some of the commentators (explaining the position of *R' Levi*, *Rosh Hashanah* 26b) that on *Rosh Hashanah* only a bent *shofar* can be used. Indeed the *Raavad* argues that the requirement of a bent *shofar* is only for an added *mitzvah*, yet one would still fulfill the *mitzvah* of *shofar* if a straight *shofar* was used. We shall try to understand the position of the *Rambam*.

Let us first return the debate in our *Mishnah*. The *Gemara* explains that *R' Yehuda*, who requires a bent *shofar*, maintains that it is better that one bends one's thoughts and is humble before *Hashem*. *Rashi* explains that in one's *tefillah* his eyes are turned down, based on the *pasuk* "My eyes and heart will always be there" (*Melachim* I 9:3). The *Tana Kama* however argues that straightness in thought is preferred. *Rashi* explains that this position is based on the *pasuk*, "We will lift our hearts to our hands..." (*Eicha* 3:41) and so on *Rosh Hashanah* a straight *shofar* should be use "for it is *tefillah*". Clear?

*Rav Soloveitchik* (*Harerei Kedeim* 7) explains that the *pesukim* cited by *Rashi* are those used in the debate

regarding the direction that one's eyes should be turned during prayer (*Yevamot* 105b). The first *pasuk* used to support the position that one should look downward, while the later supporting the position that one should look up. Consequently *Rashi* understands that the debate here is tied to the debate there. Put simply, *shofar* is considered like prayer.

With this in mind *Rav Soloveitchik* continues to explain that the *Rambam*, who maintains that a bent *shofar* must be used on *Rosh Hashanah*, does not view the aspect of prayer in *shofar* as a simple adage or *hiddur*. Rather prayer is the *mitzvah* of *shofar*. Putting it together, if one's eyes must be turned downward during prayer, then one must use a bent *shofar* on *Rosh Hashanah*.

The *Rav* raises an issue with this understanding. The *Gemara* (28a) explains that if one blows a *shofar* for musical reasons, he still fulfills the *mitzvah* of *shofar* because the fulfillment of *mitzvot* do not require *kavana* (intent). The *Rav* however adds that the exception to this rule is prayer, where one minimally requires *kavana* that he is praying. If *shofar* is equated with *tefillah* then one should not have fulfilled his obligation of *shofar* if he played it for music.

The *Rav* answers by differentiating between the person blowing the *shofar* and the *shofar* itself. The *shofar* itself must be fit for prayer. The fulfillment of prayer however does not prevent the *mitzvah* of *shofar*. He explains that we find something similar with respect to *lulav*. While a *lulav* must be large enough for shaking, holding but neglecting to shake the four species does not prevent the fulfillment of the *mitzvah*.

*Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier*

### Revision Questions

ראש השנה ב' ט' ד' ה'

- Describe the event that occurred following *R' Yehoshua's* dispute of the ruling of *Rabban Gamliel* to sanctify the month based on apparently questionable testimony. (ב' ט')
- What is the law if the entire nation saw the new moon, yet *Beit Din* did not have enough time to say "*mekudash*" before nightfall? (א' ג')
- How would *Beit Din* proceed if they alone saw the new moon? (א' ג')
- What qualifies as a *shofar*? (ב' ג')
- Describe the ideal *shofar*. (ג' ג')
- Explain how the *shofar* would coordinate with the *chatzotzrot* in the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* on *Rosh Hashanah*. (ג' ג')
- Explain how the *shofar* would coordinate with the *chatzotzrot* in the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* on a *ta'anit*. (ג' ד')
- In what respects was the *tekiyot* on *yovel* similar to those on *Rosh Hashanah*? (ג' ה')
- Can a *shofar* that cracked and was glued together be used? (ג' ו')
- If a *shofar* had a hole in it and was filled in, may it be used? (ג' ו')
- Can someone fulfil their obligation by hearing the echo produced from a *shofar*? (ג' ז')
- If someone walked past a *shul* and heard the sound of the *shofar* has he fulfilled his obligation? (ג' ז')
- How does the *Mishnah* explain the following *pasuk*: (ג' ח')  
 "והיה כאשר ירים משה ידו וגבר ישראל..." (שמות י"ז: י"א)
- Which other *pasuk* does the *Mishnah* explain in a similar manner? (ג' ח')
- When was the *mitzvah* of *shofar* different inside and outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? (א' י')
- What decree did *R' Yochanan ben Zakkai* enact after the destruction of the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? (Include both opinions.) (א' י')
- What was the difference between *Yavneh* and the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* with respect to the *halachot* of *shofar*? (ב' י')
- What other *mitzvah* also has distinct laws between the inside and outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* like *shofar*? (ג' י')
- What decree did *R' Yochanan ben Zakkai* enact after the destruction of the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* with respect to *Kiddush HaChodesh*? (ד' י')
- List the two opinions regarding the order of the *brachot* of *mussaf* on *Rosh Hashanah* and the location of the *tekiyot*. (ד' ה')

### Local Shiurim

#### Melbourne, Australia

##### Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*  
 Mizrachi Shul  
 Melbourne, Australia

##### Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*  
 Beit Ha'Roeh  
 Melbourne, Australia

#### Efrat, Israel

*Shiur in English*

##### Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf  
 9:00am  
 Kollel Magen Avraham  
 Reemon Neighbourhood

#### ONLINE SHIURIM

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
[www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/](http://www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/)

*Rav Meir Pogrow*  
[613.org/mishnah.html](http://613.org/mishnah.html)

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

#### SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
 In US dial: 718 906 6400  
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

### Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
4 <sup>th</sup> March י' אדר	5 <sup>th</sup> March י"א אדר	6 <sup>th</sup> March י"ב אדר	7 <sup>th</sup> March י"ג שבט	8 <sup>th</sup> March י"ד שבט	9 <sup>th</sup> March ט"ו אדר	10 <sup>th</sup> March ט"ז אדר
Rosh Hashanah 4:6-7	Rosh Hashanah 4:8-9	Taanit 1:1-2	Taanit 1:3-4	Taanit 1:5-6	Taanit 1:7-2:1	Taanit 2:2-3

