



Volume 8. Issue 35

Lulav on Shabbat

The fourth *perek* lists the *mitzvot* performed during *sukkot* including the number of days that the *mitzvah* applies. The first of these is the *mitzvah* of *lulav*; or more accurately the *mitzvah* of *arbaat haminim* (four species). According to Torah law, the *mitzvah* of *lulav* is to be performed in the *Beit HaMikdash* for the seven days of *Sukkot* (excluding *Shimini Atzeret*). Outside the *Beit Hamikdash* the *mitzvah* to shake *lulav* was only for the first day. The *Mishnah* however teaches that it is possible that the *mitzvah* would apply in the *Beit HaMikdash* for either six or seven days of *sukkot* depending on the year. If the first day of *sukkot* was *Shabbat*, then the *mitzvah* was performed for seven days. If however the first day was not *Shabbat*, meaning that *Shabbat* was on one of the remaining days of *Sukkot*, then the *mitzvah* was performed for six days with it not being shaken on *Shabbat*. What is the difference?

The *Gemara* (*Sukkah* 42b) explains that the *Chachamim* made a *gezeira* to refrain from performing the *mitzvah* on *Shabbat*. This was out of concern that one might carry the *lulav* to an expert when seeking guidance in performing the *mitzvah* and thereby desecrate *Shabbat* having carried in the public domain. If so, why then was the *mitzvah* performed on *Shabbat* if it coincided with the first day of *Sukkot*? The *Gemara* explains that since on the first day it is a *mitzvah* to take the *lulav* even outside the *Beit HaMikdash* the *Chachamim* did not extend the *gezeira* to that day. *Rashi* elaborates that since the first day was a *mitzvah* everywhere, it carries a greater importance.

What about today? Why do we not shake *lulav* if the first day of *sukkot* falls on *Shabbat*? The *Bartenura* explains that since we are not experts in establishing *Rosh Chodesh* it is possible that it is not the first day of *Sukkot* that coincided with *Shabbat*. His explanation uses the wording of the *Gemara*.

The *Tosfot Yom Tov* however directs us to an earlier *Mishnah* (3:7) that discusses various blemishes that would invalidate an *etrog*. There the *Bartenura* explains that these *pesulim* apply only to the first day and that the second day of *Yom Tov* shares the same status as the remaining days of *Sukkot*. This implies that we are indeed experts in

establishing *Rosh Chodesh*. The *Tosfot Yom Tov* stresses that the *Gemara* was referring to the times of the *Beit HaMikdash* and that even though those people outside Israel may have known how to calculate *Rosh Chodesh*, since they had to rely on it being fixed in *Eretz Yisrael*, they were considered as if they did not know. Such an explanation however does not help the *Bartenura* due to what appears to be an inconsistency between his explanation here and his ruling regarding *etrog* stated above.¹ What then is our status nowadays with respect to establishing *Rosh Chodesh*?

The *Tosfot Yom Tov* suggest that explanation of the *Rambam* should solve our difficulty whose ruling the *Bartenura* shares in the above two cases. For a period of time after the destruction, the *Rosh Chodesh* was still established through witness testimony received by *Beit Din*. Many who lived far away had no way of knowing when *Rosh Chodesh* was so they could never be certain if the first day of *sukkah* was *Shabbat*. They therefore decreed at that time that everyone, both inside and outside of Israel would not take the *lulav* if the first day fell on *Shabbat* “so that there would not be two *Torahs*”. Even though later *Rosh Chodesh* was determined via calculation, nevertheless the status quo was maintained. With respect to *pesulim* of *etrog* however, *Bnei Eretz Yisrael* were always different from *Bnei Chutz La'aretz*. Consequently since *Rosh Chodesh* can be calculated, the *pesulim* only apply on the first day.

What about second day *Yom Tov*? Considering the above reasoning, one might ask why we have two days of *Yom Tov* outside Israel now? The *Tosfot Yom Tov* flatly rejects such a question. He directs us to *Gemara Beitza* (4b) where the message was sent from *Eretz Yisrael* to *Bavel*: “Be careful with the custom of fathers in your hands, someday government may decree [against learning *Torah*] and you will err [in calculating *Rosh Chodesh* and possibly eat *chametz* on *Pesach*].” The two-day *Yom Tov* was therefore maintained based on this plea. Since the *pesul* of *etrog* however only applies on *sukkot* and is not dependent on the *kedusha* of the day, it is not covered by this *gezeira* and according to the *Bartenura*, both those living inside Israel and abroad share the same law.

Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier

¹ The *Rosh* however rules that these *pesulim* also apply on the second day of *Yom Tov*. The *Tosfot Yom Tov* suggests that the *Rashi* and *Tosfot* may hold like the *Rosh*.

Revision Questions

סוכה גי: טי' ד': ז'

- What are the two opinions regarding when the *lulav* is shaken during *Hallel*? (גי: טי')
- When, during the day, can one fulfil the *mitzvah* of *lulav*? (טי: גי')
- If someone is unable to read *hallel* and gets someone to read for them, how should they respond? (י: גי')
- What must one be careful of when purchasing the four species during a *shmittah* year? (גי: י"א)
- Initially, during which days of *Sukkot* was the *lulav* taken outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* and when did this change? (גי: י"ב)
- Can one fulfil the *mitzvah* of *lulav* with a borrowed *lulav*? (גי: י"ג)
- Would one be required to bring a *korban* if they carried their *lulav* in the public domain on the first day of *Sukkot* that coincided with *Shabbat* and why? (גי: י"ד)
- Can one return the *lulav* to water on *Shabbat*? (גי: ט"ו)
- What difference does *R' Yehuda* place between *Shabbat* and *Yom Tov* regarding the previous question? (גי: ט"ו)
- How many days of *Sukkot* were the following performed: (ד': א')

 - *Lulav*? (ד': ב')
 - *Hallel*? (ד': ח')
 - *Nisuch HaMayim*?
 - *Aravah*? (ד': ג')
 - *Chalil*?
 - *Sukkah*? (ד': ח')

- Describe how the *mitzvah* of *lulav* was originally performed in the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*. (ד': ד')
- For what reason was the process described in the previous question modified? (ד': ד')
- Describe how the *mitzvah* of *aravah* was performed in the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*. (ד': ה')
- What would they say as they completed the *hakafof*? (ד': ו')
- How would the *mitzvah* of *aravah* differ on *Shabbat*? (ד': ו')
- What would the *tinokot* do after the *mitzvah* of *aravah* was performed on the seventh day of *Sukkot*? (ד': ז')

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
 Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Beit Ha'Roeh
 Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
 9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
 Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rav Meir Pogrow
613.org/mishnah.html

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
 In US dial: 718 906 6400
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
22 nd January כ' טבת	23 rd January כ"א טבת	24 th January כ"ב טבת	25 th January כ"ג טבת	26 th January כ"ד טבת	27 th January כ"ה טבת	28 th January כ"ו טבת
Sukkah 4:8-9	Sukkah 4:10-5:1	Sukkah 5:2-3	Sukkah 5:4-5	Sukkah 5:6-7	Sukkah 5:8 – Beitzah 1:1	Beitzah 1:2-3

