



Trying to Separate *Challah* from Flour

The *Mishnah* (2:5):

If someone separated *challah* from flour, it is not considered *Challah*. [If the *kohen* keeps the flour] it is considered as theft in the hands of the *kohen*.

The *Mishnah* explains that if one separates *challah* before the dough is obligated to have *challah* removed, the act is meaningless. An issue raised by the commentators is that we find that if one separated *maaser* prematurely, while the wheat was still as sheaves, then that which is separated is *maaser*. What is *challah* any different?

Rashi (*Kiddushin* 46b) and *Bartenura* (2:5) explain that the *Torah* writes when teaching the obligation for separating *challah*, that it must be “the beginning of your dough”. Consequently if it is not dough, then the separation is meaningless. The *Tosfot HaRid* however asks that when the *Torah* discusses *maaser* it writes, “a tithe from you grain” (*Devarim* 12:17) which would only be at the time it reaches the granary (*miruach ha’keri* - “smoothing of the pile”). Nevertheless, as already explained, *maaser* separated prior to that point is considered *maaser*. So our original question returns, why is there a difference? The *Tosfot HaRid* answers that there is an additional *passuk* that discusses grain and refers to the wheat as produce and grain, prior to *miruach ha’keri*: “You shall tithe entire crop (*tevuat zareaacha*)...” (*Devarim* 14:22)

The *Meiri* answers this question in a similar way but without the need for an additional *passuk*. He explains that the term “dough” is only every used to refer to flour that has been already mixed liquid. Prior to that point it is simply flour. The term *dagan* (grain) however can refer to wheat even when it is still in its sheaves.

The *Rash* (*Trumot* 1:10) however provides a different source that treats *teruma* differently. *Torah* writes when instructing the *leviim* to separate *trumot maaser* from their *maaser rishon*, “you shall raise up from it a gift to *Hashem*, a tithe from a tithe” (*Bamidbar* 18:26). The *Gemara* (*Pesachim* 35b) learns that since the *Torah* only specified the requirement for the *levi* to separate *trumot maaser*, if *maaser rishon* was taken early, the *levi* need not separate *trumot gedolah* along with *trumot maaser*. Returning to our issue, the *Rash* explains that we therefore have a special *pasuk* that teaches that premature separation by *maaser* is affective, while by *challah* we do not.

Until this point we have maintained the assumption that there is a difference between *challah* and *teruma* and resorted to *pesukim* as the source for the difference. The *Ramban* however explains that in truth *challah* is equivalent to *trumot* – our confusion is related to timing. For both there are three lifecycle phases. The time prior to a third of a produce’s development for *teruma* is equivalent for *challah* when the product is just flour. For both, any separation at the stage is meaningless. After that stage, for *teruma* prior to the smooth of the pile one is allowed to snack from the product and if they separated *maaser* it is significant. Likewise for *challah* once water has been added until the dough has been rolled, if one separated *challah* it would be affective. The final stage is when the pile has been smooth for *teruma* and for *challah* once the dough has been rolled. At that point, no part can be consumed without the required separation.

Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier

Revision Questions

חלה א' ד' – ב' ח'

- From what things must one separate *ma'asrot* yet need not separate *challah*? (א' ד')
- If someone initially used ordinary dough, yet used it for *sufganim*, does *challah* need to be separated? (ה' א')
- When is one required to separate *challah* for *challot todah* and *rekikei nazir*? (א' ר')
- Is a baker required to separate *challah* if he prepares many portion of dough, each smaller than the minimum measure, to be sold separately? (א' ר')
- What is *isat kelavim* and when must one separate *challah* from it? (ח' א')
- What nine laws does *challah* share with *trumah*? (ט' א')
- If one brings one of the five grains into Israel and uses it to make dough, do they need to separate *challah*? (א' ב')
- According to *R' Akiva* if one takes one of the five grains from Israel to outside Israel and use it to make dough, do they need to separate *challah*? (א' ב')
- When would one be required to separate *ma'asrot* from a plant on a boat that originated from outside Israel? (ב' ב')
- Can one separate *challah* when not wearing clothing? (ב' ג')
- Explain the debate regarding what one should do if they are unable to bake bread in a state of purity. (ב' ג')
- If one prepares a lot of dough, each being less than the minimum size that obligates one to separate *challah*, when do we say that they combine to obligate one to separate *challah*? (ב' ד')
- If one separates a portion of the flour as *challah* what is the status of that flour, and what is the status of the dough made out of the remaining flour? (ב' ה')
- What is the minimum amount of flour used in dough that requires one to separate *challah*? (ב' ו')
- When does bran combine with the flour to complete this minimum amount? (ב' ו')
- How much of the dough must be separated for *challah*? (ב' ז')
- In which two cases is the measure described in the previous question reduced? (ב' ז')
- Explain the debate regarding whether one can separate *challah* from *tahor* to cover the requirement for *tameh* dough. (ב' ח')

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

After *Ma'ariv*

Mizrachi Shul

Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*

Beit Ha'Roeh

Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf

9:00am

Kollel Magen Avraham

Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown

www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rav Meir Pogrow

613.org/mishnah.html

Rabbi E. Kornfeld

Rabbi C. Brown

<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss

In US dial: 718 906 6400

Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
3 rd April ו' ניסן	4 th April ז' ניסן	5 th April ח' ניסן	6 th April ט' ניסן	7 th March י' ניסן	8 th April י"א ניסן	9 th April י"ב ניסן
Challah 3:1-2	Challah 3:3-4	Challah 3:5-6	Challah 3:7-8	Challah 3:9-10	Challah 4:1-2	Challah 4:3-4

