



A Drop of Water in Mei Chatat

The *Mishnah* (9:1) records the debate regarding a situation where a drop of water falls into *mei chatat*. *R' Eliezer* maintains that one should perform *hazaya* (sprinkling) twice, instead of once and the water is valid. The *Chachamim* however explain the all the *mei chatat* is invalid and may not be used for purification from *tumat met*.

The *Tosfot* (*Zevachim* 79b) explain that on a biblical level, with respect to *mei chatat*, the invalid water would *batel* (annulled) in the overwhelming majority of valid water. Consequently they explain that this debate is regarding the extent of the rabbinic imposed stringency on *mei chatat*.

The *Gemara* (*Zevachim* 80) discusses this debate in great detail and the opinion of *R' Eliezer* in particular. *Rava* understands that *R' Eliezer* maintains the concept of "*bila*"; meaning that one treats the foreign drop is if it as has mixed evenly throughout the water. Furthermore, *R' Eliezer* maintains that there is no minimum *shiur* (measure) of water that must come into contact with the person undergoing the purification. Consequently, one *hazaya* would be enough. Nevertheless the *Chachamim* instituted a *knas* (fine) requiring sprinkling twice in order that one should not benefit from mixing in the foreign water.

Rav Ashi however understands that *R' Eliezer* does not hold by the principle of *bila*. Consequently there is a concern that the first *hazaya* will consist completely of the foreign water. Therefore two *hazayot* are required guaranteeing that some *mei chatat* will fall on the person at least once.

One may be tempted to ask that performing *hazaya* on a *tahor* person would cause them to be *tameh*. Consequently, according to both answers, it is possible that the extra *hazaya* would cause the person to be *tameh*. The *Tifferet Yisrael* pre-empts this question and answers that indeed the person would be required to

immerse in a *mikveh* following the *hazayot* to rid himself of this lower level of *tumah*.

The *Chachamim* however argue that the water is invalid. The *Bartenura* explains the *Chachamim* require a full *shiur* in one *hazaya*. Maintaining the principle of *bila*, this would not be possible.

Returning to the opinion of *R' Eliezer*, the *Rambam* explain that the two *hazayot* are not placed on the person, but rather cast on the ground prior to performing *hazaya*. After that, all the remaining water would be valid. The *Bartenura* is at a loss for the source of the opinion of the *Rambam*, as he understands the *Gemara* as it was explained above.

The *Tosfot Yom Tov* explains that the *Rambam* is holding like the opinion of *Rav Ashi* who does not hold by the principle of *bila*. Consequently once the two drops are cast aside, the foreign drop is assumed to be removed and the remaining water is valid (*talinan*). The *Mishnah Achrana* explains further. Since *R' Eliezer* does not by the concept of *bila* is comparable to a case of mixed dry product (*yavesh b'yavesh*) and the foreign drop is really *batel* in a majority (as mentioned above). Now ordinarily the concept of *talinan* is not employed from the outset. It is only used in specific situations, after the fact, for example if part of the mixture fell in the ocean (see *Shulchan Aruch YD* 140). This case is different. The *Mishnah Achrana* explains that since this case does not involve food or items offered in the *Beit HaMikdash* *R' Eliezer* employs a leniency within the law of *talinan*.

The *Tosfot Chadashim* however explains that the *Rambam* holds like *Rava*. *Rava* maintained that the two *hazaya* requirement was simply a *knas* preventing one from benefitting from the mixture. Consequently casting the water to ground would satisfy. Note that that solution would avoid the requirement of following the *hazaya* with *tevila* mentioned earlier in the name of the *Tifferet Yisrael*.

Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier

Revision Questions

פרה ח': ג' – ט': ה'

- Explain how the phrase "מִטְמְאֵיךְ לֹא טְמֵאוּנִי, וְאַתָּה טְמֵאתָנִי" applies to the following:
 - *Parah aduma*? (ח': ג')
 - *Neveilat ohf tahor*? (ח': ד')
 - *Vlad ha'tum'ot*? (ח': ה')
 - *Kli cheres*? (ח': ו')
 - *Sheini l'tumah*? (ח': ז')
- Explain the debate regarding which bodies of water have the status of a *mikvah*? (ח': ח')
- Complete *R' Yosi's* ruling regarding the previous question: (ח': ח')
 כל הימים מטהר _____, ופוסלין _____, _____, ולקדש מהן _____.
- What is *mayim mukim*? (ח': ט')
- What is *mayim mechatzvim*? (ח': ט')
- Can these types of water be used for *mei chatat*? (ח': ט')
- Why can *mei karmiyon* not be used for *mei chatat*? (ח': י')
- Why can *mei yarden* not be used for *mei chatat*? (ח': י')
- Explain the debate regarding the validity of water for two valid sources that were mixed together? (ח': י')
- Is water whose appearance changed valid? (ח': י"א)
- What is the law regarding using water from a well into which earth fell? (ח': י"א)
- Explain the debate regarding the case where valid water fell into *mei chatat*? (ח': ט')
- What is the law if dew fell into *mei chatat*? (ח': ט')
- What is the law if juice fell into *mei chatat*? (ח': ט')
- What is the law if ink fell into *mei chatat*? (ח': ט')
- What is the law if the following creatures fell into *mei chatat*: (ח': ב')

 - *Shekatzim*?
 - *Chipushit*?
 - A louse?

- What is the law if an animal drunk from the *mei chatat*? (ח': ג')
- What is the law if a bird drunk from the *mei chatat*? (ח': ג')
- Which of the *sheratzim* that drink for *mei chatat* would invalidate it? (ח': ג')
- At what point from when one thinks to drink *mei chatat* and finally drinks it does it invalidate the *mei chatat*? (Include all opinions.) (ח': ד')
- Explain the debate regarding whether one can use invalid *mei chatat* to mix cement? (ח': ה')
- What other debate is similar to the one in the previous question? (ח': ה')

Local Shiurim

Sunday -Thursday

After maariv
Mizrachi Shul

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before mincha
Beit Ha'Roeh

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
29 th November י"ב כסלו	30 th November י"ג כסלו	1 st December י"ד כסלו	2 nd December ט"ו כסלו	3 rd December ט"ז כסלו	4 th December י"ז כסלו	5 th December י"ח כסלו
Parah 9:6-7	Parah 9:8-9	Parah 10:1-2	Parah 10:3-4	Parah 10:5-6	Parah 11:1-2	Parah 11:3-4

