



Volume 5. Issue 29

## Introduction to *Temurah*

The new *masechet*, *masechet Temurah*, deals with the laws relating to one attempting to exchange an animal for an animal set aside as a *korban*. Other than violating a negative prohibition, the outcome is that both animals are sanctified. The first, the *korban*, retains its sanctity and the second becomes a *temurah*. As learnt in the first *Mishnah* this is the case whether the second animal is better or worse than the first. Analysing a particular debate will provide a better understanding of this law.

The *Mishnah* taught (1:2):

*Temurah* can be caused by stating: one [animal] in place of two [*korbanot*]; two [animals] in place of one [*korban*]; one in place of one-hundred; one-hundred in place of one. *R' Shimon* says: *Temurah* can only [be caused when trying to exchange] one in place of one, as it states, “and it shall be that **it** and the exchanged [animal shall be sanctified]”. Just as “it” (*hu*) implies one, so too the exchanged is [understood as being] one.

The above *Mishnah* describes the debate whether the law of *Temurah* applies also in a one-to-many and many-to-one relationship or only in a one-to-one way.

A further debate ensues in the *Gemara* regarding the later opinion, the opinion of *R' Shimon*. *Reish Lakish* argues that even though *R' Shimon* maintains that *temurah* is only effective in a one-to-one way this is only in one instance. He would however agree that many animals can become a *temurah* from one *korban*. He explains that this is possible when someone attempts to transfer the sanctity from a *korban* to other single animals in multiple instances. *Reish Lakish* reasons that after the first *temurah* is performed the sanctity of the original *korban* has not been affected (“*kedusha rishona de'hekdeshe le'heichan halcha*”). Consequently the next time one

attempts to exchange an animal for that *korban* it is like starting for the beginning. Despite this rationale *R' Yochanan* argues that *R' Shimon* would maintain that as soon as *temurah* has been performed once from a *korban* it could not be performed again. What is the rationale of *R' Yochanan*? Why does he disagree with *Reish Lakish's* understanding?

The *Minchat Asher* explains that this debate is indicative of the broader question of what is the novelty (*chiddush*) of this law of *temurah*. One way to understand it is that were it not for the law of *temurah*, the declaration of the person attempting to transfer the sanctity would be meaningless. The *korban* would remain a *korban* and the second animal remain a normal animal. The *chiddush* is that this second animal is also sanctified. Another way to understand this is that were it not for the laws of *temurah*, the declaration would have been effective and the second animal would have taken the place of the *korban*. The *chiddush* is that the original animal is also sanctified.

The *Minchat Asher* uses these two understandings to explain the debate between *Reish Lakish* and *R' Yochanan*. *Reish Lakish* reasoned that the *korban* could be used again to create another *temurah* because the sanctity had not been affected – the *korban* was unchanged. This reasoning seems to be aligned with the first understanding that the *chiddush* of *temurah* is that the second animal is sanctified and it is clear the declaration made had no affect on the *korban*. *R' Yochanan* however rejects this rationale. According to the *Minchat Asher* this is because he follows the second understanding that really the sanctity is transferred and the *chiddush* of *temurah* is that the original animal is also sanctified. Since the *korban* has been affected it can no longer cause another *Temurah*.

*Yisrael-Yitzchak Bankier*

**Revision Questions**

ערכין ט' ז' – ח'

- In what way are *batei chatzerim* similar to *batei arei chomah* and in what way are they similar to regular fields? (ט' ט')
- When are houses of a walled city considered *batei chatzerim*? (ז': ט')
- How did the laws relating to the sale of the houses in walled city differ from the houses in a walled city of the *Levi'im*? (ח': ט')
- Explain the debate regarding an *Yisrael* that inherited a house in a *Levi* city. (How could such a case occur?) (ח': ט')
- What restrictions were placed on the development of the cities of the *Levi'im*? (ח': ט')

תמורה א' א' – ג' ג'

- What is a *temurah*? (א': א')
- What is the punishment for one that is *me'mir*? (א': א')
- Can a *kohen* perform a *temurah* on an *Yisrael's korban*? (א': א')
- Regarding the previous question, which *korban* is a subject of debate? Explain the debate. (א': א')
- What is law is learnt from the following *pasuk*: (ב': א')  
"לא יחליפנו ולא ימיר אתו, טובב בקע או רע בטוב"
- Explain the debate regarding whether *temurah* applies if one attempts to exchange many animals for one. (א': ב')
- In which case does *R' Yosi* maintain that *temurah* applies to limbs? (א': ג')
- What are the three cases of "ואין ה... אלא לפי חשבון"? Explain. (א': ד')
- Is there "*temurah* after *temurah*"? Explain. (א': ה')
- What other cases are brought similar to the one in the previous question? (א': ה')
- Explain the debate whether *temurah* applies to the offspring of a *korban*? (א': ה')
- Does *temurah* apply to bird offerings? (א': ו')
- Does *temurah* apply to public sacrifices? (א': ו')
- What are the opinions regarding the source of why *temurah* does not apply to *korbanot bedek ha'bait*? (א': ו')
- What three laws apply to private *korbanot* that do not apply to public *korbanot*? (א': ב')
- What applies to public *korbanot* that does not apply to private *korbanot*? (א': ב')
- Explain the debate regarding whether the rule of *chatat met* applies to public sacrifices and what is the case that is debated. (א': ב')
- In what three ways is *kodshim* stricter than *temurah*? (א': ג')
- In what two ways is *temurah* stricter than *kodshim*? (א': ג')
- Regarding the previous question, what case does *R' Yehuda* add? (א': ג')
- What happened to a *korban* if, according to *R' Elazar*, it can no longer make a *temurah*? (א': ג')
- What is debated regarding the offspring of a *korban shlamim*? (א': ג')
- What is the difference between the offering of a *korban todah* and a *temurat todah*? (א': ג')
- Explain the debate regarding the male offspring of a *korban olah*. (א': ג')
- Explain the debate regarding one that separated a female animal for a *korban asham*. (א': ג')
- Explain the debate regarding a *temurat asham*. What else is debated in a similar manner? (א': ג')

**Local Shiurim**

**Sunday -Thursday**

Between mincha & ma'ariv  
Mizrachi Shul

**Friday & Shabbat**

10 minutes before mincha  
Mizrachi Shul

**Audio Shiurim on-line!**

- [613.org/mishnah.html](http://613.org/mishnah.html)
- [www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/](http://www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/)

[www.mishnahyomit.com](http://www.mishnahyomit.com)

**Next Week's Mishnayot...**

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
16 <sup>th</sup> November י"ח חשוון	17 <sup>th</sup> November י"ט חשוון	18 <sup>th</sup> November כ' חשוון	19 <sup>th</sup> November כ"א חשוון	20 <sup>th</sup> November כ"ב חשוון	21 <sup>st</sup> November כ"ג חשוון	22 <sup>nd</sup> November כ"ד חשוון
Temurah 3:4-5	Temurah 4:1-2	Temurah 4:3-4	Temurah 5:1-2	Temurah 5:3-4	Temurah 5:5-6	Temurah 6:1-2

