



Volume 5. Issue 17

Chicken and Milk on the Table

With the beginning of the eighth *perak* we start learning about the prohibitions of *basar b'chalav* – cooking and eating and gaining benefit from meat and milk cooked together. In the first *Mishnah* we learn about the scope of this prohibition as it begins defining the term “meat”. Later (8:4), as this definition becomes more distinct, we learn that chicken is not included in the biblical prohibition of *basar b'chalav*. Nonetheless as people do refer to chicken as meat, the *Chachamim* understandably included chicken as part of the prohibition on a rabbinic level.

With this knowledge in hand, the *Gemara* has a difficulty with the continuation of the first *Mishnah*. The *Mishnah* states that just as it is prohibited to cook meat and milk together, so is it also prohibited to have meat and milk on the same table. This prohibition is a *gezeirah* (rabbinic decree) out of concern that one will eat milk and meat together. Yet we learn that it also applies to having chicken and milk on the same table; the prohibition of eating the two together itself is a *gezeirah*. Consequently the *Gemara* asks that extending the *gezeirah* that far, appears to be creating a *gezeirah l'gezeirah* (a decree to safeguard another decree) something which the *Chachamim* avoid.

The response (*Chulin* 104b) appears to be that in this case the *Chachamim* did not enact an extra *gezeirah*. They decreed once that chicken and milk should not be “raised” on the table in case meat and milk be “raised” together and placed in the cooking pot.

To fully understand this issue, perhaps it is best to ask a more basic question. Why is it prohibited to have meat and milk on the same table. If the concern is that meat and milk will be eaten together, the biblical prohibition of eating meat and milk is only if they have been cooked together. Eating them, not having been cooked together, is a *gezeirah*. We can therefore ask a similar question by meat itself and milk – is this not a *gezeirah l'gezeirah*?

Rashi explains that by meat and cheese we are concerned that they will touch each other while on the same table and be eaten having absorbed one from the other. The *Maharam Shif* explain that the *Rashi* is concerned that having eaten in this manner he will place them together in one utensil, and if placed them together in a boiling pot will transgress the

biblical prohibition of *bishul*. Accordingly we once again have one *gezeirah*.

The *Ran* (32b *dapei HaRif*) however explains that this decree against placing meat and milk on the same table is out of concern that we will eat them together. The *Chachamim* were even more strict by this prohibition as milk and meat are both independently permissible. Similarly he explains that concerning chicken and milk, had the *Chachamim* permitted them being on the same table, the prohibition against eating them together would never have stood.

How do we understand the *Ran* in the case of placing chicken and cheese on the same table? Is it not still a *gezeirah l'gezeirah*? The *Melechet Shlomo* quoting the *Lavush* explains that since people put food on the dinner table for the express purpose of eating them, it is as if this prohibition is part of prohibition against eating them together.

The *Radvaz* (M”A 9:20) explains, that the *Chachamim* strengthened their words to treat them like their biblical equivalent. The reason being that since all that is specifically mentioned is a “goat” as apposed to all meat, without such strengthening, very soon one would violate a biblical prohibition.

Alternatively we can utilise the explanation of the *Tosfot*. They explain that sometimes we find that indeed the *Chachamim* do institute decrees to safeguard existing decrees. Each rabbinic enactment is unique and we cannot compare one with another unless the *Gemara* itself does so. Here, for the above stated reasons, the *Chachamim* felt it necessary.¹

Using this we can once again return and explain the concern by meat and milk. We asked that if the concern is that they be eaten together, if they were not cooked together it would be a *gezeirah l'gezeirah*. Indeed the *Shuchan Aruch* states that the concern is that they will be eaten together. The *Taz* therefore explains that this too is an instance where the *Chachamim* decided to institute a *gezeirah* for an existing *gezeirah*.

Yisrael-Yitzchak Bankier

¹ To see an explanation about how these understandings fit in with the above quoted *Gemara* see the *Lechem Mishneh* (M”A 9:20).

Revision Questions

חולין ו' – ח' – ו'

- Is one obligated to perform *kisui ha'dam* to the blood found on the slaughter knife? (ו':ה)
- What general rule does *Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel* state regarding what can be used for *kisui ha'dam*? (ו':ו')
- To which animals does the prohibition of *gid hanasheh* apply? (ז':א)
- Explain the debate whether the prohibition of *gid hanasheh* applies to a fetus? (ז':א)
- Can a butcher be trusted to say that they removed the *gid hanasheh*? (ז':א)
- Can one gain benefit from the *gid hanasheh*? What case is brought as an example of this law? (ז':ב)
- Is one liable to lashes if he ate a complete *gid hanasheh* that was less than a *kezayit* in size? (ז':ג)
- Why does *R' Yehuda* maintain that if one eats the *gid hanasheh* from both legs of the animal is he liable to only one set of lashes? (ז':ג)
- What is the law if a thigh was cooked with the *gid hanasheh*? (ז':ד)
- What is the law regarding a piece of *neveilah* that was cooked with other pieces of meat? (ז':ה)
- Regarding the previous question, what is the law regarding the sauce? (ז':ה)
- Explain the debate regarding whether the prohibition of *gid hanasheh* applies to non-kosher animals? (ז':ו)
- Meat from which animals does the prohibition of *basar b'chalav* apply? (ח':א)
- Regarding which two other laws does this definition of meat apply? (ח':א)
- What debate relating to *basar b'chalav* does *Beit Shammai* take a lenient stance? (ח':א)
- In what manner is one allowed to wrap meat and cheese in the same napkin? (ח':ב)
- Regarding who does *Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel* allow to eat meat and milk at the same table? (ח':ב)
- What is the law regarding a drop of milk that falls onto a piece of meat in a boiling pot? (ח':ג)
- What is the exception to the rule in the previous question? (ח':ג)
- What must one do in order to cook and eat the udder of a cow? (ח':ג)
- Does the prohibition of *basar b'chalav* apply to non-kosher animals? (ח':ד)
- What is the law regarding cheese that was made using the stomach of an animal? (ח':ה)
- How is the prohibition of *chelev* more strict than blood? (ח':ו)
- How is the prohibition of blood more strict than *chelev*? (ח':ו)

Local Shiurim

Sunday -Thursday
Between mincha & ma'ariv
Mizrachi Shul

Friday & Shabbat
10 minutes before mincha
Mizrachi Shul

Audio Shiurim on-line!

- 613.org/mishnah.html
- www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

www.
mishnahyomit
.com

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
31 st August א' אב	1 st September א' אלול	2 nd September ב' אלול	3 rd September ג' אלול	4 th September ד' אלול	5 th September ה' אלול	6 th September ו' אלול
Chulin 9:1-2	Chulin 9:3-4	Chulin 9:5-6	Chulin 9:7-8	Chulin 10:1-2	Chulin 10:3-4	Chulin 11:1-2

