



Volume 2. Issue 3.

Hatmana

The third *perek* of *messechet Shabbat* deals with the rabbinic prohibition of insulating hot food on *Shabbat* (*hatmana*). The Rabbis prohibited *hatmana* because it might lead to the *melachot* of *bishul* (cooking) and *maver* (kindling). The Rabbis were concerned because food is insulated in order to keep it warm, and if the food was not kept warm enough a person may reheat the food, thus performing the *melacha* of *bishul*. They may also perform *maver* if a flame was ignited in order to reheat the food.

Not all forms of insulation are actually prohibited. In order for the insulation to be prohibited four conditions must be present (*The 39 Melochos*, Rabbi Dovid Ribiat, p. 627):

1. The food must be completely covered by the insulation.
2. The food must still be in its *kli rishon* (the vessel in which the food was heated).¹
3. The intent of the *hatmana* must be for the purposes of insulating.
4. The insulating material must be in direct contact with the food or the container.

In general, if any of these conditions is absent, then *hatmana* is permitted.²

Hatmana can be performed before *Shabbat* for food that will be consumed on *Shabbat*. However there is a prohibition against insulating food before *Shabbat* with materials that add heat (such as hot coals). For example, if such a *hatmana* was made on Friday morning the food would need to be uncovered before the beginning of *Shabbat* (*Mishnah Brurah* (257:1)). This prohibition extends even when the source of the heat is not the insulating material itself. As long as there is an active source of heat, the insulation will be prohibited. For example, completely wrapping a hot water urn in a towel is prohibited even before *Shabbat* because the heating element in the urn is the active source of heat (*The 39 Melochos*, p631).

The *Gemara* (*Shabbat* 34b) explains that the prohibition against insulating food before *Shabbat* was put in place due to a concern that one may insulate food with hot ash that has live coals mixed with it. Later, when *Shabbat* had begun, one may be tempted to rake the coals to make the food cook faster, or in modern terms, turn up the heat. This

is the same concern which underpins the prohibition of *shehiya* (leaving a pot on the stove on *erev Shabbat* – see last week's *Mishnah Yomit*).

One may therefore think that the same exceptions that apply to *shehiya* would also apply to *hatmana*. For example, one may think that insulation is permitted if the food is fully cooked (because there is no temptation to rake the coals or turn up the heat). However the *Gemara* does not mention this exception in relation to *hatmana*. *Rashi* (*Shabbat* 34b) explains that Rabbis wanted to avoid possible confusion. Although some *Rishonim* hold that the prohibition of *hatmana* does not apply if the food is fully cooked (*Artscroll Gemara Shabbat*, Intro. to Chapter 4), most *Rishonim* hold that the prohibition does apply in such cases. The *Shulchan Aruch* (257:7) clearly states that *hatmana* is forbidden with fully cooked food. The *Rema* mentions the lenient view but says that it should only be followed in places where there is already a custom to be lenient. The *Mishnah Brurah* explains that the lenient view only applies to the case of *hatmana* before *Shabbat*.

One final note - the prohibition of *hatmana* is a *g'zeirah* (a rabbinic enactment to keep people from sinning - Steinsaltz, p108). There is a general principle that the Rabbis do not enact a *g'zeirah* for a *g'zeirah*. However, the prohibition of *hatmana* appears to be exactly that. Firstly, there is *g'zeirah* not to insulate hot food with hot ash – this is a safeguard because the hot ash may have live coals which might be raked. Secondly, there is a further *g'zeirah* prohibiting insulating hot food with any substance – this is a safeguard against insulating with hot ash.

Rambam explains in his commentary to the *Mishnah* that the principle of not decreeing a *g'zeirah* to a *g'zeirah* only applies when attempting to issue a decree to safeguard against an existing safeguard. However, if the Rabbis realise at the time of issuing a *g'zeirah* that it will not be a sufficient safeguard on its own, then the Rabbis can issue a second *g'zeirah* to support the first one, provided that both are decreed at the same time. According to the *Rambam* this is what the Rabbis did in the case of *hatmana*. (*Artscroll Mishnah Shabbat*, p87; *Rambam's* commentary to *masechet Shabbat*, Ch 4).

Allon Ledder

¹ However if the food cooled down below the temperature of *yad soledet bo* (too hot to touch) then the *Mishnah Brurah* (257:5) suggests that *hatmana* would be permitted, even in the *kli rishon*.

² No practical conclusions should be drawn from this summary as there are number of qualifications and conditions that apply.

Revision Questions

שבת ג: ו' – ו': ז'

- When can one place a plate under the *Shabbat* candles to catch the oil? (ג: ו')
- What must one be careful about when placing a plate under a candle to catch the sparks? (ו': ו')
- The first *Mishnah* in the fourth *perek* lists things with which one is not allowed to insulate his hot food on *erev Shabbat*. What is the reason why these things are excluded? (ז': ז')
- One is allowed to insulate their hot food with wool shearing, yet they are *muktza*. How does one retrieve their food if he insulated it in wool shearings? (ז': ב')
- One can only insulate his food before *Shabbat*. If it was insulated before *Shabbat* and one uncovered it during *Shabbat*, can he reinsulate the pot? (ז': ב')
- The first *Mishnah* in the fifth *perek* list things which an animal is allowed to wear on *Shabbat*. Why is this list important? (ז': א')
- When can a donkey go out wearing a saddle? (ז': ה')
- The *Mishnah* states that a camel cannot go out *akud* or *ragul*. What does this mean and why not? (ז': ג')
- Why can a donkey not go out wearing a bell even if it is plugged? (ז': ה')
- In what manner did “*Rabbi Elazar ben Azarya’s* cow” go out on *Shabbat* which wasn’t to liking of the *Chachamim*? (ז': ה')
- The first *Mishnah* of the sixth *perek* list things which women cannot wear in the public domain on *Shabbat*. What is the reason why women cannot wear these things? (ז': א')
- When is one not allowed to walk with one shoe on and why? (ז': ב')
- Why is one not allowed to wear *tefillin* in the public domain on *Shabbat*? (ז': ב')
- What is the difference between when a woman walks in the public domain on *Shabbat* wearing a needle with a hole or wearing a needle without a hole? (ז': א', ג')
- Explain the debate regarding whether a man can carry weapons on *Shabbat*? (ז': ד')
- When can a woman walk on *Shabbat* with a pepper in her mouth? (Explain the reasons for when she can and cannot.) (ז': ה')
- Can one walk with a coin strapped to their foot? Why would they want to? (ז': ו')
- Can a woman who has wrapped her scarf and tied it around a nut or stone walk in the public domain in such a manner? What is the condition on this ruling? (ז': ז')

Local Shiurim

Sunday -Thursday
Between mincha & ma'ariv
Mizrachi Shul

Friday & Shabbat
10 minutes before mincha
Mizrachi Shul

Audio Shiurim on-line!

- 613.org/mishnah.html
- www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

New Book just published!

We have just released a new book, *Nachal Noveah*, that contains all the articles and revision questions on *Seder Zeraim*. If you would like a copy please send an email to admin@mishnahyomit.com or contact Doodie on (61-3) 9528-2235.

www.mishnahyomit.com

Next Week’s Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
18 th September י"ח אלול	19 th September ט"ו אלול	20 th September ט"ז אלול	21 st September י"ז אלול	22 nd September י"ח אלול	23 rd September י"ט אלול	24 th September כ' אלול
Shabbat 6: 8-9	Shabbat 6:10 – 7:1	Shabbat 7: 2-3	Shabbat 7:4 – 8:1	Shabbat 8: 2-3	Shabbat 8: 4-5	Shabbat 8: 6-7

