



The Four Species – How many?

The four species that are taken on *sukkot* consist of the *lulav*, *etrog*, *hadassim* and *aravot*. How many of each of the species is the subject to debate (3:4). *R' Yishmael* maintains that it is three *hadassim*, two *aravot*, one *lulav* and one *etrog*. *R' Akiva* however understands that one of each is sufficient.

A further debate ensues regarding the *hadassim*. According to *R' Yishmael*, if two of the three are *ketumim* (cut at the top) it is still valid. The *Bartenura* cites the *Gemara* that questions this position. If *ketumim* presents a problem and *R' Yishmael* requires three *hadassim*, then none of the *hadassim* can be *ketumim*. If however *ketumim* does not present a problem, then all three should be able to be *ketumim*. The *Gemara* explains that according to *R' Yishmael*, *ketumim* is an issue. However, *R' Yishmael* retracted from his initial position, and maintained that only one *hadassim* is required.

R' Tarfon however argues that all three can be *ketumim*. In other words, *R' Tarfon* does indeed require three *hadassim*, yet argues that *hadassim* that are *ketumim* are valid. The *Bartenura* explains that *R' Tarfon* understands that the law of *hadar* (beauty) mentioned by the *etrog* does not apply to the *hadassim*. The *Tosfot Yom Tov* cites *R' Yeshaya* who explains that since the leaves of the *hadassim* cover the stem, if it is cut at the top, it would not be as noticeable.

The *Misregot Zahav* cites the *Rosh* who explains that all the quantities mentioned are minimums, and one could add more without violating the prohibition of *baal tosif* (adding to a *mitzvah*). The *Rambam*, however, only allows one to increase the number of *hadassim* but not any of the other *minim* (species). The *Rosh* finds this difficult considering that the number of *hadassim* is derived from the three words “*anaf etz avot*”. The number of *aravot* is derived from the reference to “*arvei nachal*” with *arvei* being a plural implying that more than one is taken. The

Misregot Zahav explains the debate as follows. When deriving a quantity from the use of a plural word, the *Rambam* also considers the danger of violating *baal tosif*. Consequently, the minimum plural – two – is derived. The *Rosh* however understands that any number more than one is implied by the *passuk*.

Rav Soloveichik (*Harerei Kedem* 130) presents a different understanding of the *Rambam*. He explains the quantities derived for the *lulav*, *etrog* and *arava* all relate to the laws of *lekicha* – taking the species. Those quantities are implied in the *pasuk* and derived from the use of singular or plural terms. The *hadassim* are different. The quantity is learnt from the use of the three terms “*anaf etz avot*” – no actual number is mentioned. *Rav Soloveichik* understands that this does not define the number required when taking the four species (as it does regarding the *aravot*). Instead, the *Torah* is providing a definition for the *hadassim*. The myrtle branches are only defined as *anaf etz avot* as required for the *mitzvah*, when there are three branches. Put differently, the requirement of three *hadassim* is not a law in the *maaseh mitzvah* – the action of taking the four species. Instead, it is a law in the *cheftza* – the definition of what the *hadassim* are. That being the case, since there is no law regarding the quantity of *hadassim* that should be taken (as part of the *maaseh mitzvah*) there is no issue with adding more *hadassim*.

Rav Soloveichik provides another implication of this understanding. The *Rambam* rules (7:6) that one can fulfill the *mitzvah* by taking each of the *minim* one at a time. It would seem that this would also be true if one took one *arava* at a time considering that, in the end, two *aravot* were taken. With the *hadassim* however, since the definition of the object that must be taken is three branches together, if one takes each of the branches one after the other, they never took once took the *hadassim* as required.

Yisrael Bankier

Revision Questions

סוכה ב' ר' – ג' י'

- List the two opinions regarding the number of meals that one must eat in a *sukkah*. (ב' ר') (י')
- Explain the debate regarding a person whose body was inside the *sukkah* yet the table from which he was eating was outside the *sukkah*? (ז' ר') (י')
- Which three people are exempt from eating in the *sukkah*? (ב' ח') (י')
- Complete the following phrase: (ב' ט') (י')
"_____ עושה _____"
"כל שבעת ימים אדם עושה _____"
- If it is raining, from what point is one allowed to move inside? (ב' ט') (י')
- Can one use a stolen *lulav*? (א' ג') (י')
- What extra requirement does R' Yehuda place on the *lulavim*? (א' ג') (י')
- What are *tzinei har ha'barzel* and can they be used as *lulavim*? (א' ג') (י')
- How large must the *lulav* be? (א' ג') (י')
- Can one use a dried out *hadas*? (ב' ג') (י')
- How many berries can the *hadas* have before it becomes invalid? (ב' ג') (י')
- If the head of the *aravah* is severed, is it acceptable? (ג' ג') (י')
- What is an *aravah* that is describe as *tzafzafa* and is it acceptable? (ג' ג') (י')
- Is an *aravah* acceptable if it lost some of its leaves? (ג' ג') (י')
- How many of each of the four species must be taken? (include all opinions) (ד' ג') (י')
- Is an *etrog* from an *ir hanidachat* acceptable? (ה' ג') (י')
- Can an *etrog* of *orlah* be used? (ה' ג') (י')
- Which of the following invalidates an *etrog*: (ו' ג') (י')
 - A crack?
 - A hole (with nothing removed)?
 - The *oketz* being removed?
 - A small *chazazit*?
 - Being green in colour?
- What are the two opinions regarding the minimum size of an *etrog*? (ז' ג') (י')
- What material may be used to bind a *lulav*? (ח' ג') (י')
- What are the two opinions regarding when the *lulav* is shaken during *Hallel*? (ט' ג') (י')
- When, during the day, can one fulfil the *mitzvah* of *lulav*? (י' ג') (י')
- If someone is unable to read *hallel* and gets someone to read for them, how should they respond? (י' ג') (י')

Shiurim

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter
mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendar/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

APPS

Mishnah Yomit
mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah
Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi
Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

| Sunday | Monday | Tuesday | Wednesday | Thursday | Friday | שבת קודש |
|-------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|---------------------|
| 9 July כ' תמוז | 10 July כ"א תמוז | 11 July כ"ב תמוז | 12 July כ"ג תמוז | 13 July כ"ד תמוז | 14 July כ"ה תמוז | 15 July כ"ו תמוז |
| Sukkah 3:11-12 | Sukkah 3:13-14 | Sukkah 3:15-4:1 | Sukkah 4:2-3 | Sukkah 4:4-5 | Sukkah 4:6-7 | Sukkah 4:8-9 |

