



Hotzaah Together

Masechet Shabbat opens by discussing the *melacha* of *hotzaah* – transferring an object from a private domain to the public domain or back. We learn in the *Mishnah* that the *melacha* is made up of two parts. *Akira* – raising the object out of one of the domains, and *hanacha* – placing the object down in the other. For one to be liable on a biblical level, they must perform both these actions. The *Mishnah* includes a case where the *akira* was performed by one person and *hanacha* by another. For example, one person picked the object up and stretched his hands into the other domain, and the other took the object and placed it on the ground. The *Mishnah* teaches that they are both exempt. This implies that while not liable on a biblical level, the action is nonetheless rabbinically prohibited. We shall try to understand this ruling.

The *Bartenura* explains that the reason is that each of them only performed half the *melacha*. It is rabbinically prohibited out of concern that one person might (easily) performed the entire *melacha* on their own.

As we learn *masechet Shabbat*, each of the *melachot* have a *shiur* – a minimum measure – that if performed, one desecrates *Shabbat*. It would seem that for the *melacha* of *hotzaah*, the *shiur* would be both *akira* and *hanacha*. The *Tifferet Yisrael* (*Boaz* 1:4) therefore asks that even though one would not be liable for punishment if they performed a *chatzi shiur* – half the minimum amount – it is nonetheless biblically prohibited to do so. The reason is that the amount one

has already performed can combine with more, to breach that *shiur*. That being the case, it would seem that each of the individuals in our *Mishnah* would have violated biblical prohibitions and not rabbinic ones. Each seemingly performed a *chatzi shiur*.

The *Tifferet Yisrael* cites his father, who explains that the issue of performing a *chatzi shiur* is only if we are discussing one action. For example, writing one letter, when the full *shiur* is writing two letters. This case however is different since it consists of two different actions and the full *melacha* is a combination of those two actions. Consequently, performing one is not considered like perform a *chatzi shiur*. He continues citing other similar prohibitions, e.g. the prohibition of wearing wool and linen clothing. Wearing wool alone is not considered a *chatzi shiur* and obviously permitted. The same then is true in our case. *Akira* on its own would be permitted on a biblically. Nevertheless, we learn in our *Mishnah* that the *Chachamim* prohibited our case since it is not exactly the same as *kilayim* since both *akira* and *hanacha* are performed on the same object.¹

The *Tifferet Yisrael* also cites an answer provided by his son. He explains that the *melachot* on *Shabbat* are different from other prohibitions. The activities that are defined as *melachot* and prohibited, are derived from the activities involved in the construction of the *mishkan*. *Akira* or *hanacha* on their own are not *melachot* and therefore permitted (on a biblical level).

Yisrael Bankier

¹ The *Tifferet Yisrael* continues to address why carrying less than four *amot* in the public domain is also only rabbinically prohibited. In that case, it should be considered a *chatzi shiur* and prohibited on a biblical level. He answers that, as we explained above, the reason a *chatzi shiur* is prohibited biblically is because one could

add to that *shiur* and perform the full *melacha*. If one carried only two *amot* and placed the item down, since *hanacha* has already been performed, it is no longer possible to add to that action to turn it into a *melacha*.

Revision Questions

ביכורים ג': ט' – ד': ה'

- Explain the debate regarding which fruit we use to “decorate” the *bikurim*? (ג': ט')
- Explain the meaning of these terms: (ג': י')
 - *Tosefet bikurim*
 - *Itur bikurim*
 Explain two halachic differences between the above two things.
- When is *tosefet bikurim* equivalent to *bikurim*? (ג': י"א)
- Explain why *bikurim* is referred to as the *kohen's* property? (ג': י"ב)
- Explain the debate between *R' Yehuda* and *Chachamim* regarding to which *kohen* the *bikurim* must be given. (ג': י"ב)
- What is an *androginus*? (ד': א')
- How is an *androginus* similar to men? (ד': ב')
- How is an *androginus* similar to women? (ד': ג')
- How is an *androginus* similar to both men and women? (ד': ד')
- How is an *androginus* different to both men and women? (ד': ה')
-

שבת א': א' - ה'

- List the cases where one is *chayav* for transferring from one domain to another. (א': א')
- List the cases where one is *patur* (*aval assur*) for transferring from one domain to another (א': א')
- What are the five activities listed in the *Mishnah* that one is forbidden from beginning ‘close’ to *mincha gedolah*? (א': ב')
- Concerning the previous question, what is the law regarding those that have already engaged in those activities? (א': ב')
- Why did the *Chachamim* prevent a scribe from travelling with his quill on *erev Shabbat*? (א': ג')
- What was the basis for the concern regarding people reading by candle light? (א': ג')
- How many laws were decreed on the day that the students of *Beit Shammai* outnumbered the students of *Beit Hillel* in the attic of *Chananya ben Chizkiyah ben Guryon*? (א': ד')
- Explain the debate regarding whether one can place ingredients in water to soak for the production of ink on *erev Shabbat* if it will not be completed until *Shabbat*. (א': ה')

Shiurim

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Reuven Spolter
mishnah.co

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

APPS

Mishnah Yomit
mishnahyomit.com

All Mishnah
Orthodox Union

Mishna Yomi
Our Somayach, South Africa

Kehati

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
13 November י"ט חשוון	14 November כ' חשוון	15 November כ"א חשוון	16 November כ"ב חשוון	17 November כ"ג חשוון	18 November כ"ד חשוון	19 November כ"ה חשוון
Bikurim 3:9-10	Bikurim 3:11-12	Bikurim 4:1-2	Bikurim 4:3-4	Bikurim 4:5 - Shabbat 1:1	Shabbat 1:2-3	Shabbat 1:4-5

