Volume 19 Issue 1



# **Reciting Shema Late**

This week we completed one cycle of *Mishnah Yomit* and began the next, returning once again to *Berachot*. The *masechet* begins by discussing *keriyat Shema* with the second *Mishnah* focusing on the timing of the morning *Shema*. The *Mishnah* records the debate regarding the latest time to recite the *Shema* with the first opinion being sunrise and *R' Yossi* maintaining that one has the first three (halachic) hours to recite the *Shema*. After that time, the *Mishnah* explains, "he has not lost, he is like one that reads from the *Torah*". We shall try to understand this *Mishnah*.

Based on the *Gemara* (*Berachot* 10b) the *Bartenura* explains that despite passing the time to read *Shema*, he can still recite the *berachot* of *Shema*. It is the *berachot* that "he has not lost". The *Aruch HaShulchan* (592) cites the *Rashba* who explains that the *berachot* of *Shema* are not like the *berachot* recited before performing a *mitzvah* or reading the *Torah*. They were instituted independently a placed on either side of *Shema*. We can therefore understand why even if the time to recite *Shema* has passed, the *berachot* can still be said.

When the *Mishnah* continues that he is like one that reads from the *Torah*, the *Bartenura* explains that despite the fact the individual does not gain the merit of reciting the *Shema* in its proper time, he nonetheless gains the reward of one that reads the *Torah*. We find therefore, that the *Mishnah* is teaching two points regarding one that recites the *Shema* late. He can still say the *berachot* of *Shema* and he gains the reward of one that reads the *Torah*.

The *Tifferet Yisrael* however notes that there is still a limit regarding how late he can recite the *berachot*. This is the opinion of *R' Hai Gaon* cited by the *Rashba* and *Rosh*, that one has the first four (halachic) hours, to recite the *berachot*. After that point, reciting the *berachot* would constitute a *beracha le'vatala* and one would violate the prohibition of using *Hashem*'s name in vain. Indeed, this is the position of the *Tur* and *Shulchan Aruch*. This time limit is attached to *zeman tefillah* – the time in which on must pray *Shacharit*. Consequently, it would appear they understand that the *berachot* of *Shema* were instituted as part of the *tefillah*.

The *Rambam* however disagrees. He maintains that one could recite the *berachot* of *Shema* the entire day. This

would also appear to be the simple understanding of the *Gemara* that does not mention a time limit for reciting the *berachot*.

The Aruch HaShulchan (58:18) finds the Rambam's position difficult. If one has the entire day to recite the Shema then why is the Mishnah adding that "he is like one that reads from the Torah". It would seem unnecessary. According to R' Hai Gaon, the addition is understood since it is referring to one that recites the Shema after four hours. They can no longer recite the berachot, yet gain some reward.

Perhaps we can defend the position of the *Rambam* based on the comment of the *Ohr Gadol*. The *Ohr Gadol* questions the above understanding of the *Mishnah*. Firstly, why does the *Mishnah* need to teach that reading the *Shema* has the reward of reading *Torah*? That should be obvious since the *Shema* consists of sections from the *Torah*. Furthermore, the conclusion that one can still recite the *berachot* of *Shema* is not explicitly mentioned in the *Mishnah*. Finally, the *Beraita* cited in the *Gemara* reads as follows: "one who reads after that does not lose, like on that that reads from the *Torah*, **however** he can recite the two *berachot* prior [to *Shema*] and the one after." The use of the term "however" seems misplaced. According to the explanations thus far, it would have been more appropriate had it written, "**and** he can recite the two *berachot...*"

The *Ohr Gadol* therefore explains that the *Beraita* means that one who reads late is like one that reads the *Torah* in <u>shul</u> such that he can recite the *berachot* before and after. "However", the *berachot* one recites is different to those recited by one reading the *Torah* in *shul*. According to the *Ohr Gadol* the *berachot* of *Shema* were instituted in a similar manner to those *berachot* instituted before and after reading the *Torah* in public. This then would explain the position of the *Rambam*. The continuation of the *Mishnah* comparing him to one that reads from the *Torah* is coming to define the nature of the *berachot*. They are not like *berachot* recited before the performance of a *mitzvah* nor are they simply part of the *tefillah*. Instead, they are like *birkat ha'torah* recited in shul; special *berachot* of praise and can therefore be recited all day.

Yisrael Bankier

# **Revision Questions**

#### עוקצין גי אי - יייב

- Which food requires *hechsher* but not *machshava*? (ג׳:א׳)
- List some things that require both *machshava* and *hechsher*. (*x*::**c**)
- List the opinions regarding which wild vegetables do not require machshava. (د: :בי)
- Regarding the *neveilot* of which animal is there a difference between their location with respect to the requirement for *machshava?* (*v*<sub>2</sub>: *v*<sub>3</sub>)
- Which neveilot require machshava everywhere? (۲: ג׳)
- Which *neveilot* do not require *machshava* anywhere? (ג׳:ג׳)
- Which neveilot does R' Shimon add to those referred to in the previous question? (x: x)
- How can *shevet* lose its status and food and why is this important? (*x*': *x*')
- Which foods are not *metameh tumat ochlin* until they "sweeten"? (ג׳:ד׳)
- According to R' Akiva, what food is not metameh tumat ochlin but can be purchased with ma'aser sheni money? Who argues? (κ': הי)
- What other cases do they argue about? ('1: ')
- Explain the debate between *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* regarding hard grapes. Regarding *ketzach*. (*v*:*v*)
- Which wood can be purchased with *ma'aser sheni* money? (*x*: :)
- What food is considered food for *tumah* but is exempt from *ma'asrot*? (*v*::*v*)
- Explain the debate regarding when fish become susceptible to *tumah*. (*v*: -n')
- Explain the debate regarding a branch from a fig tree that breaks off but is still attached by its bark. ('n: 'x)
- How much of produce that was uprooted must still be attached to the ground for it to be *tahor*?
  (κ: :n:)
- Is milk from a neveilat beheima tehora tameh? (د: טי)
- Is the law different if it was a *beheima temeiah*? (*v*: :0)
- For what else is this law important? (ג׳ :ט׳)
- When do *tameh* fish require *machshava*? (ג׳:ט׳)
- Explain the debate regarding whether a beehive that is resting on the floor is considered attached. (*v*: *v*)
- What are the three laws brought that are practical ramifications of this debate? (r: r)
- Explain the debate regarding when honeycomb can become *tameh* on account of being liquid.
  (x': :'v)
- According to *R' Yehoshua ben Levi*, how many worlds are the righteous are destined to inherit?
  (ג׳:׳יב)
- What is the only "utensil" that *Hashem* was able to find that can contain *bracha?* (גי: יייב)

#### ברכות אי אי-בי

- When is the starting time for *kriyat sh'ma* at night? (אי: אי)
- What are the three opinions regarding the latest time that one can recite *sh'ma* at night?
  (ν: ν)
- For what *mitzvah*, other than *kriyat sh'ma*, did the *Chachamim* bring forward the latest time that one can perform the *mitzvah* "to prevent one from transgressing"? (κ':κ')
- What are the two opinions regarding the starting time for *kriyat sh'ma* in the morning?
  (ν:εν)
- What are the two opinions regarding the latest time that one can recite *sh'ma* in the morning?
  (ν: : : ν)
- If the time for reading *sh'ma* in the morning has passed (but the *zman t'fillah* has not been completed) can one read *sh'ma* with the *brachot kriyat sh'ma*? (κ':ε')

# Local Shiurim

בס״ד

## Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday 10 minutes before *Mincha* <u>Mizrachi Shul</u> Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat 10 minutes before *Mincha* <u>Mizrachi Shul</u> Melbourne, Australia

> **Efrat, Israel** *Shiur in English*

## Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf 9:00am <u>Kollel Magen Avraham</u> Reemon Neighbourhood

## **ONLINE SHIURIM**

Yisrael Bankier mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld Rabbi C. Brown http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calend ars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

### SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss In US dial: 718 906 6400 Then select: 1 - 2 - 4

#### Tuesday Wednesday Thursday שבת קודש Sunday Monday Friday 26 December 27 December 28 December 29 December 30 December 31 December 1 January כייב טבת כייג טבת כייד טבת כייה טבת כייו טבת כייז טבת כייח טבת Berachot 1:3-Berachot 1:5-Berachot 2:2-Berachot 2:4-Berachot 2:6-Berachot 2:8-Berachot 3:2-4 2:1 3 5 7 3:1 3

# Next Week's Mishnayot...