



Stone Trolley

The twenty-fourth *perek* of *masechet Keilim* discusses different types of *keilim* and teaches that depending on their form and use, they can be susceptible to *tumat midras*, *tumat met* or not susceptible to *tumah* at all. The second *Mishnah* discusses trolleys. The *Mishnah* teaches that the type of trolley that is not susceptible to *tumah* is one for transporting large stones. The *Bartenura* explains that the reason is because the trolley is formed more like a mesh with holes larger than the size of pomegranates. Recall that if a *kli* was perforated with a hole that size, it is considered broken and no longer susceptible to *tumah*.

The *Bartenura*'s explanation is based on *R' Yochanan*'s comment in the *Gemara* (*Shabbat* 84a), who explains that if the holes in this wagon were less than size of pomegranates, then the trolley would be susceptible to *tumah*.

The *Mishnah Achrona* however finds this *Gemara* difficult. If the trolley was originally design for carrying bricks, the size of the holes should not matter. That is how this *kli* is designed to function and it should therefore be susceptible to *tumah*. Indeed, the *Rambam* rules in line with this logic (*Hilchot Keilim* 6:3).

Before continuing with the *Mishnah Achrona* we should include the answer of the *Sefat Emet* to this question. The *Sefat Emet* (*Shabbat* 84a, *BeRashi*) suggests that indeed it is true that if the *kli* was designed from the outset to function with such large holes then it is susceptible to *tumah*. If however the *kli* itself did not have those holes and was designed to be used in a different capacity and then was perforated such that it is considered broken, repurposing it later to carry stones does not render it a *kli*

– does not make it susceptible to *tumah*.¹ Our *Mishnah* would then be discussing such a case.

The *Tifferet Yisrael* also cites the *Rambam*, but notes that the *Rambam* continues that if a *kli* that was designed with a large hole was a majority torn then it is not susceptible to *tumah*. The *Tifferet Yisrael* therefore suggest that in our cases since the trolley is full of such large holes, it is no longer consider a *kli* or susceptible to *tumah*.

The *Mishnah Achrona* however also notes that when this *perek* discusses the type of *keilim* that are *tahor*, it is not because they are broken – there is specific technical reason. Consequently, it is difficult to understand that the reason why the trolley is *tameh* is because it has a large hole in it that renders it broken. Furthermore, if that were the case, why did the *Mishnah* need to list this case as a trolley used for stones? Instead it could have mentioned a generic trolley that has a hole and taught the same law.

The *Mishnah Achrona* therefore explains that a *kli* that is susceptible to *tumah* has *beit kibul* – acts as a container. The *Mishnah Achrona* suggests that it is only considered a *beit kibul* if it contains it contents along with the base **and** walls – much like a sack. A trolley that contains large stones does not need the walls to keep the stones in place, due to their weight. He suggests that when *R' Yohanan* mentions the size of the holes in the trolley, it is because it is indicative of the size of the stones that it is designed to carry. If the holes were smaller, then it is designed to carry smaller stones and the walls would be required to contain them. That trolley would have a *beit kibul* and be susceptible to *tumah*.

Yisrael Bankier

¹ The *Sefat Emet* however notes that *Rashi* (95b, s.v. *VeAdayin*) and *Tosfot* (*Chulin* 55a, s.v. *shiuran*) disagree and if it was repurposed for large stones it would be susceptible to *tumah*. He however continues that the explanation could work with the opinion of *R' Chananel*.

Revision Questions

כלים כ"ב: י' – כ"ד: ח'

- What is the law regarding an *aslah*, where the leather separates from the frame? (כ"ב: י')
- What other case is similar to the previous one and how does it differ? (כ"ב: י')
- What is the law regarding a bench where one of the legs is made of stone? (כ"ב: י')
- When is a *kankilin* susceptible to *tumah*? (כ"ב: י')
- When does the stuffing of an item that is torn transmit and not transmit the *tumah* of the item? Provide examples from the *Mishnah* for both cases. (כ"ג: א')
- List some items that are susceptible to *tumah* through *merkav*. (כ"ג: ב')
- What is the difference between *tumah* through *merkav* and *moshav*? (כ"ג: ג')
- When is a *tafit* of a donkey susceptible to *tumah*? (כ"ג: ג')
- Is a bed set aside for use of corpses susceptible to *tumat midras*? (כ"ג: ד')
- What is the opinion of *R' Yosi* regarding the susceptibility to *tumat midras* of a *kise she kalla*? (כ"ג: ד')
- Is a fish net susceptible to *tumah*? (כ"ג: ה')
- List some traps that are susceptible to *tumah* and some that are not? (כ"ג: ה')
- What are the three *trisin* and how do they differ from each other? (כ"ד: א')
- What are the three *agalot* and how do they differ from each other? (כ"ד: ב')
- What are the three *areivot* and how do they differ from each other? (כ"ד: ג')
- What are the three *teivot* and how do they differ from each other? (כ"ד: ד')
- What are the three *tarbusin* and how do they differ from each other? (כ"ד: ה')
- What are the three *basisayot* and how do they differ from each other? (כ"ד: ו')
- What are the three *pinksayot* and how do they differ from one another? (כ"ד: ז')
- What are the three beds and how do they differ from one another? (כ"ד: ח')

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
15 November כ"ח חשוון	16 November כ"ט חשוון	17 November א' כסלו	18 November ב' כסלו	19 November ג' כסלו	20 November ד' כסלו	21 November ה' כסלו
Keilim 24:9-10	Keilim 24:11-12	Keilim 24:13-14	Keilim 24:15-16	Keilim 24:17-25:1	Keilim 25:2-3	Keilim 25:4-5

