



## Doubtful Chatat

The *Mishnah* (1:4) discusses cases where one must bring a *korban*, yet the *korban* cannot be consumed. The two cases brought are if a woman miscarries but there is a doubt regarding whether what she delivered obligated her to bring a *korban* (normally required after a woman gives birth). The second case is where two women miscarry, where one's delivery would require her to bring a *korban* and the other's would not, yet the two deliveries got mixed up.

Normally, if required, she would need to bring a pair of birds, a *chatat* (sin-offering) and *olah* (fully burnt offering). The blood from the *chatat* is cast on the *mizbeach* and the rest of the bird is given to the *kohanim* to consume. In this case, where the obligation is doubtful, the *chatat* is still offered, yet the bird is treated like an invalid *korban* and burnt. This is because, if the offering was not required, then the bird is considered like a regular bird that was not given a valid *shechita* and cannot be consumed. Regarding the *olah* however, since they can be offered voluntarily, she can stipulate that if she is not obligated to offer the *olah*, then it should be considered a voluntary offering.

*R' Yossi* in the *Mishnah* disagrees regarding the second case, where the deliveries of the two women got mixed up. He explains that each of the women would only be required to bring their own "doubtful" offering if they parted ways. If however they came to the *Beit HaMikdash* together, then they can present a pair of birds and the *kohen* can stipulate that they are to be offered for she that truly requires them. In that case they can be offered as certain offerings and the *chatat* can be consumed. What is the basis of this debate? Why do the *Chachamim* not accept *R' Yossi's* solution?

The *Griz*<sup>1</sup> provides the following answer in the name of the *Grach*. The *Gemara* in *Nazir* (29a) asks how a *yoledet* (a woman who gave birth) or *zava* can offer a *korban*, if the obligation to do so is in doubt. Note that a source is necessary considering that if she is not obligated, a regular animal is being slaughtered in the *Beit Hamikdash* which is normally prohibited. The *Gemara* cites the *pasuk* that connects the *korbanot* of a male and female – "concerning a person who has his flow, whether man or woman" (*Vayikra* 15:33). The *Gemara* learns that just as a male must bring *korbanot* in the case of a doubt so too must a female. In other words, just like if a man were to have a doubt regarding a prohibition that is punishable with *karet*, the *Torah* requires him to offer an *asham talui*, so too a *yoledet* or *zava* whose obligation to bring a *korban* is in doubt, must also offer the *chatat* bird offering (even though it is not consumed).

The *Grach* explains that the *asham talui* is a definite *korban* obligated by the *Torah*. In other words, despite the doubtful origin, as long as the doubt is not resolved, there is a clear obligation to bring this *korban*. The *Chachamim* argue with *R' Yossi* since our case of *safek chatat ha'ohf* (a *chatat* bird offering brought in a case of doubt) is learnt from the *asham talui*. They therefore understand that each of these ladies has an obligation to bring their own *korban*. Recall that *R' Yossi* maintains that bringing the *korbanot* together would resolve the doubt, thereby allowing the *korbanot* to be considered definite for she that truly required it. According to the *Chachamim* however, since they are each obligated to bring the *safek chatat ha'ohf*, offering the pair together will not discharge them of their obligation.

*Yisrael Bankier*

<sup>1</sup> *Mechusarei Kipurim* 1:5, cited by the *Yalkut Bi'urim Metivta, Keritut* 7b.

**Revision Questions**

תמורה וי:הי - זי:הי

- Is it considered *temurah* if one says “this animal is in place of a *chatat*”? (הי:הי)
- What is the difference if one declares, regarding an animal unfit for a *korban*, that it is “an *olah*” (הרי אלו עולה) or it is “for an *olah*” (הרי אלו לעולה)? (וי:הי)
- List the eight animals that cannot be offered on the *mizbeach*. (יא:הי)
- What is the law if these animals are mixed with many others? (יא:הי)
- What is the case of an *etnan*? (יב:הי)
- Provide two examples of a *mechir kelev*. (יג:הי)
- What is the source for why a *mechir zonah* and *etnan kelev* are *mutar* to offer on the *mizbeach*? (יג:הי)
- What other law is learnt from that *pasuk*? (יד:הי)
- Does the law of *etnan zonah* apply to money? (יד:הי)
- What is the rule regarding to what items the law of *etnan zonah* applies? (יד:הי)
- What is the source for why the law of *etnan zonah* applies to birds and why would we have thought otherwise? (יד:הי)
- Explain the debate regarding whether a *vlad treifah* can be used as a *korban*? (טו:הי)
- What does *R' Channinah ben Antignos* add to the list of animals that cannot be used as a *korban*? (טו:הי)
- What is the law regarding a *korban* that became a *treifah*? (טז:הי)
- What laws apply to *kodshei mizbeach* that do not apply to *kodshei bedek ha'bayit*? (טז:הי)
- What four laws apply to *kodshei bedek ha'bayit* that do not apply to *kodshei mizbeach*? (טז:הי)
- What laws listed apply equally to both and which one is the subject of a debate? (טז:הי)
- What are the *issurei hana'ah* that must be buried and which one is the subject of a debate? (טז:הי)
- What are the *issurei hana'ah* that must be burnt? (טז:הי-יז)
- How does *tameh trumah* differ from those items referred to in the previous question? (יז:הי)
- Is one allowed to burn that which must be buried? (יז:הי)

כריתות א' א-ז

- How many prohibitions listed in the *Torah* are punishable with *karet*? (Hard: Can you list them?) (א:א)
- What must one do if they violated one of the prohibitions unintentionally? (ב:א)
- What must one do if they are unsure whether they violated one of these prohibitions? (ב:א)
- Explain the debate regarding the exception to rule discussed in the previous question. (ב:א)
- When would a *yoledet* bring a *korban chatat* and:
  - It be consumed? (ג:א)
  - It not be consumed? (ג:א)
- When would a *yoledet* not bring a *korban* at all? (ה:א)
- Explain the debate between *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* regarding a woman that miscarries on the eighty-first night after giving birth to a girl. (ו:א)
- What is the law regarding a woman that has experienced multiple births and it is doubtful in each case whether she must bring a *korban*? (ז:א)
- What did *Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel* do to fight the inflated price of birds? (ז:א)

**Melbourne, Australia**

**Sunday -Thursday**  
10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
Melbourne, Australia

**Friday & Shabbat**  
10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
Melbourne, Australia

**Efrat, Israel**  
*Shiur in English*

**Sunday -Thursday**  
Rabbi Mordechai Scharf  
9:00am  
Kollel Magen Avraham  
Reemon Neighbourhood

**ONLINE SHIURIM**

*Yisrael Bankier*  
[mishnahyomit.com/shiurim](http://mishnahyomit.com/shiurim)

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
[www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/](http://www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/)

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

**SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON**

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
In US dial: 718 906 6400  
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

**Next Week's Mishnayot...**

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
24 May א' סיון	25 May ב' סיון	26 May ג' סיון	27 May ד' סיון	28 May ה' סיון	29 May ו' סיון	30 May ז' סיון
Keritot 2:1-2	Keritot 2:3-4	Keritot 2:5-6	Keritot 3:1-2	Keritot 3:3-4	Keritot 3:5-6	Keritot 3:7-8

