



## Communal and Individual Korbanot

The second *perek* of *Temurah* begins by comparing private and communal *korbanot* (*korban tzibbur* and *korban yachid*). One difference raised in the *Mishnah* is that the offering of a *korban tzibbur* overrides *Shabbat* and *tumah*, which is not the case for a *korban yachid*. In other words, a *korban tzibbur* can be offered on *Shabbat* and may also be offered even if the *kohanim* and/or community are *tameh*. *R' Meir* however argues that we find private *korbanot* that also override *Shabbat* and *tumah*. *R' Meir* lists *chavitei kohen gadol* (the daily *mincha* offering brought by the *kohen gadol*) and the *par yom kippurim* (the bull brought by the *kohen gadol* on *yom kippur*) as two such cases. We shall analyse this debate.

The above introduction makes an assumption, that itself is debatable, i.e. that there is a debate in our *Mishnah*. The *Bartenura* writes that the *halacha* goes according to the opinion of *R' Meir*. The necessity of this ruling presumes that there is indeed a debate in our *Mishnah*.

The *Tosfot Yom Tov* however cites the *Rambam's* commentary on the *Mishnah* who explains that, "the explanation that *R' Meir* brings is true and undisputed". The *Tosfot Yom Tov* concludes that the first opinion in the *Mishnah* agrees that the *chavitei kohen gadol* and *par yom kippurim* also override *Shabbat* and *tumah*. Consequently, with respect to practical *halacha* there is no argument.

The *Tosfot Chadashim* however defends the *Bartenura* arguing that whether *tumah* override *Pesach Sheni* would still divide the *Tana Kama* and *R' Meir*. The *Tosfot Chadashim* directs us to *Gemara Yoma* (50a) where *R' Meir* argues that *Pesach Sheni* would

override *tumah* since, if not offered, there would be no opportunity to bring it again.

Why would the *Tana Kama* agree with the *minchat chavitin* and *par yom kippurim* but disagree with *Pesach Sheni*?

The *Tifferet Yisrael* explains that the *Tana Kama* still considers the former as if they are public offerings. Despite the fact that an individual funds them, it is an obligation on the community that they be brought. With *Pesach Sheni* however everyone would agree that it is considered an individual's offering.

The *Tosfot R' Peretz* (*Yoma* 50a) explains that the *Tana Kama* considers the *par yom ha'kippurim* as a communal offering since it atones not only for the *kohen gadol* but also from the *kohanim*. Similarly the *Tana Kama* considers the *minchat chavitin* a communal offering since, as we have learnt, if the *kohen gadol* dies and there is a delay before appointing the next *kohen gadol*, the *minchat chavitin* is still offered and funded by the community.

The *Tosfot Chadashim* continues that the *Rambam* does not rule like *R' Meir* since the *Mishnah* in *Pesachim* rules that *Pesach Sheni* only overrides *Shabbat* and not *tumah*. The *Tifferet Yisrael* explains that the reason *Pesach Sheni* does not override *tumah* is because those that bring this *korban* are (generally) people that were *tameh* and could not offer their *korban* on *Pesach*. Consequently if an individual who is *tameh* cannot bring the *korban pesach*, they cannot offer this *korban* on *pesach sheni* if they are *tameh*.

*Yisrael Bankier*

**Revision Questions**

תמורה א' א' - ג' ה'

- What is a *temurah*? (א' א')
- What is the punishment for one that is *me'mir*? (א' א')
- Can a *kohen* perform a *temurah* on a *Yisrael's korban*? (א' א')
- Regarding the previous question, which *korban* is a subject of debate? Explain the debate. (א' א')
- What is law is learnt from the following *pasuk*: (ב' א')  
"לא יחליפנו ולא ימיר אתו, טוב ברע או רע בטוב"
- Explain the debate regarding whether *temurah* applies if one attempts to exchange many animals for one. (ב' א')
- In which case does *R' Yosi* maintain that *temurah* applies to limbs? (א' ג')
- What are the three cases of "אין ה... אלא לפי חשבון"? Explain. (א' ד')
- Is there "*temurah* after *temurah*"? Explain. (א' ה')
- What other cases are brought similar to the one in the previous question? (א' ה')
- Explain the debate whether *temurah* applies to the offspring of a *korban*. (א' ה')
- Does *temurah* apply to bird offerings? (א' ו')
- Does *temurah* apply to public sacrifices? (א' ו')
- What are the opinions regarding the source of why *temurah* does not apply to *korbanot bedek ha' bait*? (א' ו')
- What three laws apply to private *korbanot* that do not apply to public *korbanot*? (ב' א')
- What applies to public *korbanot* that does not apply to private *korbanot*? (ב' א')
- Explain the debate regarding whether the rule of *chatat met* applies to public sacrifices and what is the case that is debated? (ב' ב')
- In what three ways is *kodshim* stricter than *temurah*? (ב' ג')
- In what two ways is *temurah* stricter than *kodshim*? (ב' ג')
- Regarding the previous question, what case does *R' Yehuda* add? (ב' ג')
- What happened to a *korban* if, according to *R' Elazar*, it can no longer make a *temurah*? (ב' ג')
- What is debated regarding the offspring of a *korban shlamim*? (א' ג')
- What is the difference between the offering of a *korban todah* and a *temurat todah*? (ב' ג')
- Explain the debate regarding the male offspring of a *korban olah*. (ג' ג')
- Explain the debate regarding one that separated a female animal for a *korban asham*. (ג' ג')
- Explain the debate regarding a *temurat asham*. What else is debated in a similar manner? (ג' ג')
- Regarding a *temurat asham* what is the difference between the opinions of the *Tana Kama* and *R' Elazar*? (ג' ד')
- What is the law regarding a *temurat bechor*? (ה' ג')
- What are the three differences between a *bechor behema* and *ma'aser behema*, and other *kodshim* animals? (ה' ג')
- According to *R' Shimon* why is a *bechor behema* not brought from outside Israel? (ה' ג')

**Melbourne, Australia**

**Sunday -Thursday**  
10 minutes before *Mincha Mizrachi Shul*  
Melbourne, Australia

**Friday & Shabbat**  
10 minutes before *Mincha Mizrachi Shul*  
Melbourne, Australia

**Efrat, Israel**  
*Shiur in English*

**Sunday -Thursday**  
Rabbi Mordechai Scharf  
9:00am  
Kollel Magen Avraham  
Reemon Neighbourhood

**ONLINE SHIURIM**

*Yisrael Bankier*  
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calend  
ars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

**SHIUR  
ON KOL HALOSHON**

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
In US dial: 718 906 6400  
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

**Next Week's Mishnayot...**

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
10 May ט"ז אייר	11 May י"ז אייר	12 May י"ח אייר	13 May י"ט אייר	14 May כ' אייר	15 May כ"א אייר	16 May כ"ב אייר
Temurah 4:1-2	Temurah 4:3-4	Temurah 5:1-2	Temurah 5:3-4	Temurah 5:5-6	Temurah 6:1-2	Temurah 6:3-4

