



Gid HaNasheh of a non-Kosher Animal

The *Mishnah* (7:6) records the debate regarding whether the prohibition of the *gid ha'nasheh* applies to non-kosher animals. The *Chachamim* maintain that it only applies to kosher animals whereas *R' Yehuda* disagrees. *R' Yehuda* argues that we find that the prohibition of *gid ha'nasheh* was recorded after *Yaakov* grappled with the angel. At that time, which was prior to the giving of the *Torah*, there was no distinction between kosher and non-kosher animals. Consequently, the prohibition applies to all animals. The *Chachamim* however respond that the prohibition was given at *har sinai* yet recorded in the *Torah* by the incident with *Yaakov* and the angel. In other words, when the *Torah* writes "... and therefore *Bnei Yisrael* were commanded not to consume the *gid ha'nasheh*" it is to be understood as stating "... and therefore *Bnei Yisrael* were commanded later at *har sinai* not consume the *gid ha'nasheh*".

According to the *Bartenura*, the *mitzvah* was only given at *sinai* yet *Moshe* recorded it by the incident. The *Beit Shaul* however finds this explanation difficult. Considering that the *Torah* predated the creation of the world, suggesting that *Moshe* would rearrange it appears odd. The *Beit Shaul* therefore directs us to the *Rambam* who explains that the *avot* did receive *mitzvot* prior to *Sinai*, e.g. *Avraham* received the *mitzvah* of *brit milah*. Nevertheless, what obligates us in the performance of these *mitzvot* is that they were given again at *Sinai* – "*torah tzivah lanu Moshe*".

The *Beit Shaul* uses the *Rambam* to explain another debate. The *Gemara* (*Yoma* 28b) cites the opinion of *Rav Safra* that learns the earliest time for *mincha* from *Avraham*. *R' Yosef* questions whether one can learn laws from *Avraham*. The *Beit Shaul* explains that everyone agrees that the core obligation is not derived from *Avraham* – that can only be from *Sinai*. Nevertheless, *Rav Safra* however maintains that the details of a law can be learnt from *Avraham*.

The *Gemara* however provides a different reason for the position of the *Chachamim*. According to *R' Yehuda*, even if the *mitzvah* was given prior to *Har Sinai*, there are two prohibitions at play, one *gid ha'nasheh* and the other that this animal is not *kosher*. Since the animals begin to develop prior to the *gid ha'nasheh* forming the prohibition of a non-kosher animals exists first and we have an issue of *ein issur*

chal al issur. In other words, once a prohibition exists, in general a further prohibition cannot apply to that item. The *Gemara* however explains that according to *R' Yehuda* this case is one of the exceptions to the rule, since *gid ha'nasheh* is an *issur chamur* – extreme prohibition – in that according to *R' Yehuda* this prohibition also applies to *bnei noach*.

The *Gemara* explains the position of the *Chachamim* in two ways. Either they maintain that the *gid* has a flavour yet disagree with *R' Yehuda* arguing that we do have an issue of *ein issur chal al issur*. Alternatively, the *gid* does not have a flavour, and there is potentially only one prohibition to be concerned about – *gid ha'nasheh*. Nevertheless, since the *Torah* states "therefore *Bnei Yisrael* shall not eat the *gid ha'nasheh*", it implies we are dealing with an animal about which the rest of it may be consumed. Considering that the *Chachamim* have a logical position that is not based on the when the *mitzvah* was given, why was the timing raised in their response in the *Mishnah*?

The *Rashba* (102a) answers that the *Chachamim* in our *Mishnah* were working according to *R' Yehuda's* position. Granted that according to the *Chachamim* the chronology is irrelevant, according to *R' Yehuda*, for who the chronology is important, they argue that the *mitzvah* was given at *Sinai*. Considering the *Rambam* above, countering *R' Yehuda* with this line of reasoning also teaches us the important principle regarding *mitzvot* prior to *Har Sinai*.

The *Rosh Yosef* (cited in the *Ilkut Bi'urim*) however explains that *R' Yehuda's* statement regarding the chronology was made to counter the position of the *Chachamim*. If they maintained *ein issur chal al issur*, then at the time of *Yaakov Avinu*, all meat was permitted – there was no other *issur*. Alternatively, if the *Chachamim's* position was based on the *pasuk* that it only applied to animal's whose meat was permitted for consumption, then at that time all meat was permitted. Consequently, that *pasuk*, when given, applied to all animals. This then explains why the *Chachamim* respond that the *pasuk* was referring not to the time of *Yaakov Avinu*, but rather when the *mitzvah* was given at *Har Sinai*.

Yisrael Bankier

Revision Questions

חולין ז' א' – ט' ב'

- To which animals does the prohibition of *gid hanasheh* apply? (ז' א')
- Explain the debate whether the prohibition of *gid hanasheh* applies to a foetus. (ז' א')
- Can a butcher be trusted to say that they removed the *gid hanasheh*? (ז' א')
- Can one gain benefit from the *gid hanasheh*? What case is brought as an example of this law? (ז' ב')
- Is one liable to lashes if he ate a complete *gid hanasheh* that was less than a *kezayit* in size? (ז' ג')
- Why does *R' Yehuda* maintain that if one eats the *gid hanasheh* from both legs of the animal is he liable to only one set of lashes? (ז' ג')
- What is the law if a thigh was cooked with the *gid hanasheh*? (ז' ד')
- What is the law regarding a piece of *neveilah* that was cooked with other pieces of meat? (ז' ה')
- Regarding the previous question, what is the law regarding the sauce? (ז' ה')
- Explain the debate regarding whether the prohibition of *gid hanasheh* applies to non-kosher animals. (ז' ו')
- Meat from which animals does the prohibition of *basar b'chalav* apply? (ז' ח')
- Regarding which two other laws does this definition of meat apply? (ז' ח')
- What debate relating to *basar b'chalav* does *Beit Shammai* take a lenient stance? (ז' ח')
- In what manner is one allowed to wrap meat and cheese in the same napkin? (ז' ח' ב')
- Regarding whom does *Rabban Shimon ben Gamliel* allow to eat meat and milk at the same table? (ז' ח' ב')
- What is the law regarding a drop of milk that falls onto a piece of meat in a boiling pot? (ז' ח' ג')
- What is the exception to the rule in the previous question? (ז' ח' ג')
- What must one do in order to cook and eat the udder of a cow? (ז' ח' ג')
- Does the prohibition of *basar b'chalav* apply to non-kosher animals? (ז' ח' ד')
- What is the law regarding cheese that was made using the stomach of an animal? (ז' ח' ה')
- How is the prohibition of *cheilev* stricter than blood? (ז' ח' ו')
- How is the prohibition of blood stricter than *cheilev*? (ז' ח' ו')
- For which type of *tumah* can the hooves combine with the meat to make up the minimum *shiur*? For which type of *tumah* do they not combine? (ז' ח' ט')
- What other case is brought where there is a similar difference between these two forms of *tumah*? (ז' ח' ט')
- What part of the hide of an animal has the status of meat? (ז' ח' ט' ב')
- For all the skins/hides listed in the *Mishnah* that have a status of meat, when can they lose that status? (ז' ח' ט' ב')
- What does *R' Yochanan ben Nuri* add to this list? (ז' ח' ט' ב')

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
23 February כ"ח שבט	24 February כ"ט שבט	25 February ל' שבט	26 February א' אדר	27 February ב' אדר	28 February ג' אדר	29 February ד' אדר
Chulin 9:3-4	Chulin 9:5-6	Chulin 9:7-8	Chulin 10:1-2	Chulin 10:3-4	Chulin 11:1-2	Chulin 12:1-2

