



No Oil, No Frankincense

The fifth *perek* compares the various *mincha* offerings by way of the laws that apply to them. One such case lists the *mincha* offering that require oil and/or frankincense or neither. The *minchat choteh* (sin offering) and *minchat kena'ot* (brought by the *sotah*) are *mincha* offering that require neither. The *Mishnah* (5:4) teaches that adding oil and frankincense to the *minchat choteh* would constitute the violation of two prohibitions. The *Bartenura* explains that this is based on the *pasuk* "you shall not place on it oil and you shall not place on it frankincense". Put simply, not only is oil and frankincense not required, it is prohibited to add them. We shall try to understand this prohibition.

The *Tosfot R' Akiva Eiger* cite the *Tosfot* who explain that even if one added oil first, which would thereby render the *mincha* invalid, and then added frankincense, one would still be liable to both prohibitions. He continues citing the *R' Tam*, who takes the opposite position. The *R' Tam* argues that one would only violate both prohibitions if the oil was placed on one *minchat choteh* and the frankincense on another, or if they were simultaneously placed on one *mincha* offering. In other words, according to the *R' Tam*, one would not violate the prohibition when adding frankincense to an invalid *korban*.

The *Tosfot's* comments are on the following *Beraita* (*Menachot* 60a):

"Do not place oil and do not place...", it is possible that the *Torah* is referring to two *kohanim*? The *pasuk* teaches "on it" – the *Torah* is referring to the *mincha* offering and not to the *kohen*.

The *Tosfot* understand that the initial assumption was that two *kohanim*, or more accurately, two *mincha* offerings were required to violate both prohibitions. Otherwise, once the oil was added, the *mincha* offering is already invalid. The *Beraita* however concludes that the *Torah* teaches that even in that case, the second prohibition would be violated.

The *R' Tam* however views the *Beraita* in the opposite way. The assumption was the one could violate both prohibitions if two *kohanim* each added oil and frankincense to the same *mincha* offering. The *Beraita* could have asked the question regarding one *kohen*, however in the *Beit HaMikdash* they would involve as many *kohanim* as possible to give honour to the *mitzvah* (*berov am hadrat melech*). The *Beraita* concludes that "on it" implies that the prohibitions apply only when adding to a valid *korban*.

The *Rambam* (*Maaseh Korbanot* 12:8) however teaches that, "if one placed [the oil and frankincense] and then offered [the *minchat choteh*] they would receive lashes for adding the oil independently, and for adding the frankincense independently." The *Rambam* therefore has a different understanding of the above *Beraita*. The *Griz* (stencil s.v. "lo") explains that the initial assumption was that the prohibitions applied to the act of adding the oil and frankincense. Were that the case, then indeed more than one *kohen* could violate the prohibition. The *Beraita* concludes that "on it" implies that the prohibitions relate to the *mincha* offering itself. In other words, it is the *kohen* that offers the *minchat choteh* with the oil and frankincense that violates these prohibitions and not the *kohen* that added the prohibited ingredients.

Yisrael Bankier

Revision Questions

מנחות ה' ד' – ז' א'

- How many transgressions would one violate if they included both oil and frankincense in a *mincha* that did not require it? (ה' ד')
- Regarding the previous question, do these prohibitions apply to the *shirayim*? (ה' ד')
- Which *mincha* offerings requires:
 - Waving and *hagasha*?
 - Only Waving? (ה' ו')
 - Only *hagasha*? (ה' ה')
 - Neither? (ה' ו')
- Of the three *mitzvot* (*semicha*, *tenufah shechutim* and *tenufah chayim*) which apply to: (ה' ז')
 - *Shalmei yachid*?
 - *Zivchei shalmei tzibur*?
 - *Asham metzora*?
- What is the difference between a *minchat machavat* and a *minchat marcheset*? (ה' ח')
- Explain the debate regarding what method can be employed to a bake a *minchat ma'afeh tanur*. (ה' ט')
- On which *menachot* is *kemitza* performed and the remainder given to the *kohanim*? (ה' א')
- From which *menachot* do the *kohanim* not receive anything? (ה' ב')
- From which *menachot* is nothing placed on the *mizbeach*? (ה' ב')
- How many times is oil added regarding a *minchat marcheset*? (ה' ג')
- Explain the debate regarding when the *minchat ma'afeh tanur* is mixed with oil? (ה' ג')
- Explain how *petitah* is performed for both a *minchat Yisrael* and a *minchat kohen*? (ה' ד')
- What two processes are required to be performed to the wheat of all *mincha* sacrifices? (ה' ו')
- According *R' Yehuda* which *mincha offering* are brought in numbers of ten and how does *R' Meir* argue? (ה' ה')
- How much flower was required for the following sacrifices and how were they refined: (ה' ו')
 - *Omer*?
 - *Shtei Halechem*?
 - *Lechem Ha'panim*?
- How many sieves were used to sift: (ה' ז')
 - The barley for the *omer*?
 - The flour for the *shtei halechem*?
 - The flour for the *lechem ha'panim*?
- What constituted the *lachmei todah*? (ה' ז')

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday
10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat
10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel
Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday
Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calend
ars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

**SHIUR
ON KOL HALOSHON**

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
29 December א' טבת	30 December ב' טבת	31 December ג' טבת	1 January ד' טבת	2 January ה' טבת	3 January ו' טבת	4 January ז' טבת
Menachot 7:2-3	Menachot 7:4-5	Menachot 7:6-8:1	Menachot 8:2-3	Menachot 8:4-5	Menachot 8:6-7	Menachot 9:1-2

