



Two People Performing a Melacha

The *Mishnah* (10:5) teaches that if one carries a loaf of bread from a private domain into the public domain, they have violated the prohibition of carrying on *Shabbat*. If however two people carry the loaf, they would be exempt – meaning they would not have violated the biblical prohibition, yet it is nevertheless prohibited on a rabbinic level. If however carrying the loaf requires both parties, then the *Chachamim* and *R' Shimon* debate whether they are exempt, with *R' Shimon* maintaining it is still the case. Let us try to understand the exemption in the first case.

Rashi (*Shabbat* 92b, s.v. *R' Yehuda poter*) explains that when two people carry a small item that is ordinarily carried only by one person, the exemption is because they are carrying the object in an abnormal way. This then is consistent with the earlier *Mishnah* (10:3) where we learnt that one is only liable if they carry an object in the regular fashion.

The *Bartenura* however explains that the exemption is based on the following *pasuk* (*Vayikra* 4:27): “If an individual person from among the people of the land shall sin unintentionally, by committing it – one of the commandments of *Hashem* that may not be done – and he becomes guilty”. The *Gemara* understands from the work *be'asotah* (by committing it) that one is only liable to bring a *korban* if they perform the entire *melacha*. In the case where only one is required to carry the item, yet it is carried by two, then it is considered as if neither performed the entire *melacha*.

Two other understanding arise out of the explanation of another case. The *Gemara* explains that if an item is carried by two people with only one able to carry the item on their own, then one person is *chayav* (liable). The

Gemara asks which of the two are *chayav*. *R' Chisda* explains that it is the capable one that is *chayav*. *R' Hamnuna* however asks that the second person is nonetheless assisting. *R' Chisda* however explains that assistance alone is not significant.

The *Ramban* asks, how could *R' Chisda* think that the person incapable of carrying the item would be liable? He explains that considering our case where neither can carry the item, we find that despite the fact they are assisting one another, their actions are significant and they are both *chayav*. *R' Chisda* therefore differentiates between the two cases. In the case where each are required to carry the loaf, since if without the involvement of both the *melacha* could not be performed, it is as if each of them performed the entire *melacha* and neither are considered “assisting”.

The *Ramban* cites another explanation in the name of *R' Moshe ben R' Yosef*. He explains that the doubt regarding which of the two are *chayav* was based on the following consideration. Is the one that was capable liable since he performed the core action? Or is the one that is unable to carry the item alone since he is the one exerting all his force? The latter consideration is similar to the case where neither is capable on their own since both are exerting all their energy to carry the item. *R' Chisda* therefore clarified the doubt.

From the *Ramban* we find two different understandings why in our case both people are *chayav*. According to the *Ramban* it is because since the *melacha* depends on both of them it is as if each performed the entire *melacha*. According to *R' Moshe ben Yosef* it is because each exert their full force. The *Ramban* however finds this second understanding difficult.

Yisrael Bankier

Revision Questions

שבת טי:ג – י"א:ג

- From where do we learn that one may wash a child on the third day after the *brit millah*, even if it is *Shabbat*? (טי:ג)
- From where do we learn that a red thread is tied to the *se'ir ha'mishtaleach* on *Yom Kippur*? (טי:ג)
- To what is the act of anointing on *Yom Kippur* compared? (ד:ט)
- What is the minimum measure that one is liable for carrying, when carrying:
 - Wood?
 - Spices? (ה:ט)
 - Pepper?
 - Worn-out books? (ו:ט)
- Explain the debate regarding how many *chata'ot* one must bring if they carried a sampler box contain many different spices? (ז:ט)
- What is the minimum measure that one is liable for carrying when carrying pumpkin seeds? (ח:ט)
- Explain the debate regarding the minimum measure of a dead non-kosher grasshopper. (ט:ט)
- Read the first *Mishnah* in the tenth *perek* – in which previous *Mishnah* was this principle learnt? (י:א)
- If someone took an object from their house and placed it on the threshold, then later took it from the threshold and placed it in the public domain, would they be obligated to bring a *chataf*? (י:ב)
- In which of the following manners of carrying would one be *chayav* for carrying on *Shabbat*? (י:ג)
 - In his mouth?
 - In his left hand?
 - On his shoulder?
 - On the back of his hand?
- If one intended to carry a satchel on his back, yet when walked into the public domain the satchel had swung around to the front, would he be *chayav*? (י:ד)
- If two people carried one object, when would they be *patur*? (י:ה)
- Explain the debate regarding biting one's nails on *Shabbat*? (י:ו)
- Explain the debate regarding throwing an object from one private domain to another via the public domain. (י:ז)
- What is *moshit* and in what case specifically is one *chayav* for performing such an action? (י:ח)
- What are the dimensions of a rock, such that it is defined as a *reshut ha'yachid* even if it is in the *reshut ha'rabim*? (י:ט)
- When calculating whether a hole in *reshut ha'rabim* is considered a *reshut ha'yachid*, would one consider the walls around the top of the hole when calculating the depth? (י:י)
- In which of the following cases is one *chayav* for *hotza'ah* if:
 - One threw an object for a distance of more the four *amot* in *reshut ha'rabim* yet it got stuck on wall at a height of greater than ten *t'fachim* from the ground.
 - One threw an object further than four *amot*, yet the object rolled back to a distance of less than four *amot*.
- One threw an object less than four *amot*, yet the object rolled further to a distance of greater than four *amot*. (י:יא)

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
 Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
 Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
 9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
 Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
 In US dial: 718 906 6400
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
19 March כ"א אדר	20 March כ"ב אדר	21 March כ"ג אדר	22 March כ"ד אדר	23 March כ"ה אדר	24 March כ"ו אדר	25 March כ"ז אדר
Shabbat 9:3-4	Shabbat 9:5-6	Shabbat 9:7-10:1	Shabbat 10:2-3	Shabbat 10:4-5	Shabbat 10:6-11:1	Shabbat 11:2-3

