



Ben Krach SheHalach Le'ir

We have learnt previously that the day on which *Purim* is celebrated depends on where one lives. Residents of a city that was walled during the time of *Yehoshua bin Nun* (*ben krach*) read the *megillah* on the fifteenth of *Adar*, while everyone else (*ben ir*) reads on the fourteenth. The *Mishnah* (2:3) addresses the case where a resident of one visits the other and explains when they should read *megillah*.

The *Mishnah* explains: "if he will return to his place in the future, he reads like his place, if not, he reads with them". The question of timing is not clear from the *Mishnah*, so the *Gemara* (19a) elaborates. *Rava* explains that he only reads like the city he came from, if he leaves on the night of the fourteenth. If however he would be in the city on the day of the fourteenth, then he is treated like everyone else in the host city. It is not immediately clear which case *Rava* is referring to; a point debated by the *Rishonim*.

Rashi explains that *Rava* is referring to the case of a *ben krach* that is visiting an open city. As long as he leaves before the day of the fourteenth, then his status does not change. If however he will be in the city at the time when the obligation for those in the city begins, he is, for that year, defined as a *ben ir*.

Rava continues that this law is based on superfluous language used when describing the obligation of a *ben ir*: "...therefore the Jews of an open city that dwell in open cities..". From the addition of the "that dwell in open cities", *Rava* learns that one can be defined as a *ben ir*, even just for a day.

What about the case of a *ben ir* that visits a wall city? *Rashi* explains that the same logic applies. In other words, if he intends to be in walled city on the morning of the fifteenth, at the time when his hosts will be obligated, then he is defined as a *ben krach* and should read on the fifteenth. If however he intends to return home on the night of the fifteenth, then he would read the *megillah* on the fourteenth, even if he is in the walled city at that time. In summary, according to *Rashi*, for a traveller to be defined as a resident of another city, it would depend on whether he will be in the city the morning that the resident of the host city are obligated to read *megillah*.

The *Rosh* however understands that *Rava* is referring to both cases. In other words, how one is defined depends on where they will be on the morning of the fourteenth. To be clear, this is also the case for a *ben ir* that is visiting a walled city. The *Raavad* explains that since the concept that a visitor can have the status of the city is visiting is learnt from the verse that refers to an open city specifically, it is the morning of the fourteenth, that is the critical time for everyone.

Rav Soleveitchik (*Harerei Kedem* 189) connects this debate with another one. The *Ramban* addresses the question of why *Purim* is celebrated on two different days. The *Ramban* explains that at the time of the miracle, the Jews in the open cities were placed in greater danger. When they were saved they celebrated the miracle, as did the Jews in *Shushan*; each celebrating on the day the battle ended. The following year, it was the Jews of the open cities that celebrated the miracle due to the great danger they were in. It was only later, when the festival was established for generations, that they established a unique day for the residents of the open cities, as they lead the way in initiating this *mitzvah*. The *Rav* comments that according to the *Ramban*, we find the main day is the fourteenth.

The *Rav* contrasts this understanding with the *Rambam*. The *Rambam* explains that the reason why we assess which city is considered a walled city by its status at the time of *Yehoshua bin Nun* is to give honour to *Eretz Yisrael*, since at the time of *Purim* miracle the cities in *Eretz Yisrael* were destroyed. The *Rav* comments that it appears that according to the *Rambam* the fifteenth in the main days, since it is considered an honour for an Israeli city to be defined as a walled city for *Purim*.

Returning now to our *Mishnah*. The *Rav* explains that *Rashi* is in line with the opinion of the *Rambam*. Since the fifteenth is the main day, for one to be defined as *ben krach* it depends on where he intends to be on the fifteenth. The *Rosh* however understands like the *Ramban* that the main day is the fourteenth. This explains then why one's status, whether *ben ir* or *ben krach*, depends on where he intends to be on the morning of the fourteenth.

Yisrael Bankier

Revision Questions

מגילה בי:בי – די:גי

- Has one fulfilled their obligation of reading *Megillah* if one was reading it while checking the text for mistakes? (בי:ב)
- On what material and using what substance must a *megillah* be written? (בי:ב)
- If a resident of a non-walled city travelled to a walled-city, when does he read the *megillah*? (Be specific) (גי:ב)
- What are the three opinions regarding how much of the *megillah* one must hear to fulfil his obligation? (גי:ב)
- Which three groups of people are unable to read the *megillah* for someone else? (בי:ד)
- Which five things may not be performed until *netz hachama*? (בי:ד)
- (Difficult:) What are the twenty things that must be performed during the day and can be performed all day? (בי:ה)
- What two things that are performed at night, can be performed the entire night? (בי:ו)
- What must the community do with the funds raised from the sale of: (גי:א)
 - *Rechova*?
 - *Shul*?
 - *Aron Ha'Kodesh*?
 - *Chumashim*?
 - *Sefer Torah*?
- On what conditions can one sell a *Shul*? (List the three opinions) (בי:ג)
- What five things does *R' Yehuda* prohibit from engaging in inside a *shul* ruin? (גי:ג)
- Should one remove the vines that are growing over a *shul* ruin? (גי:ג)
- In what order are the "four *parshiyot*" read? (גי:ד)
- When is the first of the "four *parshiyot*" read? (גי:ד)
- What portion for the *Torah* is read for: (גי:ה)
 - *Pesach*?
 - *Shavuot*?
 - *Rosh Hashanah*?
 - *Yom Kippur*?
 - *Chol Ha'moed Sukkot*? (גי:ה)
 - *Chanukah*?
 - *Purim*? (גי:ו)
- What is the source for allocating a special *Torah* reading during a festival? (גי:ו)
- Is one allowed to read the *megillah* seated? (די:א)
- Can one fulfil his obligation of hearing the *megillah* if it is read by two people at the same time? (די:א)
- Is one allowed to add additional *aliyot* for *Shabbat Mincha*? (די:א)
- How many people are called up to the *Torah* on: (בי:ד)
 - *Rosh Chodesh*?
 - *Chol Ha'moed*?
 - *Yom Tov*?
 - *Yom Kippur*?
 - *Shabbat*?
- On which days can extra people be called up to the *Torah*? (בי:ד)
- What ten things (listed in the *Mishnah*) require a *minyan*? (די:ג)

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday
10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat
10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel
Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday
Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calend
ars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

**SHIUR
ON KOL HALOSHON**

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
31 December י"ג טבת	1 January י"ד טבת	2 January ט"ו טבת	3 January ט"ז טבת	4 January י"ז טבת	5 January י"ח טבת	6 January י"ט טבת
Megilah 4:4-5	Megilah 4:6-7	Megilah 4:8-9	Megilah 4:10 - Moed Katan 1:1	Moed Katan 1:2-3	Moed Katan 1:4-5	Moed Katan 1:6-7

