



Stopping a Fast Early

The *Mishnah* (3:9) teaches that if during a fast day decreed due a lack of rain it starts raining, then depending when it begins to rain, the fast can be broken. According to the first opinion, it is only if begins to rain prior to sunrise, whereas according to *R' Eliezer* the cut-off is midday.

The *Tifferet Yisrael* notes that our *Mishnah* appears to contradict the ruling in the *Gemara* (*Taanit* 10b). There the *Gemara* rules that if one is fasting for someone who is unwell, and the person recovers, the fast must nevertheless be completed. How do we explain the *Gemara's* ruling considering our *Mishnah*?

The *Tifferet Yisrael* explains that there is a difference between a public fast day and a private fast. Regarding a public fast, it is considered as if *Beit Din* stipulates that if it rains, then fast will end early. Regarding a private fast, even though it is clear that the only reason the individual is fasting is due to this misfortune, since it was not stipulated explicitly, it is considered "*devarim she'balev*" and insignificant in this context. The *Aruch HaShulchan* (O.C. 569) adds that it follows, that if the individual did articulate at the time they took on the fast that it would end if the trouble ended, then the stipulation is effective.

The *Tifferet Yisrael's* explanation is the answer of the *Rosh*. Before the *Rosh* however provides this answer, he first cites this question and a different answer in the name of the *Raavad*. The *Raavad* answers that the cases are different. In our *Mishnah* the concern is that it has not yet rained. Once an adequate amount falls, there is no longer a need for fasting. In the case of other troubles, after the reprieve, one still needs to pray for divine mercy that it will not return. The *Beit Yosef* cites the *Ran* who, based on the *Raavad's* logic, maintains that not one would be required to complete all fasts that they committed to, and not just the one they are engaged in at that moment. The *Rosh* however finds the *Raavad's*

explanation inadequate and therefore provides the distinction cited above.¹

Rashi however appears to provide a different explanation as to why an individual must complete the fast even if the situation changes. He explains that stopping the fast early would be as if one is giving *Hashem* an ultimatum: "if this trouble passes I will fast, where as if not, I will not." The *Tifferet Yisrael* cites *R' Yeshaya Pick* who explains that the logic presented above appears to be reversed and *Rashi* instead should read that ultimatum is: "if the trouble passes I will not fast, but if it does I will".

The *Tifferet Yisrael* however wishes to preserve the reading of *Rashi*. Before explaining, he adds that *Rashi* maintains that if the person unfortunately dies because of the illness, the person fasting must still complete the fast(s). The *Tifferet Yisrael* questions the source of *Rashi's* position. He therefore explains that in the case where the person recovered, there is no need to explain why the fast must be completed. As we explained earlier, since the one fasting did not stipulate at the outset that he would stop if the person recovered, he must complete his vow. The situation that requires explaining is where the sick person passes away. In that case, one might think that it should be considered as if he accepted the fast in error.² The *Tifferet Yisrael* however notes that in *Rashi's* explanation he does not say "if he is saved" (*hitzil*); instead the language of "*avrah*" is used ('passed'). In other words, if the person died and the one fasting stopped his fast, it would appear as though he was asserting that if trouble passes eventually, then he will happily fast, otherwise, if the person succumbs to illness, then he will not. The *Tifferet Yisrael* explains that such an approach is inappropriate as one needs to praise *Hashem* for both good and bad and accept *Hashem's* Will in all circumstance.

Yisrael Bankier

¹ The *Beit Yosef* however also cites that *Terumat HaDeshen* who explains that if the *tzibur* fasted past midday and then heard that the matter was resolved already the day before, then they would be able to stop their fast. This is because since in reality, there was no reason to fast already from the outset, it is considered as though their acceptance of the fast was in error.

The *Beit Yosef* writes that this would also be the law for an individual and in a similar situation they would not be required to complete the fast.

² See the previous footnote which includes a case where we do consider it as if the vow as accepted in error.

Revision Questions

טעניט גי: ב' – ד': ר'

- Does any rainfall satisfy that the community need not fast? (גי: ב')
- If one city is denied rain, how do the surrounding cities respond? (Include both opinions) (גי: ג')
- What other incident affecting a single city elicits the same response from the surrounding cities? (גי: ד')
- For what six incidents affecting one city, do all the cities throughout Israel react as if it is affecting them? (גי: ה')
- What occurred in *Ashkelon* that caused the *Zkeinim* to institute a fast day in *Yerushalaim*? (גי: ו')
- On which incidents are we *matriyah* even on *Shabbat*? (גי: ז')
- On any negative occurrence we are *matriyah* – what is the single exception? (גי: ח')
- What is the incident including *Choni HaMe'agel*? (גי: ט')
- Does everyone continue fasting if rain fell during the fast day? (גי: י')
- Which are the three times when the *kohanim* do *birkat kohanim* four times during the day? (גי: יא')
- Why do we have the *ma'amadot*? (גי: יב')
- What would the *Anshei ma'amad* do? (גי: יג')
- What days of the week would the *Anshei ma'amad* fast? (גי: יד')
- When would there be no *ma'amad*: (גי: יו')
 - *Shacharit*?
 - *Ne'illah*?
 - *Mincha*?
- How many dates were fixed for the *korban eitzim*? (גי: יז')
- What were the five things that occurred on the seventeenth of *Tamuz*? (גי: יח')
- What were the five things that occurred on the ninth of *Av*? (גי: יט')

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday
10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat
10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel
Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday
Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
17 December כ"ט כסלו	18 December ל' כסלו	19 December א' טבת	20 December ב' טבת	21 December ג' טבת	22 December ד' טבת	23 December ה' טבת
Taanit 4:7-8	Megilah 1:1-2	Megilah 1:3-4	Megilah 1:5-6	Megilah 1:7-8	Megilah 1:9-10	Megilah 1:11-2:1



