



Saying Morid HaGeshem in the Summer

Masechet Taanit opens with discussing the time we begin to mention rain – *mashiv ha'ruach u'morid ha'geshem* – and the time we being to ask for rain – *ve'ten tal u'matar lifracha*. The *Gemara* (3b) includes the opinion of *R' Chanina* who explains that if one said *morid hageshem* during the summer or omitted it during the winter, one needs to repeat *shemona esrei*. We shall try to understand why.

The *Ran* (*Berachot* 19b) initially explains that the issue with mentioning rain during the summer is that rain during that time is a *siman klala* – a sign of a curse – due to its detrimental effects. The *Ran* however continues that even in locations where they require rain during the summer, mentioning *morid hageshem* would require one to repeat *shemona esrei*. This is despite the fact that they are allowed to ask for rain in the *beracha* of *shomea tefilla*. The reason they must repeat *shemona esrei* is because they have digressed from the format that was instituted by the *Chachamim* (*meshane mimatbeah she'tiknu Chachamim*).

We find from the *Ran* that there are two ways to understanding this problem, it is either the detrimental content or the change in the format. Put simply, an issue of semantics or syntax.

The *Sefat Emet* also addresses this issue when questioning the basis of *R' Chanina's* law. At first he asserts that neither of the above reasons appear to apply. In the first *Mishnah* we find the debate regarding when we start mentioning *morid ha'geshem*. According to *R' Eliezer* it is from the first day of *Sukkot*, while according to *R' Yehoshua* it from the last. *R' Yehoshua* argues that it is not appropriate to mention *morid*

ha'geshem, because rain during *sukkot* is a *siman klala*, since it would prevent one from performing the *mitzvah* of *sukkah*. *R' Eliezer* responds that he agrees it is inappropriate to ask for rain (*ve'ten tal u'matar livracha*). He only requires the mentioning of rain from the first day as part of the descriptions of the might of *Hashem*. *R' Yehoshua* counters, that if mentioning rain does not present an issue, then we would should mention it all year round.

Reflecting on the *Mishnah* the *Sefat Emet* notes that according to *R' Eliezer* it is not a *siman klala*. Furthermore, if one forgot to mention *mashiv ha'ruach* at a time that it is required, then it would be considered *meshane mimatbeah*. Mentioning *mashiv ha'ruach* when it is not required however would not appear to be a problem. Since it is not a *siman klala* and it fits with the theme of the *beracha*, it would not be considered a *hefsek* (interruption). What then is the basis for *R' Chanina's* rule that *shemona esrei* must repeated?

The *Sefat Emet* suggests that *R' Chanina* understand that the debate between *R' Eliezer* and *R' Yehoshua* is based on one's intention when saying *morid ha'geshem* in the second *beracha*. According to *R' Eliezer*, the second *beracha* enumerates the might of *Hashem*. One of the expressions is His bringing rain – whenever He brings it. Since it is not a request for now, but a description of His might, it is not a *siman klala* to mention it. According to *R' Yossi* however, when saying *morid ha'geshem*, we are describing *Hashem's* might now. Since the expression is focused on the present moment and it would be detrimental now, mentioning it would be considered a *siman klala*.

Yisrael Bankier

Revision Questions

ראש השנה גי: טי – ד: טי

- How does the *Mishnah* explain the following *pasuk*: (גי: טי)
"והיה כאשר ירים משה ידו וגבר ישראל..." (שמות י"ז: י"א)
- Which other *pasuk* does the *Mishnah* explain in a similar manner? (גי: טי)
- When was the *mitzvah* of *shofar* different inside and outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? (די: אי)
- What decree did *R' Yochanan ben Zakkai* enact after the destruction of the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? (Include both opinions.) (די: אי)
- What was the difference between *Yavneh* and the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* with respect to the *halachot* of *shofar*? (די: בי)
- What other *mitzvah* also has distinct laws between the inside and outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* like *shofar*? (די: גי)
- What decree did *R' Yochanan ben Zakkai* enact after the destruction of the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* with respect to *Kiddush HaChodesh*? (די: די)
- List the two opinions regarding the order of the *brachot* of *mussaf* on *Rosh Hashanah* and the location of the *tekiyot*? (די: דה)
- How many *p'sukim* are recited for *malchiyot*, *zichronot* and *shofarot*? (די: וי)
- Which *chazzan* recites *Hallel* on *Rosh Hashanah*? (די: זי)
- Can one climb a tree to retrieve a *shofar* on *Rosh Hashanah*? (די: חז)
- Is one allowed to clean out a *shofar* with water or wine on *Rosh Hashanah*? (די: טז)
- If one hears someone practicing blowing the *shofar*, have they fulfilled their obligation? (די: חז)
- How many blasts must be heard on *Rosh Hashanah*? (די: טי)
- How long is a *tekiya*? (טי: די)
- How long is a *teruah*? (טי: די)

טענית א': א' – ד'

- From what date do we begin to recite "*mashiv ha'ruach u'morid ha'gashem*"? (אי: אי)
- When do we stop asking from rain? (אי: בי)
- From what date do we begin to ask for rain? (Include both opinions) (אי: גי)
- By which date do "individuals" begin fasting if rain has not yet fallen? (אי: ד')
- How many fast days do these people undertake? (אי: די)

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday
10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat
10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel
Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday
Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
3 December ט"ו כסלו	4 December ט"ז כסלו	5 December י"ז כסלו	6 December י"ח כסלו	7 December י"ט כסלו	8 December כ' כסלו	9 December כ"א כסלו
Taanit 1:5-6	Taanit 1:7-2:1	Taanit 2:2-3	Taanit 2:4-5	Taanit 2:6-7	Taanit 2:8-9	Taanit 2:10-3:1

