



## Forgetting Today is Shabbat

If one accidentally performs one of the thirty-nine *melachot* on *Shabbat*, in the times of the *Beit HaMikdash* they were obligated to bring a *korban chatat*. Whether one is required to bring more *korbanot* for further inadvertent violations depends on the nature of the case. The seventh *perek* opens by explaining when further violation are treated independently. One case is where one knew about that *melacha* is prohibited on *Shabbat* yet forgot that that day was *Shabbat*. The *Mishnah* explains that one would need to bring one *korban* for every *Shabbat*. We shall try to understand why.

Normally *yediya*, awareness or discovery that one violated a prohibition of *Shabbat*, serves to differentiate (*mechalek*) and thereby obligate one with another *korban chatat* for a further violation. The *Gemara* (*Keritot* 16a) explains that in our case the intervening days are considered *yediya*. *Rashi* explains this is because it is impossible that during the course of the week he would not have learnt that the day in question was *Shabbat*.

The *Tosfot* (*Shabbat* 67b) however find this position difficult for several reasons. Firstly, *R' Eliezer* raises a difficulty based on a later *Gemara* (70b). There *Rava* discusses a case where one reaps and grinds but forgot that it was *Shabbat* but was aware that these two acts are *melachot*. He then reaps and grinds again, this time aware that it is *Shabbat* but forgot that these two *melachot* are forbidden. He explains that if after that he becomes aware of the first errors and then the second ones, one *chatat* offering will suffice. The *Tosfot* concludes that simple knowledge that the day is *Shabbat* does not constitute *yediya* in order to obligate an additional *korban chatat*. The knowledge required is knowledge that one has sinned.

The second difficulty found in the *Tosfot* is raised by the *Rivam* who explains that the *Gemara* (69b) brings a *pasuk* as the source for this law. The *Gemara* cites that two *pesukim*: "And *Bnei Yisrael* kept the *Shabbat*..." (*Shemot* 31:16) and "And my *Shabbatot* (plural) you shall keep" (*Vayikra* 19:3). *R' Nachman bar Yitzchak* explains that the first *pasuk* is the

source for our case where one can be obligated to bring a *chatat* offering for every *Shabbat* that he forget it was *Shabbat* and performed *melachot*. The second *pasuk* is the source for the first law in the *Mishnah* where one forgot the concept of *Shabbat* for an extended period. The *Mishnah* rules that one *korban* will suffice. Returning to our case the *Rivam* reasons that if the reason was really that one would definitely know during the course of the week that that day was *Shabbat* and it is this *yediya* that differentiates, then a *pasuk* is unnecessary to teach this law.

The *Ramban* defends *Rashi* against these attacks. He explains that in the latter cases, the person was unaware that he sinned from beginning to end. This is true even though the basis of the error changed at one point. In our case however, once he learns that the day was *Shabbat*, he will know that an action like the one he performed is forbidden even if he does not recall that he sinned. Consequently such knowledge is considered *yediya*. He continues that the *pasuk* is indeed required to teach us this point. In other words, despite the fact that the knowledge does not make him aware that he sinned, since it makes him aware of his error it is *mechalek*.

The *Ramban* however suggest that when the *Gemara* teaches that the intervening days constitute *yediya* this is not because someone told him or he remembered that that day was *Shabbat*. Rather since he knows that concept of *Shabbat* and that it occurs every seven days and that after six regular (certain) weekdays, the day that follows is *Shabbat*, had he contemplated for a moment it would have been clear that that day was *Shabbat* and so was seven days prior. Consequently, the intervening days are considered *yediya* even if he did not pay attention to the matter. The *Rambam* suggest that perhaps this was *Rashi's* true intention in his explanation.

The *Ramban* finally quotes *R' Shmuel* that suggest that since he knows that one of the intervening days is a weekday, that alone constitutes a *hefsek* (break) since he has momentarily broken out from the doubt.

**Revision Questions**

שבת ו' - ט' - ט"ב

- Explain the debate regarding whether one can wear a fox's tooth on *Shabbat*? (ו' י:)
- Provide two scenarios when one performs multiple *melachot* on one *Shabbat be'shogeg* yet is only obligated to bring one *chatat*? (א' ז')
- How many *avot melacha* are there? (ז' ב') [Hard: list all the *melachot*.]
- What is the general rule presented in the *Mishnah* regarding the minimum measure of any object that if one carries this measure from the private domain to the public domain they performed a *melacha*? (ז' ג')
- Regarding the previous question, what is the minimum measurement for: (ז' ד')
  - Wheat?
  - Food fit for human consumption?
- The *Mishnah* (7:4) lists many different measurements for different objects. If someone carried two different objects, when do they combine to add up to the minimum quantity? (ז' ד')
- What is the minimum measurement for:
  - Wine?
  - Milk?
  - Honey?
  - Oil
  - Water?
  - Any other drinks? (א' ח')
  - Rope?
  - Paper? (ב' ח')
  - *Klaf*?
  - Ink? (ג' ח')
  - Glue?
  - Wax? (ד' ח')
  - Reed? (ה' ח')
  - Bone?
  - Glass? (ו' ח')
- Which opinion is the most strict regarding the minimum measurement for pottery? (ז' ח')
- *Tumat niddah* is transferred through carrying (*masah*) – which other form of *tum'ah* can be transferred in such a manner? (א' ט')
- What *pasuk* is the law in the previous question learnt from? (א' ט')
- Can a boat become *tameh*? (ב' ט')

**Melbourne, Australia**

**Sunday -Thursday**

10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
 Melbourne, Australia

**Friday & Shabbat**

10 minutes before *Mincha*  
Mizrachi Shul  
 Melbourne, Australia

**Efrat, Israel**

*Shiur in English*

**Sunday -Thursday**

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf  
 9:00am  
Kollel Magen Avraham  
 Reemon Neighbourhood

**ONLINE SHIURIM**

*Yisrael Bankier*  
[mishnahyomit.com/shiurim](http://mishnahyomit.com/shiurim)

*Rabbi Chaim Brown*  
[www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/](http://www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/)

*Rabbi E. Kornfeld*  
*Rabbi C. Brown*  
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

**SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON**

*Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss*  
 In US dial: 718 906 6400  
 Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

**Next Week's Mishnayot...**

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
19 March כ"א אדר	20 March כ"ב אדר	21 March כ"ג אדר	22 March כ"ד אדר	23 March כ"ה אדר	24 March כ"ו אדר	25 March כ"ז אדר
Shabbat 9:3-4	Shabbat 9:5-6	Shabbat 9:7-10:1	Shabbat 10:2-3	Shabbat 10:4-5	Shabbat 10:6-11:1	Shabbat 11:2-3

