



Using Planks for Schach

The *Mishnah* (1:6) cites a debate regarding whether one can use planks of wood for *schach*. It appears that *Rabbi Yehuda* permits the use, while *R' Meir* disagrees.

The *Gemara* (14a) includes two different opinions regarding the nature of the debate. *Rav* understands that the debate is where one uses standard planks of wood used for construction that are four *tephachim* wide. *R' Meir* is concerned that if one uses these planks, one might question the difference between sitting in the *sukkah* and sitting in one's house (which is certainly invalid). Consequently, he supports the *gezeira* that forbids its use. *R' Yehuda* however did not share this concern. If however narrower planks were used, since it is not normally used for ceilings, everyone would agree that it may be used as *schach*.

Shmuel however maintains that everyone agrees as to the necessity of the *gezeirah*. In other words, everyone forbids the use of planks that are four *tephachim* wide. The debate is only regarding planks that are between three and four *tephachim* wide. *R' Meir* maintains that once it is greater than three *tephachim* it is no longer covered by the law of *levud*. To explain, a space that is less than three *tephachim* wide is considered filled in, based on the principle of *levud*. Once the plank is wider, the space is significant and should be considered like a ceiling. *R' Yehuda* however understands, that only once it is four *tephachim* wide is it a problem. This is because the minimum size of a domain is four *tephachim*. We only need to be concerned about a plank that would cover the smallest significant domain for it to be confused with a regular ceiling. With respect to planks that are less than three *tephachim* wide, everyone agrees that they be used as *schach* since at that width, they are similar to reed *schach*. The *Bartenura* explains our *Mishnah* in line with *Shmuel's* position.

The next *Mishnah* (1:7) discusses a pre-existing ceiling that has not been plastered and one wants to convert it into a *sukkah*. *R' Yehuda* maintains that the solution is debated by *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel*. *Beit Shammai* maintains that the boards need to be dislodge and every second board removed with the new space filled with valid *schach*. *Beit Hillel* however maintains that either dislodging the boards or

removing every second board is enough. *R' Meir* however maintains that every second board must be removed according to all opinions.

The *Bartenura* explains that debate in this *Mishnah* is related to the previous one. In other words, *R' Yehuda* maintains that one is allowed to use planks of wood for *Schach* – provided it is less than four *tephachim*. Consequently, the debate in this *Mishnah* is also regarding planks that are between three to four *tephachim*. Therefore according to *R' Yehuda* for *Beit Hillel* the issues of "*ta'aseh v'lo min ha'asui*" – that the "*schach*" is pre-existing – and the concern of confusing the *schach* with a regular roof can be allayed with either solution. *Beit Shammai* however requires both. According to *R' Meir*, who does not permit planks of these sizes, the only solution is to remove at least half of the planks and replace them with valid *schach*. This is the explanation of the *Bartenura* according to the *Tosfot Yom Tov*.

Rashi however maintains that in this *Mishnah* we are dealing with planks of wood that are four *tephachim* wide. The *Ritva* however finds this position difficult. For example, according to the position of *Shmuel*, no one allows the use of a plank that wide. How then would with dislodging the planks be sufficient according to *R' Yehuda*?

The *Meiri* however explains that the *gezeira* only applies when using the planks for a *sukkah* from the outset. In this case however, since we have a room with a fully covered roof, and we require the individual to dislodge all or remove some of the planks, the person will no longer confuse his *sukkah* with the rest of his house. He asserts that the concern is only for the owner of the *sukkah* so that actions required of him are enough to allay the concerns. Potential confusion from onlookers (that have had not input) is remote and not a concern. In a similar manner, the *Rosh* cites the *Raza* who asks why the *Rif* explains that the concern of *Beit Hillel* is *taaseh ve'lo min ha'asui* when we rule like *Shmuel* who maintains that *R' Yehuda* is also concerned about *gezeirat tikra*. He cites the *Ramban* who explains that since the person is trying to solve the issue of *taaseh ve'lo min ha'asui* it demonstrates a level of competency and understanding such that there is no longer a concern of *gezeirat tikra*.

Revision Questions

יומא ח' ד' – ט'

- How long before a child's *bar-* or *bat-mitzvah* does one begin teaching them to fast on *Yom Kippur*? (ח': ד')
- How does one determine how much food to feed a sick person if there is no doctor available to consult? (ח': ה')
- Complete the following phrase: (ח': ו')
"_____ נפשות _____"
- What case appears in the next *Mishnah* that is a practical example of the principle described in the previous question? (ח': ז')
- What else is required for *Yom Kippur* to atone? (ח': ח')
- On what sins does *teshuva* instantly atone? (ח': ט')
- How does the *Mishnah* respond regarding a person who says "I will sin and then do *teshuva*"? (ח': ט')
- On which sins does *Yom Kippur* atone and which require further action in the individual part? (ח': ט')
- What does *R' Akiva* learn from the following *p'sukim*:
"וּזְרַקְתִּי עֲלֵיכֶם מִיַּם טְהוּרִים" (יחזקאל ל"ו: כ"ה)
"מִקּוֹה יִשְׂרָאֵל" (ירמיה י"ז: ג')

סוכה א' ח'

- What are the maximum and minimum heights of a *sukkah*? (א': א')
- What are the other two structural specifications of a *sukkah*? (א': א')
- What is a *sukkah yeshana*? (א': א')
- Can one make a *sukkah* under a tree? (א': ב')
- Can one make a two-storey *sukkah*? (א': ב')
- Can one spread a shade-cloth over the *schach*? (א': ג')
- How can one fix a *sukkah* that had a vine growing amongst the *schach*? (א': ד')
- What are the two criteria of *kosher schach*? (א': ד')
- Can one use bundles of straw as *schach*? (א': ה')
- Explain the debate regarding whether one can use planks of wood for *schach*? (א': ו')
- What does one need to do in order to fix a *sukkah* that has a roof made of planks of woods (which are not plastered)? (Include both opinions) (א': ז')
- When would a *sukkah* be *kosher* if the roof was covered with metal rods? (א': ח')
- Can one make a *sukkah* by carving out a room from a stack of hay? (א': ח')

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Yisrael Bankier
mishnahyomit.com/shiurim

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday

Monday

Tuesday

Wednesday

Thursday

Friday

שבת קודש



1 October י"א תשרי	2 October י"ב תשרי	3 October י"ג תשרי	4 October י"ד תשרי	5 October ט"ו תשרי	6 October ט"ז תשרי	7 October י"ז תשרי
Sukkah 1:9-10	Sukkah 1:11-2:1	Sukkah 2:2-3	Sukkah 2:4-5	Sukkah 2:6-7	Sukkah 2:8-9	Sukkah 3:1-2