



Deflecting Rain

The *Mishnah* (3:8) teaches as follows. If one places a bowl against a wall in order for it to be washed by rainwater, then the water that comes off the bowl can affect *hechsher*. If however the bowl was placed there in order to protect the wall from the rain then the water does not affect *hechsher*. To revise some important points, in order for a detached food product to be susceptible to *tumah* it must come into contact with one of the seven liquid – this is referred to as *hechsher*. Further the detachment of the water from its source and/or¹ the contact made with the food must be *le'ratzon* – it must be consistent with the will of the owner. We find that in the case of the *Mishnah* the intention when placing the bowl against wall during the rain is critical to *hechsher*. Why?

The *Gemara* (*Chullin* 16a) notes that the *Mishnah* appears to have an internal contradiction. The first statement of the *Mishnah* is that if the intention was to wash the *kli* then it can affect *hechsher*. This implies that if the intention was for the rain to wash on to the wall that it would not. Focusing on the end of the *Mishnah*, it states that if the intention was to protect the wall, then it would not affect *hechsher*. This implies that if the intention was to wash the wall then it would.

R' Elazar admits to the contradiction and explains that the two statements reflect two different opinions. *Rav Papa* however resolves the matter explaining that the first case involves the wall of a cave that was formed naturally, while the second case involves a man-made wall. When considering the wall of a cave, the person intends for the water to be used for something that is *mechubar* (attached to the ground). Such intention is

not enough to enable the water to be able to affect *hechsher*. When considering a wall however, even though it is now *mechubar*, since it was originally detached, for *machshirin* it is considered detached and the water intended for its use can affect *hechsher*.

The *Tifferet Yaakov* explains that the *Rav Papa*² came to that position because the *Mishnah* transitioned from discussing the bowl to the wall rather than choosing one of the cases and tweaking on a parameter to result in a different ruling. He explains that *Rebbi* selected absolute cases. In other words, in the first case, if one's intention is to deflect the water from the wall, then it does not matter which wall we are dealing with. That would not be true if the water was being directed towards the wall as we have explained above. Consequently, that case was not listed. Likewise, in the second statement, if one wishes to wash the bowl with the rain water, it will always be *machshir*.

The *Tosfot* (*Keritut* 15b) notes that we have learnt of cases where a person does not want the water, e.g. squeezing out one's hair, yet the expelled water can affect *hechsher*. One might ask that when deflecting the water from the wall, the ruling should be the same. In both cases, one does not want the water. He explains that in the other cases, since one did an action to remove the water he has demonstrate its importance (*achshevinu*). It follows that simply placing the *kli* down to deflect the water is not consider enough of an action in this respect.

Yisrael Bankier

¹ Recall from previous articles that according to the *Rambam* it is "and" while according to *Rashi* it is "or".

² As well as the extended explanation in the *Gemara* of his position.

Revision Questions

מכשירין בי:י"א – ד'ה:

- What is the law regarding a mixture of fruit from different years of the *shmittah* cycle? Why is this important? (ב'י"א: ג')
- What is law if the mixture contains exactly half from two consecutive years? (א"י: ג')
- Explain the debate regarding which water is considered "b'chi yutan" in a case where produce was placed on the river's edge in order to draw water. (א: ג')
- What is the law regarding the moisture in produce that is in contact with the walls of an earthenware utensil that is filled partially with liquid? (ב: ג')
- To which of the seven liquids does this law not apply? (ב: ג')
- Explain the debate regarding bread (that was made with fruit juice) that, after baking, was placed over the mouth of a barrel of wine. (Include all three opinions.) (ג: ג')
- What is the law regarding wheat that was placed on a washed floor? (ד: ג')
- What other case brought is similar to the one in the previous questions? (ד: ג')
- What is the law regarding one that placed produce on newly dried cement? (ה: ג')
- Should one be concerned when casting their wheat onto a new washed threshing floor? (ה: ג')
- Explain the debate regarding wheat that was being brought for grinding and rain fell on it. (ה: ג')
- What is the law regarding olives on the roof onto which rain fell? (ו: ג')
- What are the other two cases debated by R' Yehuda and the Chachamim? (Hint: River and dirty feet.) (ו: ג')
- What is the law regarding the water that drips off a wagon's wheel that was immersed in the river for hardening? (ז: ג')
- If one sent an animal to drink from a river, water dripping from which parts of the animal is considered "b'chi yutan"? (ז: ג')
- In which two cases does the law in the previous question change to be considered "b'chi yutan"? Never be considered b'chi yutan? (ח: ג')
- If one drank water from the river, is the water that drips from his beard considered b'chi yutan? (א: ד')
- In what case is the water on the outside of a barrel that was filled with water not considered b'chi yutan? (א: ד')
- If water falls on someone that is *tameh*, at what point is that water considered b'chi yutan? (ב: ד')
- In what similar case does that water become *tameh* earlier? (ב: ד')
- When is the water in a bowl that is placed outside when raining not considered b'chi yutan? (ג: ד')
- Explain the debate regarding what one should do if water collected in a barrel of fruit, if they do not want them to be susceptible to *tumah*. (ד: ד')
- In which case do they agree? (ד: ד')
- What are the two other similar cases where *Beit Shammai* and *Beit Hillel* argue? (Hint: trough.) (ה: ד')
- If one washes their clothes in a river, if water drips from which part of their body is there a debate regarding if it is considered b'chi yutan? (ה: ד')

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Beit Ha'Roeh
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
24 January י"ד שבט	25 January ט"ו שבט	26 January ט"ז שבט	27 January י"ז שבט	28 January י"ח שבט	29 January י"ט שבט	30 January כ' שבט
Machshirin 4:6-7	Machshirin 4:8-9	Machshirin 4:10-5:1	Machshirin 5:2-3	Machshirin 5:4-5	Machshirin 5:6-7	Machshirin 5:8-9

