



Volume 12. Issue 38

Can a Pregnant Woman Go Out To Reshus Harabim on Shabbos?

There is a dispute in the *Mishnah* in *Parah* (2:1) whether a *parah meuberes* (pregnant) can be used for a *parah adumah*. *R' Eliezer* holds that it may be used, while the *Chachamim* disagree. The *Rash* in his *perush* on the *Mishnah* examines the dispute. What exactly is the issue over which these *tanaim* are arguing? The *Rash* gives three possibilities. The first answer, also quoted by the *Rav*, is that the dispute is whether we say *uber yerech imo hu* (the foetus is considered part of the mother) is or *lav yerech imo* (the foetus is independent). The *chachamim* hold that the foetus is not considered *yerech imo* and therefore the *parah meuberes* in *pesulah* since it has performed *melechah* (work). Namely, it has carried its foetus, which is viewed as a separate entity.

The *Rash's* second answer is similar to the first. The *machlokes* is over *uber yerech imo hu*, but the reason that the *chachamim* invalidate a *parah meuberes* is not entirely clear, even after a close reading of the *Rash*. All the *Rash* says is the foetus is considered *chullin*, as seen from other places in *shas*. It would seem that the explanation would be like that of the *Tifferes Yisrael* and as the *Chazon Ish* says for the *Rash*, that there is a *gezeiras hakasuv* to only *shecht* one *parah* at a time and to burn on the woodpile only one *parah* at a time (*Parah* 3:7). According to the *chachamim* who hold *uber lav yerech imo hu*, when the *parah* is *shechted* and subsequently burned, really, those actions were done to two cows. The *Rash* points out that, according to this understanding, the *meuberes* is only invalid, while pregnant. Once she

has given birth, she is again fitting to be a *parah adumah*.

The *Rash* in his third answer, quotes *R' Yitzchak MiSimpont*, saying that the whole dispute is regarding the foetus, if when born it will be suitable to be a *parah adumah*. The *Chachamim* hold that it is not suitable since the *pasuk* in the *parsha* of *parah adumah* says "*parah*" – that the animal must be a *parah b'sha'as lekicha*, when acquired, and not a foetus or even a calf.

With the aforementioned analysis we can now come to back to our title question. According to the *chachamim* that *uber lav yerech imo hu*, how can a pregnant woman go out to the *reshus harabim* on *Shabbos*? She would be carrying! This question is actually asked and left unanswered by the *Chelkas Yoav* in his *Kaba Kashyasa* (no. 6). The *Chelkas Yoav* emphasizes that this *kushya* is only on the first approach of the *Rash*, because *l'halacha* there is no issue whatsoever, as the *Chelkas Yoav* demonstrates. In any event, the third approach of the *Rash* isn't relevant to the question and the according to the second approach it could be inferred that it would be allowed for a *meuberes* to go out to the *reshus harabim*. The *Achronim* answer simply that the parameters of *malachah* on *Shabbos* are quite different than those of the *parah adumah*, and thus, the two topics, cannot be compared.

Zamir Pollak

Revision Questions

הרפ יא: ב' – יט: יג'

- Can a pregnant cow be used for *para aduma*? יא: ב'
- Can a cow purchased from *goyim* be use for *para aduma*? יא: ב'
- Which two *Menachot* are the only ones that must be brought from *chadash* and from within *Eretz Yisrael*? יא: ב'
- What is the law regarding a *para aduma* that:
 - Has black horns or black hooves?
 - Is dwarfed?
 - Had a wart removed? יב: יב'
 - Was born through caesarean section?
 - Was used to purchase a dog?
 - Was ridden upon? יג: יב'
- Complete following rule: אורש לך _____ הרשכ _____, הלוספ _____ יג: יב'
- What is the law regarding a *para aduma* on which a bird rested? יד: יב'
- Explain the debate regarding the black hairs that would disqualify a *para aduma*. יד: יב'
- Describe how the *kohen* was prepared prior to *sreifat para aduma*. יא: יג'
- Describe how the water was brought to *Har Ha'Bayit* and what was done in advance to facilitate it. יב: יג'
- Where was the existing *eifer chatat*, how was it extracted and what was done with it? יג: יג'
- Regarding the previous question, which point was the subject of debate? יג: יג'
- Was the *tahara* that was performed for one *chatat* applicable for another? יד: יג'
- What point was debated regarding the preparation of the children that took part in the preparation for *para aduma*? יג: יד'
- What are the seven *parot aduma* from which the ashes were stored in the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? יג: יד'
- Where was the *para aduma* burnt? יג: יד'
- Describe the construction of the bridge that lead to that location. יג: יד'
- What are the different reasons brought for why a black *para* could not be used to lead the *para aduma* to the site? יג: יד'
- Why (and how) would they cause the *kohen* to become *tameh*? יג: יד'
- Where was the *mikvah* in which would the *kohen* then immerse? יג: יד'
- What would was used for the fire and how was it structured? יג: יד'
- How as the *para aduma* bound and how was it place on the wood? יג: יד'
- Describe how it was slaughtered and what was done with the blood. יג: יד'
- Why did the *kohen* wipe the blood on the cow? יג: יד'
- What are the two opinions regard how the fire was lit? יג: יד'

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Beit Ha'Roeh
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rav Meir Pogrow
613.org/mishnah.html

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שדוק תבש
2 nd August י"ב בא	3 rd August י"ג בא	4 th August י"ד בא	5 th August י"ה בא	6 th August י"ז בא	7 th August י"ח בא	8 th August י"ט בא
Parah 3:10-11	Parah 4:1-2	Parah 4:3-4	Parah 5:1-2	Parah 5:3-4	Parah 5:5-6	Parah 5:7-8

