



Volume 11. Issue 9

Chatzi Matir

While some of the laws that apply to *zevachim* (animal *korbabnot*) also apply to *menachot* (*korbanot* from flour) their application however can be different. Last week we discussed the issue of *li'shma* and this week we focused on *pigul*. Much like with *zevachim*, if one performs one of the four *avodot* with the intention to consume or offer part of the *korban* that should be consumed or offered (respectively) beyond the required time, the *korban* is rendered *pigul*. Consuming the *shirayim* (the left over part that is not offered and can be consumed) is punishable with *karet*.

One area where *menachot* differs from *zevachim* is that whereby be in *zevachim* it is casting the blood alone that permits the meat to be consumed, for *menachot* both the *kometz* (three fingers full of the *mincha*) and *levona* (frankincense) must be offered for the *shirayim* to be eaten. The presence of two "*matirs*" raised a number of debates. One case is in the beginning of the second *perek*. The *Mishnah* begins by stating the *R' Yosi* agrees with the *Chachamim* that if one performs *kemitza* with the intention of eating the *shirayim* or offering the *kemitz* outside the required time then the *korban* is *pigul*. If however he performed *kemitza* with the intention to offer the *levona* too late then *R' Yossi* argues it is different and while the *korban* would be invalid, it would not be *pigul*. In other words, it appears that the *Chachamim* maintain that intentions regarding one *matir* when performing the other can render a *korban pigul*.

A later *Mishnah* (2:5) however presents a difficulty. There is a debate regarding if one had *machshevet pigul* for the *kometz* but not the *levona* whether the *korban* is *pigul*. While *R' Meir* maintains that it is, the *Chachamim* disagree. They maintain that *machshevet pigul* is required for both – the entire *matir*. *Machshevet pigul* for one, i.e. *chatzi matir*, would not render the *korban pigul*. This appears to contradict their position in this *Mishnah*. Furthermore the *Rambam* rules according to the *Chachamim* in both *mishnayot*. How can we resolve these two rulings?

The *Tosfot Yom Tov* raises this question and first answers citing *Rashi* who differentiates between the two *Mishnayot*. The earlier *Mishnah* where the *Chachamim* had an issue with *chatzi matir* was referring to where the *kometz* or *levona* was being offered (*haktara*). The same *avoda* was being applied to both *matirs*. In this *Mishnah* however there would be no problem with *chatzi matir* since we are dealing with *machshava* at the time of *kemitza* and *kemitza* only applies to the *kometz* and not the *levona*.

The *Tosfot Yom Tov* however explains that this answer is not satisfactory for the *Bartenura*. He writes that the beginning of the *Mishnah* that teaches where *R' Yossi* agrees is needed since one might think that if "one intends in the burning of the *kometz* it is a *chatzi matir* and *R' Yossi* would argue" that the *korban* is not *pigul*. This implies that our *Mishnah* is referring to a case where the *machshava* is at the time of *haktara* as well.¹ He concludes that when it comes to a *chatzi matir* there are no grounds to differentiate between *avodot*.

The *Tosfot Yom Tov* therefore explains differently. One can maintain that a *machshevet pigul* for *chatzi matir* does not render the *korban pigul*. Yet at the same time it can still render that *chatzi matir* itself *pigul*.²

A question left remaining is that in this *Mishnah* the *Chachamim* maintain that the *machava* regarding one *matir* (*levona*) when performing the other (*kemitza*) is significant. The later *Mishnah* (2:5) however teaches that the *Chachamim* maintain that if one has intended to consume one of the *kivsei atzeret* (lambs brought on *Shavuot*) while slaughtering the other, they are both *kasher*. Both these *kevasim* act together as a *matir* for the loaves that are brought with them. The rationale is that the *machava* regarding one *matir* when performing the other is not significant. This appears to contradict our *Mishnah*. The *Tosfot Yom Tov* answers that our case is different since both the *kometz* and *levona* are placed together in one *kli sharet* (utensil used for service). Consequently they are like one for that law and the *machshava* of one can affect the other.

Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier

¹ The *Tosfot R' Akiva Eiger* however argues that the *Bartenura* means that at the time of *kemitza* he intends to burn the *kometz* outside the allotted time. There is therefore no issue.

² The *Tosfot Yom Tov* notes that this is only with regards to *kemitza*. For *haktara*, the *Rambam* rules that *ein haktara mefagelet haktara*.

Revision Questions

מנחות א': ג' ג' ז'

- Is a *mincha* offering invalid if too much oil was added? (א': ג')
- Is a *mincha* offering invalid if too much *levonah* was added? (א': ג')
- Provide some examples of how *pigul* applies to *mincha* offerings? (א': ג')
- Does having a *pigul* thought definitely mean the *korban* will become *pigul*? (ד': א')
- Explain the debate regarding a “mixture” of *machshevet chutz le'zmano* and *machshevet chutz le'mekomo*. (Where else have we seen this debate?) (ד': א')
- Explain the debate regarding one who performs *kemitza* with the intention of offering the *levonah* outside its specified time. (א': ב')
- Which two other cases are debated in a similar manner? (ב': ב')
- Explain how a *korban todah* can cause *pigul* to *lachmei todah*, but *lachmei todah* cannot cause *pigul* to a *korban todah*. (ג': ב')
- What two other cases share a similar ruling? (ב': ג' ד')
- Explain the debate regarding one who had *machshevet pigul* when burning the *kometz* but not when burning the *levonah*. (ב': ה')
- What other case is debated in a similar manner? (ה': ב')
- What is the law if when slaughtering one of the *kivsei atzeret*, a person had *machshevet pigul* regarding the other? (ב': ה')
- Explain the debate regarding one that performs *kemitza* with the intent to eat it the next day. (א': ג')
- What is the minimum size that one has in mind with *machshevet pigul* in order to make the *mincha offering pigul*? (א': ג')
- What is the law if one forgets to mix the flour of the *mincha* offering with its oil? (ב': ג')
- What is the law if one forgets to add salt to the *mincha* offering? (ג': ב')
- What is the law if the *kometz* from different *mincha* offerings gets mixed together? (ג': ב')
- With respect to which three *mincha* offerings does *R' Yehuda* argue? (ב': ג')
- What is the law if two *mincha* offerings that had not had *kemitza* performed to them, got mixed together? (ג': א')
- What is the law regarding a *kometz* that became *tameh* and was nonetheless offered on the *mizbeach*? (ג': ג')
- What if the *kometz* was taken outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? (ג': א')
- Explain the debate regarding a *mincha* offering whose *shirayim* became *tameh* before the *kometz* was offered. (ד': ג')
- Explain the debate regarding a *mincha* offering whose *kometz* was not first placed in *kli sharet* prior to its offering. (ד': ג')
- Can the *kometz* be offered bit-by-bit? (ד': ג')
- Regarding what four things: מעוטו מעכב את רובו (ה': ג')
- In connection to *mincha* offerings, regarding what two pairs: מעעכבים זה את זה (ה': ג')
- What other seven pairs: מעעכבים זה את זה (ו': ג')
- Can one have *tefillin* missing a *parasha*? (ז': ג')
- Explain the debate regarding a *tallit* with *tzitzit* on only three corners. (ז': א')

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Beit Ha'Roeh
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rav Meir Pogrow
613.org/mishnah.html

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
23 rd March כ"א אדר	24 th March כ"ב אדר	25 th March כ"ג אדר	26 th March כ"ד אדר	27 th March כ"ה אדר	28 th March כ"ו אדר	29 th March כ"ז אדר
Menachot 4:1-2	Menachot 4:3-4	Menachot 4:5-5:1	Menachot 5:2-3	Menachot 5:4-5	Menachot 5:6-7	Menachot 5:8-9

