



Errors in Menachot

This week we make a transition from learning about *korbanot* from animals to learning about *Menachot* – meal offerings most primarily consisting of flour. There are many different type of *Menachot*. Some are mixed with oil and they are prepared and offered in different manners; we will cover these in our learning. One detail important for this article is the *avodah* of *kemitzah*. Most of the *Menachot* involved the *kohen* taking three fingers full of flour and burning it on the *mizbeach*.

The first *Mishnah* deals with issues regarding intent and is reminiscent of the beginning of *Zevachim*, albeit focused on *Menachot*. The second *Mishnah* begins with the discussion around issues that would invalidate a *Mincha* offering. For example if a *non-kohen* or a *kohen* who was seated performed *kemitza*. The final one in the list is a *kohen* that performed *kemitza* with his left hand instead of his right and the case is listed separately. There, *Ben Beteira* argues that returning the *kemitza* and performing it again properly can remedy the situation.

The *Bartenura* notes that even though textually it appears that this particular case has been singled out, *Ben Beteira* argues that in all the cases listed in the *Mishnah*, the *kemitza* can be returned and a *kohen* can continue by performing *kemitza* properly. Indeed, this is the position of the *Gemara* that explains that *Ben Beteira* derives his position from a *pasuk* (*Vayikra* 2:2 – “*vekamtz m'sham*”) based on which there would be no reason to differentiate between the *pesulim*.

The *Tosfot Yom Tov* directs us to the *Tosfot* who ask, if there is no reason to differentiate why then was this particular *pesul*, performing *kemitza* with the left hand, singled out? They suggest that performing *avoda* with the left hand is different to the other *pesulim* listed since

it is valid in one context, on *Yom Kippur*. Consequently one might think that it has significance during the rest of the year and is defined as an *avodah* – albeit invalid – there by making the action more concrete. One might therefore think that *Ben Beteira* would agree that the situation could not be remedied and the *korban Mincha* would be invalid. Singling this out was therefore necessary to assert that *R' Yehuda* also argues in this case.

The *Shita Mekubetzet* cites the *Tosfot Chitzoniyot* who questions this rationale. We find in the *Gemara* (6a) that the logic was applied in the reverse. During the early assumption that *R' Yehuda* only argued about this case, it reasoned that this was because using the left hand was valid on *Yom Kippur*. In other words, while it was exploring the position of *R' Yehuda* the *Gemara* thought that there was more of a reason to permit this case, while the *Tosfot* understand it to be the reverse. The *Tosfot Chitzoniyot* answer that even though the logics are indeed opposite, given the distinction of this case both are reasonable assumptions and both are dealt with by the *Mishnah's* structure.

The *Rashash* however presents a different solution. In *Zevachim* (2:1) we learnt about those things that invalidate a *korban* and that *Mishnah* shares many similarities with this one. There, the case of receiving the blood with the left hands is singled out because that case alone is debated whether it invalidates the *korban*. The *Chachamim* maintain it does, where as *R' Shimon* disagrees. The *Rashash* explains that the author of this *Mishnah* is following that one and structuring it in a similar manner, even though everyone agrees that *kemitza* with one's left hand is an issue.¹

Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier

¹ This position is also found in the *Chidushei Mahariach*.

Revision Questions

זבחִים ייג: ז' יי: ד' ז'

- Is one *chayav* if he performed *melika* and offered a bird offering outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? What if he performed *shechita* instead? (ז': ייג)
- How is *R' Shimon* arguing with the *Tana Kama*? (ז': ייג)
- Is one *chayav* if they collected the blood of a *chatat* and: (ז': ייג)
 - Sprinkled once inside then once outside?
 - Sprinkled once outside then once inside?
- Regarding the previous question, what if the blood was collected in two cups? (ז': ייג)
- Regarding which two *korbanot* is one exempt if he offered them outside their allocated area? (ז': ייג)
- What rule is learnt from the following *pasuk*:
"לפני משכן היי" (ז': ייג)
- Regarding which flaw of a sacrifice does *R' Shimon* argue that one who offers it outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash* has transgressed a negative commandment? (ז': ייג)
- Which people are considered *mechusar zman*? (ז': ייג)
- Regarding which of their sacrifices, if offered outside, are they *chayav*? Are *patur*? (ז': ייג)
- Is one *chayav* if they performed *kemitza* outside the *Beit Ha'Mikdash*? (ז': ייג)
- Who offered sacrifices prior to the assembly of the *Mishkan*? (ז': ייג)
- When *Am Yisrael* arrived at which location where the *bamot* once again permitted? (ז': ייג)
- What location was described as "*menucha*"? (ז': ייג)
- When the *Mishkan* was in that location, where was *ma'aser sheni* consumed? (ז': ייג)
- After the *Mishkan* was in *Shilo* where was it located when the *bamot* were once again permitted? (ז': ייג)
- What term refers to "*Yerushalaim*" in the *pasuk* refer to the prohibition against sacrificing on *bamot*? (ז': ייג)
- What are the prohibitions transgressed and their punishment if one offered a sacrifice outside, if he: (ז': ייג)
 - Sanctified the sacrifice when the *bamot* were prohibited and offered when the *bamot* were prohibited?
 - Sanctified the sacrifice when the *bamot* were prohibited and offered when the *bamot* were permitted?
 - Sanctified the sacrifice when the *bamot* were permitted and offered when the *bamot* were prohibited?
- What is the difference between a *bamat yachid* and a *bamat tzibur*? (ז': ייג)

מנחות א' א' ב'

- What is the law if *kemitza* was performed on a *mincha* offering for the purpose of a different *mincha* offering? (א': א')
- Which two *mincha* offerings are the exceptions to the previous question? (א': א')
- Which three other action relating to the *mincha* offering share the same law? (א': א')
- Can anyone perform *kemitza*? (א': ב')
- What does *Ben Beteira* say can be done to a *mincha* offering that had *kemitza* performed with the *kohen's* left hand? (א': ב')
- How should *kemitza* be performed? (א': ב')

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Beit Ha'Roeh
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rav Meir Pogrow
613.org/mishnah.html

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendar/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
16 th March יי"ד אדר	17 th March ט"ו אדר	18 th March ט"ז אדר	19 th March י"ז אדר	20 th March י"ח אדר	21 th March י"ט אדר	22 nd March כ' אדר
Menachot 1:3-4	Menachot 2:1-2	Menachot 2:3-4	Menachot 2:5-3:1	Menachot 3:2-3	Menachot 3:4-5	Menachot 3:6-7

