



Olah becoming a Chatat

Much of our learning this week focused on bird sacrifices. Most of our attention was on how various errors that not only affect the validity of the sacrifice but also how they impact two other laws. The first is the prohibition of *meilah* – misappropriating the property of *hekdesh*. The second is whether the bird would be defined as a *neveila* since it would have significance for the laws of *tumah*.

One case that is the subject of debate is regarding a bird that was offered for the purpose of a *chatat* in the manner required for a *chatat* and at the location necessary for a *chatat*. The issue however is that the bird was originally designated for an *olah*. R' Eliezer and R' Yehoshua debate whether the prohibition of *meilah* would still apply to that bird with the latter maintaining it does not. To explain, the prohibition of *meilah* applies to all bird sacrifices. For a *chatat*, once it has been offered correctly and permitted for the *kohanim* to eat, the prohibition of *meilah* is lifted. R' Eliezer maintains that since this was designated as an *olah* offering and was never permitted for consumption, the prohibition of *meilah* still applies. We shall try to understand the position of R' Yehoshua.

The *Bartenura* explains that since everything about the *korban* changed to be like a *chatat* – the intention, manner and location – the *korban* became a *chatat*. The *Tosfot Yom Tov* however draws our attention to the *Gemara* that explains that its “becoming” a *chatat* is only for the purposes of alleviating the prohibition of *meilah*. If however the owner was required to (also) bring a *chatat*, he would not have fulfilled his obligation through this *korban*. The conclusion was drawn based on a number *Mishnayot* from *kinim* that dealt with mixtures of *olah* and *chatat* offerings that were offered in varying manners. From the resolution of the problematic

situations it is clear that an *olah* offered like a *chatat* does not truly become a *chatat*, given the supplementary *korbanot* required.

The *Tosfot* (68a s.v. *eimar*) questions the grounds for differentiating between the issue of *meilah* and the effectiveness of the *korban*. Yet, he brings a number of other cases where the prohibition of *meilah* is lifted even though the owner did not fulfil his obligation. One example brought is that if the meat of a *korban* was taken out of the *Beit HaMikdash*, if *zerika* (throwing the blood) is performed, the prohibition of *meilah* is lifted from the meat, even though one is prohibited to eat it.

The *Tosfot* suggest that in this case, R' Yehoshua understands that on a biblical level the *olah* offering really becomes a *chatat*. The fact that the owner does not fulfil his obligation is a rabbinic decree and the *Chachamim* were not so strict in that decree to maintain a rabbinic prohibition of *meilah*.

The *Tosfot* point out that this suggestion commits R' Yehoshua to take another *halachic* position. One is prohibited to bring *chulin* (an unsanctified animal) in the *Azara*. Another problem is that *melika* only enables a *chatat* bird offering to be consumed; all other cases the bird is not kosher. Requiring the owner to bring another sacrifice by virtue of a rabbinic decree could result in a violation of these prohibitions. To solve this problem they suggest one of two solutions. Either R' Yehoshua, maintains that on a biblical level birds do not require *shechita* and that there is not a biblical prohibition of bringing *chulin* to the *Azara*. Alternatively, the prohibition of bringing *chulin* to the *Azara* is biblical, but does not apply to birds.

Yisrael Yitzchak Bankier

Revision Questions

זבחים ו' ה' ח' ה'

- Explain how the *olat ha'ohf* was offered. (י' ה')
- Regarding the previous question what part, if left out, would not invalidate the *korban*? (י' ה')
- Which of the two bird offering, if offered for the sake of another *korban* is valid? (י' ה')
- Can bird offerings become *pigul*? (י' ה')
- When is a *chatat* bird-offering always invalid regardless of how it was performed or the intent when performing it? (י' ה')
- When is an *olah* bird-offering always invalid regardless of how it was performed or the intent when performing it? (י' ה')
- What is special about the bird-offerings that were invalid in the previous two *Mishnayot* and what is the exception? (י' ה')
- Explain the ensuing debate regarding an *olat ha'ohf* that was performed exactly like a *chatat ha'ohf* and for the purpose of a *chatat ha'ohf*. (י' ה')
- Complete the following rule and give examples for each side of the rule: (י' ה')

_____ אינה מטמאה _____ כל שהיה _____ מטמאה _____ לא היה _____ מטמאה _____
- Explain the ensuing debate regarding a bird offering that had *melika* performed, yet the bird was found to be a *treifah*? (Include all opinions.) (י' ה')
- What is the law regarding a mixture of: (ח' א')
 - *Korbanot* and *chata'ot metot*?
 - *Korbanot* and animals that are forbidden to be used as *korbanot*?
 - *Korbanot* and regular animals? (ח' א')
 - Like *korbanot*?
 - Different *korbanot*?
 - *Korbanot* and *Ma'aser behema*? (ח' ב')
 - Meat (to be consumed) from *kodshei kodshim* and *kodshei kalim*? (ח' ג')
- Explain the debate regarding a mixture of a *shlamim* and *asham* offerings. (ח' ג')
- Explain the debate regarding a mixture of the sacrificial parts for *chatat* and *asham* offerings. (ח' ד')
- What are the two opinions regarding a mixture of the sacrificial parts including parts from animals that had blemishes? (ח' ה')

Local Shiurim

Melbourne, Australia

Sunday -Thursday

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Mizrachi Shul
Melbourne, Australia

Friday & Shabbat

10 minutes before *Mincha*
Beit Ha'Roeh
Melbourne, Australia

Efrat, Israel

Shiur in English

Sunday -Thursday

Rabbi Mordechai Scharf
9:00am
Kollel Magen Avraham
Reemon Neighbourhood

ONLINE SHIURIM

Rabbi Chaim Brown
www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

Rav Meir Pogrow
613.org/mishnah.html

Rabbi E. Kornfeld
Rabbi C. Brown
<http://www.dafyomi.co.il/calendars/myomi/myomi-thisweek.htm>

SHIUR ON KOL HALOSHON

Rabbi Moshe Meir Weiss
In US dial: 718 906 6400
Then select: 1 – 2 – 4

Next Week's Mishnayot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
16 th February ט"ז אדר	17 th February י"ז אדר	18 th February י"ח אדר	19 th February י"ט אדר	20 th February כ' אדר	21 st February כ"א אדר	22 nd February כ"ב אדר
Zevachim 8:6-7	Zevachim 8:8-9	Zevachim 8:10-11	Zevachim 8:12-9:1	Zevachim 9:2-3	Zevachim 9:4-5	Zevachim 9:6-7

