



Volume 1. Issue 44.

Mixtures – *Min Be'Mino*

After something forbidden mixes with something permissible, one must define the status of this new mixture – is it forbidden or permissible? To establish the identity of this mixture, the *Chachamim* provided a number of parameters which one must clarify: What constitutes a majority of the mixture? Is the flavour of the prohibited ingredient identifiable? Is the prohibited ingredient special?

Before one can determine the status of the mixture one must first differentiate between two types of mixtures:

1. *Min be'mino* – where both the forbidden and permissible ingredients are of the same type, for example, *trumah* wheat mixing with *chulin* wheat.
2. *Min be'she'eino Mino* – where the forbidden and permissible ingredients are different products, for example, *trumah* wheat mixing with *chulin* rice.

The *Mishnayot* in the second *perek* (6-7) establish differences between these two types of mixtures. The *Mishnah* deals with a case where the prohibited ingredient is particularly potent. For example, when this ingredient is mixed with the dough it causes it to leaven. In this case a *min be'mino* mixture is always prohibited while in a *min be'she'eino mino* mixture, if the permissible ingredient outweighs the forbidden ingredient one-hundred parts to one, then the mixture is permissible.

Why is there a difference between these two categories? Why is *min be'mino* treated more stringently?

The *Gemarah* (*Menachot* 22a) brings a debate between the *Tana'im* about whether the forbidden ingredient becomes annulled in a *min be'mino* mixture. If blood is mixed with wine, the sole criterion is whether the blood is recognizable in the mixture. But what if the two ingredients are the same product, for example regular blood and *hekadesh* blood? How does one determine whether one of the bloods absolves the other? *R' Yehudah* maintains that blood never absolves blood and a forbidden product in a *min be'mino* mixture is never absolved. Conversely, the *Chachamim* maintain that one imagines that the regular bloods is water and determines whether or not the forbidden blood would be noticeable is such a mixture.

What is the logic behind *R' Yehudah's* opinion? It appears that according to *R' Yehudah* as soon the forbidden

ingredient is added, the entire mixture is assumed forbidden. One can only annul the prohibited ingredient if the flavour of the permissible ingredient annuls the flavour of the forbidden ingredient. In a *min be'mino* mixture however, both products have the same flavour. Consequently, one is left with a mixture containing a prohibited ingredient.

If so, how does one understand the opinion of the *Chachamim*? They understand that in order for the prohibited ingredient to prohibit the mixture it must have an effect on the overall mixture. Therefore if there is no qualitative (*ta'am*) or quantitative (*rov*) effect then it is annulled on a biblical level.

To summarise, the approach of the *Chachamim* is the reverse of *R' Yehudah*. *R' Yehudah* begins by prohibiting the mixture and only then determines whether the forbidden ingredient is annulled. Conversely, the *Chachamim* begin by permitting the mixture unless there is a substantial reason to prohibit it.

This debate appears in a number of other *Gemarah* (*Avodah Zara* 73b, *Pesachim* 29b) and one finds that when not dealing with *kashrut*, a prohibited ingredient can prohibit a *min be'mino* mixture not matter how small the quantity (see *Avodah Zarah* 66a). This appears to be the case in our *Mishnayot*: if the forbidden ingredient causes the *min be'mino* mixture to leaven, then the entire mixture is prohibited irrespective of the quantity of this forbidden ingredient. Conversely, in *min be'she'eino mino* mixture, one first determines whether the flavour of the prohibited ingredient is recognisable. This difference is logical as in a *min be'she'eino mino* mixture one needs to redefine the status of the mixture – one does this according to its taste. Yet, for a *min be'mino* mixture, this “test” is not feasible.

One should note that the *Halacha* in *kashrut* is that in a *min be'mino* mixture, the forbidden ingredient is absolved if it is in the minority (*Shulchan Aruch* 98). A *min be'mino* mixture is simpler to permit in this area than a *min be'she'eino mino* mixture which, even though is biblical absolved in a majority, the *Chachamim* require the forbidden ingredient to be outweighed sixty parts to one.

Ohad Fixler
[Ed. Trans.]

www.mishnahyomit.com

Revision Questions

ערלה ב' ה' – ג' א'

- What did *Dostai* testify that *Shamai* held? (ב' ה')
- Last week we learnt that if a forbidden product adds a distinct flavour when mixed with an ordinary product it prohibits the entire mixture. When is the rule applied:
 - Only in a stringent manner? (ב' ו')
 - In both a stringent and lenient manner? (ב' ז')
- What is the law regarding dough, into which *chulin* leaven (enough to leaven the dough) got mixed in, followed by *trumah* leaven (enough to leaven the dough)? (ב' ח')
- What is the law regarding dough, into which *chulin* leaven (enough to leaven the dough) got mixed in and caused it to leave, followed by *trumah* leaven (enough to leaven the dough)? (ב' ט')
- Can different spices, each prohibited by the same prohibition, combine to prohibit a mixture? (ב' י')
- Can the same spices, each from prohibited by different prohibitions, combine to prohibit a mixture? (ב' י')
- What is the law regarding dough, into which *chulin* and *trumah* leaven became mixed and leavened the dough, yet each of which on their own were not enough to leaven the dough? (ב' י"א)
- There are two opinions about the previous question. *Yo'ezer Ish HaBira* explained that *Rabban Gamliel HaZaken* held like which of the two opinions? (ב' י"ב)
- What case relating to *tumah ve'tahara* is discussed in the *Mishnah* that is argued in a similar manner to the previous question? (ב' י"ג)
- If leaven that was *trumah* and leaven that was *kil'ei kerem* got mixed with and together leavened the dough, yet each on their own was enough to leaven the dough, can anyone eat from the dough? (ב' י"ד)
- Describe the case involving *tavlin* that is similar to the previous question. (ב' ט"ו)
- Describe the case involving *notar*, *pigul* and *kodshei kodshim* that is similar to the previous question. (ב' ט"ו)
- Who may eat from a mixture contain meat that is *chulin*, *kodshei kalim* and *kodshei kodshim* where there is enough *chulin* to annul the *kodshei kalim* or *kodshei kodshim* but not both? (ב' י"ז)
- What must be done with clothing that has be dyed using dye that was made from *orlah*? (ג' א')

Local Shiurim

Sunday
Between mincha and ma'ariv
Mizrachi Shul
David Bankier

Monday -Thursday
Between mincha & ma'ariv
Mizrachi Shul
Avigdor Einat

Friday & Shabbat
10 minutes before mincha
Mizrachi Shul
David Bankier

Audio Shiurim on-line!

- 613.org/mishnah.html
- www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

STUMPED?

Are you stuck on a *Mishnah*?
Do you have a serious *kashya*?

Why don't you post your question on the *Mishnah Yomit* forum!

www.mishnahyomit.com

To add another mishnah yomit shiur send an email to: mishnahyomit@hotmail.com

Next Week's Mishnahyot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
7 th August ב' אב	8 th August ג' אב	9 th August ד' אב	10 th August ה' אב	11 th August ו' אב	12 th August ז' אב	13 th August ח' אב
Orlah 3: 2-3	Orlah 3: 4-5	Orlah 3: 6-7	Orlah 3: 8-9	Bikurim 1:1-2	Bikurim 1: 3-4	Bikurim 1: 5-6

