



Volume 1. Issue 32.

Reichei Lav Milta

In *Messechet Avodah Zarah* (66b) there is a debate regarding whether a *Yisrael* can smell non-Jewish wine. *Abaye* forbids it as he equates smelling the wine with drinking it; while *Rava* permits it as he maintains that there is no substance in fragrance (*reichei lav milta*). The *Gemarah* attempts to link this debate with the *Mishnah* learnt this week (10:3):

If one removed hot bread from an oven and put it over the mouth of a jar of *trumah* wine - *R' Meir* forbids it [to be eaten by a non-kohen], but *R' Yehudah* permits it. *R' Yosi* permits it if it is wheat [bread], but forbids it if it is barley [bread] as barley is more absorbent.

The *Gemarah* in *Messechet Pesachim* (76a) tries to link another debate to this *Mishnah*. There the *Gemarah* discusses the status of *kosher* meat that has been cooked in an oven with non-kosher meat (*neveilah*). *Rav* maintains that the mixture of the smells cause the meat to become *assur*. *Levi* argues however, that the *kosher* meat remains *kosher* as there is no substance to smells.

Rashi (*Pesachim* 76b) equates the cases brought in *Avodah Zarah* and *Pesachim*. In other words, in both cases, the argument is simply related to the status of smells. *Abaye* and *Rav* hold that the smells are significant, while *Rava* and *Levi* hold that *reich lav milta*. He further explains that whenever there is a debate between *Rava* and *Abaye* the *Halacha* always accords to the opinion of *Rava* (except for the few known exceptions). Consequently, in the above cases the *Halacha* would be like *Rava*, and by extension *Levi*.

The *Ba'alei Tosfot* have two problems with *Rashi's* understanding. Firstly, *Rava* elsewhere does appear to consider smells seriously. In *Pesachim*, *Rava* ruled that fish that was cooked in the same oven as meat

cannot be eaten with food containing milk. Secondly, if the cases in *Avodah Zarah* and *Pesachim* were truly equivalent then they would have been mentioned in the same place.

The *Ba'alei Tosfot* continue to explain that in truth *Abaye* could agree with the opinion of *Levi*. In *Avodah Zarah* *Abaye* prohibits smelling the wine; since the person is directly benefiting from the smell of the wine it is as if he is drinking it. In *Pesachim* however, the smell is entering into another object (the other meat) and *Abaye* there may agree with *Levi* that the smell is not significant. Similarly *Rava* could agree with *Rav* in *Pesachim* yet maintain that there is more room to be lenient in the case in *Avodah Zarah* as the potent smell is somewhat damaging as it enters his body. They therefore conclude that the *Halacha* is like *Rav* in *Pesachim* and *Rava* in *Avodah Zarah*. (See the *Tosfot* for a more complete explanation of how they understand the *Halacha*.)

The *Ramban* (*Avodah Zarah* 76b) agrees with *Rashi* and equates the cases in the two *gemarot* and responds to the first of *Tosfot's* questions. He explains that the reason why *Rava* prohibits eating the fish that was cooked alongside meat with food containing milk is not connected to his position on the status of smells. *Rava's* stringent ruling in this case is a result of a rabbinic decree (a *gezeirah*). He explains that there are two reasons for this stringency. Firstly, unlike the other case above, since anyone can readily smell the meat and milk it would appear as though one is eating meat and milk together. In the other cases, the smell of the prohibited product is not recognised as being prohibited by a third party without them being informed of the true source of the smell. Secondly, in general the *Rabbanim* were stricter with the issue related to meat and milk as they were readily abused.

[NB: this is merely a "snapshot" of the issue. See the cited sources for a more thorough understanding of this topic.]

David Bankier

מסכת תרומות is dedicated to the memory of:

יחזקאל זליג בן ישראל ע"ה

Revision Questions

תרומות י' ג' – י"א ד'

- Explain the debate regarding the status of fresh bread that was placed on the mouth of a barrel of *trumah* wine? (י' ג')
- What is the law regarding bread that was cooked in an oven that had *trumah* cumin burnt in it? (י' ד')
- If *tiltan* is mixed with *chulin* wine, when determining whether it is *noten ta'am*, when does one consider the seed alone, and when does one consider both the seed and the branches? (י' ה')
- How should one treat *tiltan* that is: (י' ו')
 - *Kilei kerem*?
 - *Tevel*?
- In what case would it be permissible for a non-*kohen* to eat *chulin* olives that have been pickled with *trumah* olives? (י' ז')
- Explain the debate regarding a pickled mixture of kosher and non-kosher fish? (י' ח')
- What is the status of brine from non-kosher *chagavim*? (י' ט')
- What is the general rule regard pickled mixtures of *trumah* and *chulin* vegetables? (י' י')
- Which foods do the following *Tana'im* treat stringently and why: (י"א: א')
 - *R' Yosi*?
 - *R' Shimon*?
 - *R' Yehuda*?
 - *R' Yochanan ben Nuri*?
- What is special about eggs? (י"א: ב')
- Which *trumah* product are forbidden to be mixed in fish brine and which are permissible? (י"א: ג')
- Explain the debate regarding the status of fruit juices made from *trumah* fruit? (י"א: ד')
- Can fruit juices become *tameh*? (י"א: ה')
- In general one cannot change the form of *trumah* produce (eg, in to a juice or jam) – what are the two exceptions? (י"א: ו')
- In which other (four) areas of *halacha* are these two things also exceptions? (י"א: ז')
- Can a non-*kohen* get benefit from the stalks of *trumah* dates? (י"א: ח')

Local Shiurim

Sunday
Between mincha and ma'ariv
Mizrachi Shul
David Bankier

Monday -Thursday
Between mincha & ma'ariv
Mizrachi Shul
Ben-zion Hain

9:45pm
Beit Midrash:
Naftali Herc
David Bankier

Friday & Shabbat
10 minutes before mincha
Mizrachi Shul
David Bankier

Audio Shiurim on-line!

- 613.org/mishnah.html
- www.shemayisrael.com/mishna/

SEEKING SPONSORS

Currently 200 printed Mishnah Yomit publications are being sent to shuls around Melbourne and email editions sent to subscribers around the world. This can only continue through the generous support of our sponsors.

If you would like to sponsor a *Messechet*, please email mishnahyomit@hotmail.com or call Doodie on 9528-2235.

To add another mishnah yomit shiur send an email to: mishnahyomit@hotmail.com

Next Week's Mishnahyot...

Sunday	Monday	Tuesday	Wednesday	Thursday	Friday	שבת קודש
15 th May ו' אייר	16 th May ז' אייר	17 th May ח' אייר	18 th May ט' אייר	19 th May י' אייר	20 th May י"א אייר	21 st May י"ב אייר
Trumot 11:5-6	Trumot 11: 7-8	Trumot 11:9-10	Ma'asrot 1: 1-2	Ma'asrot 1: 3-4	Ma'asrot 1: 5-6	Ma'asrot 1: 7-8

